

P802.3dj D1.2

Comment Resolution Agenda

Matt Brown, Alphawave, P802.3dj Editor-in-Chief

Gary Nichol, Cisco, Logic Track Lead Editor

Eugene Opsasnick, Broadcom, Logic Editor

Adee Ran, Cisco, Electrical Track Lead Editor

Tom Issenhuth, Huawei, Optical Track Lead Editor

Introduction

- ❖ This slide package provides the comment agenda for the Draft 1.2 comment resolution.
- ❖ Comment resolution order is shown in the following slides.
- ❖ The agenda is subject to change as required.
- ❖ Comments/topics that appear to be converging but require some offline consensus building might be “parked” and addressed at a later date in this CRG meeting series.
- ❖ Parallel meetings may be running for the three tracks.
 - Individuals are encouraged to review the topics in each track to understand if there are any conflicts.

Comment resolution

Approach to comment resolution (same as 802.3df)

The following approach will be utilized for resolving comments...

- ❖ Review the proposed response
 - Discuss and refine as needed and attempt to close without objection using **direction** straw polls, as necessary.
 - If no more than two objections (including commenter) to proposed response then consider it to be consensus and close comment.
 - If more than two objections then use **decision** straw poll(s) to move forward.
- ❖ Use of a **direction** straw poll to determine a direction
 - Use the result of the direction straw poll(s) to determine consensus, refine the proposed response, or to craft a decision straw poll.
- ❖ Use of a **decision** straw poll to make a final decision.
 - The decision straw poll winner is the option that has more than 50% support.
 - Close the comment based on the winner of the decision straw poll(s).
- ❖ The editorial team may provide presentations as needed to aid in the resolution of comments.
- ❖ Individuals are reminded to review “IEEE SA Balloting and Comment Resolution Process Guidelines”
<https://standards.ieee.org/wp-content/uploads/import/governance/revcom/guidelines.pdf>

IEEE P802.3dj Task Force, May 2024

8

Source: https://www.ieee802.org/3/dj/public/24_05/brown_3dj_01_2405.pdf

We are here...

436 comments received

5 withdrawn

94 in bucket #1

57 in bucket #2

265 closed on the floor

421 closed total

15 left to resolve on the floor

Clause	E	G	T	ER	GR	TR	Open	Closed	Total
1	0	0	1	0	0	0	0	1	1
116	2	0	0	0	0	1	0	3	3
119	0	0	1	0	0	0	0	1	1
169	0	0	0	0	0	1	0	1	1
170	0	0	0	1	0	0	0	1	1
171	1	0	7	0	0	3	0	11	11
172	0	0	0	0	0	1	0	1	1
174	1	0	0	0	0	2	0	3	3
174A	0	0	3	2	0	5	6	4	10
175	2	0	1	0	0	0	0	3	3
176	4	0	8	0	0	12	2	22	24
176C	3	0	4	0	0	2	0	9	9
176D	2	0	11	2	0	19	0	34	34
177	6	0	11	0	0	3	0	20	20
178	0	0	5	0	0	13	1	17	18
178A	0	0	2	0	0	4	0	6	6
178B	1	0	5	0	0	5	5	6	11
179	1	0	12	1	0	19	0	33	33
179A	0	0	3	2	0	2	0	7	7
179B	0	0	2	0	0	2	0	4	4
179C	5	0	10	0	0	1	0	16	16
179D	0	0	1	0	0	0	0	1	1
180	7	0	19	1	0	5	0	32	32
180A	1	0	6	0	0	1	0	8	8
181	3	0	16	0	0	3	0	22	22
182	1	0	22	0	0	9	1	31	32
183	2	0	27	0	0	8	0	37	37
184	1	0	5	0	0	6	0	12	12
185	0	0	15	0	0	4	0	19	19
185A	2	0	1	0	0	0	0	3	3
186	0	0	12	2	0	11	0	25	25
187	0	0	10	0	0	5	0	15	15
45	1	0	9	0	0	3	0	13	13
Total	46	0	229	11	0	150	15	421	436

Comment resolution sequence

Meeting # and Date	Topic
Monday 11 Nov	Task Force all day opening business, electrical track comments (starting between 4PM and 6PM, approximate) bucket motion, COM open source discussion (lusted_03), jitter discussion (calvin_01), electrical track comments
Tuesday 12 Nov	Morning: Task Force: common track comments (common/optical #1), optical track comments Afternoon: Electrical Track, Optical Track
Wednesday 13 Nov	Electrical Track, Optical Track, Logic Track
Thursday 14 Nov	Morning: Task Force: possibly a 2nd bucket motion common track comments (common #2) remaining comments (time permitting) closing business
Tuesday 19 Nov (contingent)	TBD, if needed
Wednesday 20 Nov (contingent)	TBD, if needed
Thursday 21 Nov (contingent)	TBD, if needed

Common/Optical #1 (task force)

Done

Topic	Clause/Annex	Comments
Error ratio budget	174A	452
Error ratio, pictures	180, 181, 182, 183	[433, 429, 431, 435, mi_01]
Error ratio, ber_added	180, 181, 182, 183	[434, 430, 432, 436, mi_01]
TDECQ block method	180, 181, 182, 183	[259, 256, 258, 257, ghiasi_01] (common: discuss symbol error ratio)
		Presentations: redes_01, welch_01, dudek_01, ghiasi_03 (order might be adjusted)
SER+TDECQ	182, 183	[403, 404, 405, 406, 407, 408, 409, 410, 411, 412, welch_01] (common: discuss symbol error ratio)
TDECQ	IMDD	[260, 261, 263, 264], [397, 446], 306, 396, 447, 298, redes_01, dudek_01, ghiasi_03, calvin_01

Note that comment resolution order may be readjusted.

