P802.3dj D1.1
Comment Resolution Agenda

Matt Brown, Alphawave, P802.3dj Editor-in-Chief
Gary Nichol, Cisco, Logic Track Lead Editor
Eugene Opsasnick, Broadcom, Logic Editor
Adee Ran, Cisco, Electrical Track Lead Editor
Tom Issenhuth, Huawei, Optical Track Lead Editor

Introduction

❖ This slide package provides the comment agenda for the Draft 1.1 comment resolution.

❖ Comment resolution order is shown in the following slides.

❖ The agenda is subject to change as required.

❖ Comments/topics that appear to be converging but require some offline consensus building might be "parked" and addressed at a later date in this CRG meeting series.

❖ Parallel meetings may be running for the three tracks.
  ➢ Individuals are encouraged to review the topics in each track to understand if there are any conflicts.

❖ Electrical comments/topics are likely going to require the entire 4 days to complete
  ➢ Any spare time on task force days these topics will have priority.

Comment resolution

Approach to comment resolution (same as 802.3df)

The following approach will be utilized for resolving comments…

❖ Review the proposed response
  ➢ Discuss and refine as needed and attempt to close without objection using **direction** straw polls, as necessary.
  ➢ If no more than two objections (including commenter) to proposed response then consider it to be consensus and close comment.
  ➢ If more than two objections then use **decision** straw poll(s) to move forward.
❖ Use of a **direction** straw poll to determine a direction
  ➢ Use the result of the direction straw poll(s) to determine consensus, refine the proposed response, or to craft a decision straw poll.
❖ Use of a **decision** straw poll to make a final decision.
  ➢ The decision straw poll winner is the option that has more than 50% support.
  ➢ Close the comment based on the winner of the decision straw poll(s).
❖ The editorial team may provide presentations as needed to aid in the resolution of comments.
❖ Individuals are reminded to review "IEEE SA Balloting and Comment Resolution Process Guidelines"
https://standards.ieee.org/wp-content/uploads/import/governance/revcom/guidelines.pdf

IEEE P802.3dj Task Force, May 2024

8

Source: https://www.ieee802.org/3/dj/public/24_05/brown_3dj_01_2405.pdf

We are here...

587 comments received
27 withdrawn
141 in bucket #1 closed
53 in bucket #2 closed
508 total closed so far
79 left to resolve on the floor

Clause	E	G	T	ER	GR	TR	Open	Closed	Total
00	1	0	0	0	0	0	0	1	1
1	0	0	4	0	0	1	0	5	5
116	1	0	8	0	0	2	2	9	11
119	0	0	2	0	0	0	0	2	2
120F	0	0	0	0	0	1	0	1	1
120G	0	0	0	0	0	1	0	1	1
169	0	0	2	1	0	2	0	5	5
171	1	0	3	0	0	2	0	6	6
172	1	0	1	0	0	1	0	3	3
174	0	0	2	0	0	2	0	4	4
174A	1	0	8	0	0	1	4	6	10
175	0	0	3	0	0	0	0	3	3
176	1	0	28	0	0	1	1	29	30
176A	0	0	35	0	0	22	21	36	57
176B	0	0	1	0	0	0	0	1	1
176D	0	0	10	0	0	10	1	19	20
176E	4	0	13	1	0	36	16	38	54
177	0	0	8	0	0	3	1	10	11
177A	1	0	0	0	0	0	0	1	1
178	6	0	11	0	0	34	7	44	51
178A	0	0	2	0	0	7	0	9	9
179	5	0	17	0	0	37	20	39	59
179A	0	0	2	7	0	14	0	23	23
179B	0	0	0	3	0	10	2	11	13
179C	0	0	0	0	0	1	0	1	1
179D	0	0	2	1	0	1	2	2	4
180	2	0	9	1	0	22	0	34	34
181	0	0	2	0	0	13	0	15	15
182	0	0	10	0	0	23	1	32	33
183	0	0	6	0	0	24	0	30	30
184	2	0	20	0	0	4	0	26	26
184A	0	0	0	0	0	1	0	1	1
185	0	0	5	0	0	9	1	13	14
186	7	0	15	0	0	4	0	26	26
186A	0	0	1	0	0	0	0	1	1
187	0	0	8	0	0	0	0	8	8
30	2	0	0	0	0	3	0	5	5
45	3	0	1	1	0	2	0	7	7
90A	0	0	1	0	0	0	0	1	1
Total	38	0	240	15	0	294	79	508	587

