P802.3dj D1.2
Comment Resolution Agenda

Matt Brown, Alphawave, P802.3dj Editor-in-Chief
Gary Nichol, Cisco, Logic Track Lead Editor
Eugene Opsasnick, Broadcom, Logic Editor
Adee Ran, Cisco, Electrical Track Lead Editor
Tom Issenhuth, Huawei, Optical Track Lead Editor

Introduction

❖ This slide package provides the comment agenda for the Draft 1.2 comment resolution.

❖ Comment resolution order is shown in the following slides.

❖ The agenda is subject to change as required.

❖ Comments/topics that appear to be converging but require some offline consensus building might be "parked" and addressed at a later date in this CRG meeting series.

❖ Parallel meetings may be running for the three tracks.
  ➢ Individuals are encouraged to review the topics in each track to understand if there are any conflicts.

Comment resolution

Approach to comment resolution (same as 802.3df)

The following approach will be utilized for resolving comments…

❖ Review the proposed response
  ➢ Discuss and refine as needed and attempt to close without objection using **direction** straw polls, as necessary.
  ➢ If no more than two objections (including commenter) to proposed response then consider it to be consensus and close comment.
  ➢ If more than two objections then use **decision** straw poll(s) to move forward.
❖ Use of a **direction** straw poll to determine a direction
  ➢ Use the result of the direction straw poll(s) to determine consensus, refine the proposed response, or to craft a decision straw poll.
❖ Use of a **decision** straw poll to make a final decision.
  ➢ The decision straw poll winner is the option that has more than 50% support.
  ➢ Close the comment based on the winner of the decision straw poll(s).
❖ The editorial team may provide presentations as needed to aid in the resolution of comments.
❖ Individuals are reminded to review "IEEE SA Balloting and Comment Resolution Process Guidelines"
  https://standards.ieee.org/wp-content/uploads/import/governance/revcom/guidelines.pdf

Source: https://www.ieee802.org/3/dj/public/24_05/brown_3dj_01_2405.pdf

We are here...

436 comments received
2 withdrawn
116 in bucket #1
58 in bucket #2
260 left to resolve on the floor

Clause	E	G	T	ER	GR	TR	Open	Closed	Total
1	0	0	1	0	0	0	1	0	1
116	2	0	0	0	0	1	3	0	3
119	0	0	1	0	0	0	1	0	1
169	0	0	0	0	0	1	1	0	1
170	0	0	0	1	0	0	1	0	1
171	1	0	7	0	0	3	11	0	11
172	0	0	0	0	0	1	1	0	1
174	1	0	0	0	0	2	3	0	3
174A	0	0	3	2	0	5	10	0	10
175	2	0	1	0	0	0	3	0	3
176	4	0	8	0	0	12	22	2	24
176C	3	0	4	0	0	2	9	0	9
176D	2	0	11	2	0	19	34	0	34
177	6	0	11	0	0	3	20	0	20
178	0	0	5	0	0	13	18	0	18
178A	0	0	2	0	0	4	6	0	6
178B	1	0	5	0	0	5	11	0	11
179	1	0	12	1	0	19	33	0	33
179A	0	0	3	2	0	2	7	0	7
179B	0	0	2	0	0	2	4	0	4
179C	5	0	10	0	0	1	16	0	16
179D	0	0	1	0	0	0	1	0	1
180	7	0	19	1	0	5	32	0	32
180A	1	0	6	0	0	1	8	0	8
181	3	0	16	0	0	3	22	0	22
182	1	0	22	0	0	9	32	0	32
183	2	0	27	0	0	8	37	0	37
184	1	0	5	0	0	6	12	0	12
185	1	0	14	0	0	4	19	0	19
185A	2	0	1	0	0	0	3	0	3
186	0	0	12	2	0	11	25	0	25
187	0	0	10	0	0	5	15	0	15
45	1	0	9	0	0	3	13	0	13
Total	47	0	228	11	0	150	434	2	436