Comment resolution sequence

Meeting # and Date	Topic
~~Thursday Sep 5 (online)~~	~~Online Task force~~ ~~Motion to adopt bucket #1 and bucket #2.~~ ~~May view presentation(s) and/or close a few comments~~
~~Monday Sep 16~~	~~Morning: Task force. Possible motion to adopt bucket #3. Cross-clause (not optical) comments, electrical comments~~ ~~Afternoon: Task force. Remaining cross-clause comments (until done), electrical comments~~ ~~Evening: Electrical track only (if needed)~~
~~Tuesday Sep 17~~	~~Morning/afternoon: Electrical track, logic track, optical track~~ ~~Evening: Electrical track, logic track, optical track (if needed)~~
~~Wednesday Sep 18~~	~~Electrical track, logic track, optical track~~
Thursday Sep 19	Common (task force) track Remaining comments. Prioritized appropriately.

Common (task force) #1

Topic	Clause/Annex	Comments
ILT: Message format	176A	336**, 335**
ILT: Coefficients and presets	176A	184**
ILT: Training patterns	176A	[495*, 76], 218**
ILT: Precoding	176A, 176, 177	509*, [~~212, 213, 214, 215, 216**, 217~~]
ILT: Timing	176A	61**, 505
ILT: Extender	176A	492*, 493
ILT: LT types	176A	[209*, 77, 132]
ILT: State diagrams	176A	64**, bruckman_01
ILT: per interface state diagram	176A	508
ILT: General	176A	46, 480, 481, 482, [483, 484]
AUI architecture and ILT signaling	176D/E, 176, 177	[516**, 358*, 357*, 478*, 224, 225, brown_03]

Note that comment resolution order may be readjusted.
Cyan highlight: pulled from bucket #1
**: High priority, *: Medium priority

Legend: [##,##,##] = related comments, ## = pivot comment, [##,##,author_nn] = related presentation

Common (task force) #2

Topic	Clause/Annex	Comments
Reopen and fix???	181, 183	104, 112
Annex reorganization	176A/C/D/E	~~511~~
Signaling rate	Many	~~118~~, ~~367~~, ~~brown_04~~
Error ratio, block error ratio method	174A	~~324~~, ~~325~~, ~~326~~, ~~healey_02~~
Error ratio, block error ratio vs BER	174A, 182	318, 314, ~~mi_01~~
Error ratio, BERadded values	Many	[~~137~~, ~~143~~, ~~361, 166, 164, 165, 316, brown_04~~]
Error ratio, BERadded context	Many	~~141~~, ~~152~~
Error ratio, target value	184/185	550, kota_02 slide 3
Error ratio, organization	174A	134
Error ratio, nomenclature	Many	[473,133]
Note that comment resolution order may be readjusted. Cyan highlight: pulled from bucket #1		

Legend: [##,##,##] = related comments, ## = pivot comment, [##,##,author_nn] = related presentation

Electrical track #1

Topic	178	179	176D	176E	178A	179ABCD
Reference Rx FFE, eta0 (10)	377, 2, 545	1, 546	37, 35, 142, 547		567	
ERL (10)	[526, 542], [540, 531, 541], 543		539	[423, 150]		179B: 444
MLSD (8)	[4, 529, 530], 363 (CC)	[3, 535, 536]			[327 healey_01]	179A: 208
Frequency masks (9)	ran_0.. [37.. 527], 3..8, 1..9, 380	387, 388.. .3				179B: 445
A_v, A_ne, A_fe vs. R_d (9)	..160, 528	..1, 534	16, 416, 538	..., 573		
Tx diff PtP, vf, dvf (7)	523, simms_01	524, 563	139	[416 ran_02] 146, 570		

Note that comment resolution order may be readjusted.
Cyan highlight: pulled from bucket #1

Legend: [##,##,##] or same color = related comments, ## = pivot comment, [##,##,author_nn] = related presentation, **Bold** = editorial slides, *italic* = technically complete area

Electrical track #2

Topic	179	176D	176E	179ABCD
ILdd budget, reach (11)	[~~460~~, ~~461~~, ~~189~~, ~~mellitz_01~~], *190, kareti_01*	~~33~~	[**115** ~~lusted_04~~, ~~ghiasi_03~~, ~~kareti_02~~]	179A: [~~519~~, ~~521~~, ~~522~~], ~~432~~, ~~518~~
Host channel model and parameters (7)	~~395~~, [~~537~~ ~~lim_01~~], *193*		**422**, *418*	179A: ~~566~~, ~~195~~ ~~diminico_01~~
ILdd equations and figures (4)			[~~420, 148~~, ~~196 ran_03~~]	~~194~~
MTF (2)				179A: ~~520~~ 179B: ~~126~~
Note that comment resolution order may be readjusted Cyan highlight: pulled from bucket				

DONE

Legend: [##,##,##] or same color = related comments, ## = pivot comment, [##,##,author_nn] = related presentation, **Bold** = editorial slides, *italic* = technically complete area

Electrical track #3

Topic	178	179	176E	178A	179ABCD
Rx test details (6)	[~~374~~, ~~372~~]	~~332~~, ~~390~~	~~158~~		
Rx test multi-lane (3)	~~334~~ (CC)		[~~155~~, ~~157~~]		
C2M link diagram (2)			[~~412~~, ~~515 ran_03~~, ~~ghiasi_04~~]		
DC common mode (2)			~~147~~, ~~417~~		
S-parameter frequency range (4)				[~~425~~, ~~548~~]	179B: ~~439~~, ~~446~~
Test fixture spec parameters (3)					179B: ~~442~~, ~~443~~, ~~447~~
Note that comment resolution order may be readjusted					

DONE

Legend: [##,##,##] or same color = related comments, ## = pivot comment, [##,##,author_nn] = related presentation, **Bold** = editorial slides, *italic* = technically complete area

Electrical track #4

Topic	178	179	176D	176E	178A	179ABCD
Tx FFE preset (2)		~~333 healey_03~~ (CC)		~~569~~ (CC)		
COM (1)					~~188~~	
Rx test details (1)				154		
Test fixture delay (4)	~~532~~	[~~199~~, 200, 201]		198		
AC coupling (9)	[533, 119, 120, 121]	[122, 123, 125]		[114, 413]		
CA types, nomenclature (6)		394, [130, 131], ~~191~~				179B: 127, 128
Tx AC CM (3)		385, 386		575		
Rx test methodology (4)		[389, 391, 392] (CC)		153		
Tx test setup (1)				572		
Tx jitter (10)	174, 368 (CC)	383 (CC), 175 calvin_01, 181, zivny_01	176	[177, 178], [179 180]		
VEC (9)		564, 577, 561 calvin_04, 565, 578, dawe_01		[322 Calvin_02], [116, 117], 571		
Note that comment resolution order may be readjusted. Cyan highlight: pulled from bucket #1						

Legend: [##,##,##] or same color = related comments, <u>##</u> = pivot comment, [##,##,author_nn] = related presentation, **Bold** = editorial slides, *italic* = technically complete area

Optical track #1

Topic	Clause/Annex	Comments
TQM	185, 187:	[~~259~~, ~~260~~], issenhuth_01
Tx optical parameters - coherent	185: 187:	[~~353~~, ~~552~~, ~~554~~, ~~555~~], ~~553~~, maniloff_01, kota_02 ~~463~~, ~~464~~
Rx optical parameters - coherent	185: 187:	[~~354~~, ~~551~~, ~~558~~], ~~556~~, ~~557~~, maniloff_01, kota_02 ~~465~~
Optical channel - coherent	187:	~~467~~, ~~468~~
Power budget - coherent	18	
Chromatic dispersion	180: 181: 182: 183: 180, 183	~~22~~, ~~24~~, johnson_01 ~~28~~, ~~29~~, johnson_01 ~~23~~, johnson_01 [~~18~~, ~~19~~, ~~93~~], ~~20~~, ~~21~~, johnson_01, liu_01 [~~266~~, ~~267~~], johnson_01 (some comments missed in this agenda slide but now resolved: ~~25,26,27~~)
Channel insertion loss	181:	~~39~~
Tx optical parameters - IMDD	180: 182: 183:	~~312~~ ~~86~~, ~~168~~, [~~320~~, ~~321~~] [~~89~~, ~~171~~], ~~172~~
Note that comment resolution order may be readjusted.		

Legend: [##,##,##] = related comments, ## = pivot comment, [##,##,author_nn] = related presentation

Optical track #2

Topic	Clause/Annex	Comments
Rx optical parameters - IMDD	180: 182: 183:	[~~311~~, ~~261~~], ~~403~~, ~~404~~ ~~169~~, ~~262~~ ~~173~~
Power budget - IMDD	180: 183:	~~66~~ ~~319~~
Optical channel - IMDD	183:	~~94~~
Tap weights (TDECQ)	180: 181: 182: 183:	[~~202~~, ~~98~~], welch_01 (68,79, 83, 96 may re-open on Wednesday) [~~203~~, ~~99~~], welch_01 [~~204~~, ~~83~~], welch_01 [~~205~~, ~~96~~], welch_01
TDECQ	180: 183: 182, 183: 181, 183	~~167~~ [~~170~~, ~~88~~, ~~90~~, ~~91~~, ~~92~~] [~~313~~, ~~315~~], mi_02 [~~80~~, ~~84~~, 97]
TDECQ test setup	180, 181, 182, 183:	[~~67~~, ~~78~~, ~~82~~, ~~95~~], ghaisi_01
Test patterns	182:	~~317~~
Note that comment resolution order may be readjusted.		