Comment resolution sequence

Meeting # and Date	Topic
Monday 11 Nov	Task Force: opening business, electrical track comments (approximately starting at 4PM and 6PM) bucket motion, COM discussion, electrical track comments
Tuesday 12 Nov	Morning: Task Force: common track comments (common #1), optical comments Afternoon: Electrical Track, Optical Track
Wednesday 13 Nov	Electrical Track, Optical Track, Logic Track
Thursday 14 Nov	Morning: Task Force: possibly a 2nd bucket motion common track comments (comment #2) remaining comments (time permitting) closing business
Tuesday 19 Nov (contingent)	TBD, if needed
Wednesday 20 Nov (contingent)	TBD, if needed
Thursday 21 Nov (contingent)	TBD, if needed

Common #1 (task force)

Topic	Clause/Annex	Comments
Error ratio budget	174A	152
Error ratio, pictures	180, 181, 182, 183	[433, 429, 431, 435, mi_01]
Error ratio, ber_added	180, 181, 182, 183	[434, 430, 432, 436, mi_01]
TDECQ block error ratio	180, 181, 182, 183	[259, 256, 258, 257, ghiasi_02] (discuss symbol error ratio)
SER+TDECQ	182, 183	[103, 104, 105, 106, 107, 108, 109, 110, 111, 112, welch_01] (discuss symbol error ratio)
Note that comment resolution order may be readjusted. Cyan highlight: pulled from bucket #1		

Legend: [##,##,##] = related comments, ## = pivot comment, [##,##,author_nn] = related presentation

Common #2 (task force)

Topic	Clause/Annex	Comments
Error ratio budget	174A	81
Error ratio, PCS	174A	[210, 79, 132, 150, 151, healey_03]
PMA counters	176	135
ILT: Extender	178B	160
ILT: PRBS	178B	414, 415, dawe_02
ILT: Retimer	178B	127
Note that comment resolution order may be readjusted. Cyan highlight: pulled from bucket #1		

Legend: [##,##,##] = related comments, ## = pivot comment, [##,##,author_nn] = related presentation

Electrical track #1

Topic	178	179	176C	176D	179ABCD
Test fixtures (5)	**65** **189 190** *192 193*				
ERL (5)	**66** 191	101			361 89
Channel insertion loss (3)	**67**				87 *309*
CA specifications (2)		100 102			
Tx spec methodology (VEC/EH) (9)		[***404** 400 411*] ***401 405 416***		[*315 316*]	***308***
Jitter (4)	[64 ran_06]	[213 ran_06]		[211 212 ran_06]	
Output voltage range (22)	[*345* 346 simms_01]	[*347 348 349 350 351 403* simms_01]	352	[82 ran_05] [*353 354 355 356 357 358 359 360 409 413* simms_01] [*313 314*]	
AC common mode (3)		[*93* 94 ran_05]		*399*	
Signaling rate ppm (1)	163				
single-ended voltage tolerance (1)				156	
Note that comment resolution order may be readjusted. Cyan highlight: pulled from bucket #1					

Legend: [##,##,##] or same color = related comments, ## = pivot comment, [##,##,author_nn] = related presentation, **Bold** = editorial slides, *italic* = technically complete area

Electrical track #2

Topic	178	179	176C	176D	178A
Reference host channel (2)	[92 ran_02]			[83 ran_02]	
ITOL (8)	[207 healey_02] *149*	[97 ran_03] *208* [209 healey_02] [*98* ran_04] 99	155		
Rx amplitude tolerance (2)		406 *96*			
COM MLSD (1)					407
Signaling rate ppm (1)	163				
single-ended voltage tolerance (1)				156	
SNDR (1)		[206 healey_01]			
Note that comment resolution order may be readjusted. Cyan highlight: pulled from bucket #1					

Legend: [##,##,##] or same color = related comments, <u>##</u> = pivot comment, [##,##,author_nn] = related presentation, **Bold** = editorial slides, *italic* = technically complete area