Legend: [##,##,##] = related comments, <u>##</u> = pivot comment, [##,##,author_nn] = related presentation

Optical track #3

Topic	Clause/Annex	Comments
Tx compliance	182:	~~25, 27~~
Signal detect	180:	~~400~~
RIN	180:	~~407, 408, 409~~
ILT	180, 181, 182, 183:	[~~98~~, ~~103, 105, 106, 111, 113~~], issenhuth_02 [~~100~~, ~~101,102, 108, 109, 110~~], issenhuth_02
Test points	180:	~~399~~, issenhuth_02
MDI	180, 182:	[~~341, 342~~], dambrosia_02, issenhuth_02
Jitter	180:	~~402~~ ~~562~~
Pulled from bucket #1		~~99, 107~~
Note that comment resolution order may be adjusted.		
Cyan highlight: pulled from bucket #1		

Legend: [##,##,##] = related comments, ## = pivot comment, [##,##,author_nn] = related presentation

Logic track #1

Topic	Clause/Annex	Comments
~~Time sync~~ ~~- Introductory clauses~~ ~~- Path data delay variables~~ ~~- Physical layer clause tables~~	~~174,169,116~~ ~~175,176,177,184,186~~ ~~178,179,180,181,182,183,185,187~~	[~~268~~, ~~269~~, ~~270~~, ~~271~~, ~~272~~, ~~273~~ ~~274~~, ~~275~~, ~~276~~, ~~277~~, ~~278~~, ~~279~~, ~~281~~, ~~282~~, ~~283~~, ~~284~~, ~~285~~, ~~286~~ ~~287~~, ~~288~~, ~~289~~, ~~290~~, ~~291~~, ~~292~~, ~~294~~]
~~PTP accuracy (ER1)~~	~~171,186~~	[~~254~~, ~~255~~, ~~256~~, ~~301~~, ~~302~~, ~~303~~, ~~356~~, ~~457~~, ~~458~~, **huber_02**]
~~PMA service interface~~	~~176~~	[~~13~~, ~~17~~, ~~228~~, ~~229~~, ~~235~~, ~~236~~, ~~237~~, ~~238~~, ~~585~~]
~~Features, Symbol lock~~	17	[~~14~~, ~~16~~], ~~182~~, [~~296~~, ~~297~~]
~~Deskew~~	~~177~~	[~~159~~, 5]
~~IBSF~~	~~177~~	[~~359~~, ~~469~~, ~~470~~, ~~471~~, **he_01a**]
~~Delay, Pilot sequence~~		, **kota_01a**
~~Pseudocode~~	~~184~~	[~~243~~, ~~244~~, ~~245~~, ~~246~~, ~~247~~, ~~249~~, ~~250~~, ~~252~~, **huber_01b**]
~~Convolutional interleaver~~	~~184~~	~~50~~
~~Coherent PMD interface~~	~~184,186 (affects 185, 187)~~	[~~251~~, ~~257~~, ~~514~~]
~~Payload Type value~~	~~186~~	~~253~~
~~Summary of functions~~	~~186~~	~~56~~
Note that comment resolution order may be readjusted. Cyan highlight: pulled from bucket #1		

Legend: [##,##,##] = related comments, ## = pivot comment, [##,##,author_nn] = related presentation

Buckets

Bucket #1 (low-controversy T/TR) comments are listed in the following comment report:

https://www.ieee802.org/3/dj/comments/D1p1/8023dj_D1p1_comments_proposed_bucket1.pdf

The following comments were pulled from bucket #1:

14, 16, 46, 50, 56, 99, 107, 116, 117, 153, 175, 179, 180, 181, 182, 188, 193, 215, 224, 225, 253, 295, 565, 571, 572, 578 (26 comments total)

Bucket #2 (E/ER) comments are listed in the following comment report:

https://www.ieee802.org/3/dj/comments/D1p1/8023dj_D1p1_comments_proposed_bucket2.pdf

No pulls from Bucket #2 will be possible.

The proposed responses for bucket #1 and #2 (with the exception of the pulled comments listed above) were adopted by Motion #1 on 5 September 2024.

Withdrawn

The following comments were withdrawn (so far):
46, 62, 63, 72, 73, 74, 75, 81, 85, 87, 124, 186, 212, 213, 214, 215, 309, 453, 475, 476, 497, 512, 579, 580, 581, 582, 583