Electrical track #3

Topic	179	176D	178A	179ABCD
MDI illustrations (10)				[330 331 333 334 335 336 339 340 342 343 kocsis_01]
CA types (1)				162
Module reference model (1)		317		
Reference receiver (1)		*318*		
Tx equalization (1)		*408*		
JTOL (4)	*91*	[*418* 296] *320*		
S-parameters frequency range (1)			*194*	
Methodology annex (1)			*90*	
Note that comment resolution order may be readjusted. Cyan highlight: pulled from bucket #1				

Legend: [##,##,##] or same color = related comments, ## = pivot comment, [##,##,author_nn] = related presentation, **Bold** = editorial slides, *italic* = technically complete area

Optical track #1

Topic	Clause/Annex	Comments
SER and TDECQ	IMDD	103, 104, 105, 106, 107, 108, 109, 110, 111, 112, welch_01
TDECQ	IMDD	256, 257, 258, 259, ghiasi_02
Optical parameters	IMDD	71, 227, 230, 233, 236, [228, 145], 73, 231, 234, 304, johnson_01
	Coherent	[238, 240], 243, [427, 241], [428, 244, 245], kota_02, maniloff_02
Optical channel	IMDD	299, 305, 126, 125, 215, 23
	Coherent	23, 215, [216, 218], 217
Power budget	IMDD	328, 262, 307, 297, 148
TQM	Coherent	242, [246, 219], [143, 142, 144], [393, 392], [395, 394], 391, maniloff_01
Annex 180A		188, 312, 182, 183, 184, [185, 186], dambrosia_02
Note that comment resolution order may be readjusted.		

Legend: [##,##,##] = related comments, ## = pivot comment, [##,##,author_nn] = related presentation

Optical track #2

Topic	Clause/Annex	Comments
Breakout	IMDD	169
Lane assignments	IMDD	128, [129, 75]
PMA label	IMDD	[254, 255]
Signal ok	IMDD	[250, 251, 252, 253]
Tap weights	IMDD	[265, 266, 267], [268, 269, 270, 271, 272, 273, 274, 275, 276, 277, 278, 279, 280, 281, 282, 283, 284, 285, 286, 287, 288, 289, 290, 291, 292, 293, 294], 295, ghiasi_01
TDECQ	IMDD	[260, 261, 263, 264], [397,146], 306, 396, 147, 298, rodes_01, dudek_01, calvin_01, ghiasi_03
Test pattern	Coherent	200, 181
Jitter	IMDD	402
Note that comment resolution order may be readjusted. *Note: There are additional TDECQ comments that will first be discussed first in the common (task force) track before being addressed in the optical track and those comments are listed on Address in Common (Task Force) and Optical track slide*		

Legend: [##,##,##] = related comments, ## = pivot comment, [##,##,author_nn] = related presentation

Logic track #1

Topic	Clause/Annex	Comments
Time sync	171, 175, 176, 177, 184, 186	[364, 365, 366, 367, 368, 369, 370]
PTP accuracy	171,186	12, 167, 382
PMA variables	176	[57, 247], 375
Delay constraints	177	165
Inner FEC deskew	177	[54, 371, he_01]
Inner FEC sync	177	363, 389
Datapath details	184	[422, 423, 424, 425, 426, kota_01]
Sublayer interfaces	184,186	[19, 201, 202]
AM acronym	186	10
Error marking	186	17
Note that comment resolution order may be readjusted. Cyan highlight: pulled from bucket #1		

Legend: [##,##,##] = related comments, ## = pivot comment, [##,##,author_nn] = related presentation

Buckets

Bucket #1 (low-controversy T/TR) comments are listed in the following comment report:

https://www.ieee802.org/3/dj/comments/D1p2/8023dj_D1p2_comments_proposed_bucket1.pdf

The following comments were pulled from bucket #1:

<mark><TBD></mark>

Bucket #2 (E/ER) comments are listed in the following comment report:

https://www.ieee802.org/3/dj/comments/D1p2/8023dj_D1p2_comments_proposed_bucket2.pdf

No pulls from Bucket #2 will be possible.

Withdrawn

The following comments were withdrawn (so far):
58, 138