Cyan highlight: pulled from bucket #1

Common #2 (task force)

Topic	Clause/Annex	Comments
Jitter	IMDD	402
Error ratio budget	174A	81
Error ratio wording	Many	131
Error ratio, PCS	174A	[210, 79, 132, 150, 151, healey_03]
PMA counters	176	135
ILT: Extender	178B	160
ILT: PRBS	178B	414, 415, dawe_02
ILT: Retimer	178B	127
ILT: General	178B	159
ILT: Precoding	176, 178B	49
<p><i>Note that comment resolution order may be readjusted.</i></p> <p>Cyan highlight: pulled from bucket #1</p>		

Legend: [##,##,##] = related comments, ## = pivot comment, [##,##,author_nn] = related presentation

Electrical track #1

Done

Topic	178	179	176C	176D	179ABCD
Test fixtures (5)	65 189 190 192 193				
ERL (5)	[66 191 mellitz_01]	[101 mellitz_01]			361 89
Channel insertion loss (3)	67				
CA specifications (2)		100 102			
Signaling rate ppm (1)	463				
Tx spec methodology (VEC/EH) (9)		[404 400 411] 401 405 416 dawe_01		[315 316]	308
Jitter (4)	[64 ran_06]	[213 ran_06]		[211 212 ran_06]	
Output voltage range (23)	[345 346 simms_01]	[347 348 349 350 351 403 simms_01]	352	[82 ran_05] [353 354 355 356 357 358 359 360 409 410 413 simms_01] [313 314]	
AC common mode (3)		[93 94 ran_05]		399	
single-ended voltage tolerance (1)				456	

Note that comment resolution order may be readjusted.

Cyan highlight: pulled from bucket #1

Legend: [##,##,##] or same color = related comments, ## = pivot comment, [##,##,author_nn] = related presentation, **Bold** = editorial slides, *italic* = technically complete area

Electrical track #2

Done

Topic	178	179	176C	176D	178A
Reference host channel (2)	[92 ran_02]			[83 ran_02]	
ITOL (8)	[207 healey_02] 149	[97 ran_03] 208 [209 healey_02] [98 ran_04] 99	155	158	
Rx amplitude tolerance (2)		406-96			
COM MLSD (1)					407
Signaling rate ppm (1)	463				
SNDR (1)		[206 healey_01]			
<p><i>Note that comment resolution order may be readjusted.</i></p> <p>Cyan highlight: pulled from bucket #1</p>					

Legend: [##,##,##] or same color = related comments, ## = pivot comment, [##,##,author_nn] = related presentation, **Bold** = editorial slides, *italic* = technically complete area

Electrical track #3

Done

Topic	179	176D	178A	179ABCD
MDI illustrations (10)				[330 331 333 334 335 336 339 340 342 343 koesis_04]
CA types (1)				462
Module reference model (1)		317		
Reference receiver (1)		318		
Tx equalization (1)		408		
JTOL (4)	94	[418 296] 320		
S-parameters frequency range (1)			194	
Methodology annex (1)			90	
Channel insertion loss				87-309
Bucket pulls 62 (CI 178)	95	157-412		
<i>Note that comment resolution order may be readjusted.</i>				
Cyan highlight: pulled from bucket #1				

Legend: [##,##,##] or same color = related comments, ## = pivot comment, [##,##,author_nn] = related presentation, **Bold** = editorial slides, *italic* = technically complete area

Optical track #1

Done

Topic	Clause/Annex	Comments
TDECQ Tap weights	IMDD	[265 , 266, 267], [268 , 269, 270, 271, 272, 273, 274, 275, 276, 277, 278, 279, 280, 281, 282, 283, 284, 285, 286, 287, 288, 289, 290, 291, 292, 293, 294, ghiasi_01], 295
Optical parameters	IMDD	71, 227, 230, 233, 236, [228 , 145], 73, 231, 234, 304, johnson_01
Optical channel	IMDD	209, 305, 426, 425, 214
Power budget	IMDD	328, 262, 307, 297, 148
Breakout	IMDD	169
Annex 180A	180A	[188, dambrosia_02], 312, 182, 183, 184, [185 , 186]
Lane assignments	IMDD	128, [129 , 75]
PMA label	IMDD	[254 , 255]

Note that comment resolution order may be readjusted.

Note: There are additional TDECQ comments that will first be discussed first in the common (task force) track before being addressed in the optical track and those comments are listed on Address in Common (Task Force) and Optical track slide

Legend: [##,##,##] = related comments, ## = pivot comment, [##,##,author_nn] = related presentation

Optical track #2

Done

Topic	Clause/Annex	Comments
Signal ok	IMDD	[250, 251, 252, 253]
Lane labeling	IMDD	232, 237
Test pattern	IMDD	139
ORL	IMDD	124
TQM	Coherent	242, [246, 219, maniloff_01a] , [143, 142, 144] , [393, 392] , [395, 394] , 391
Optical parameters	Coherent	[238, 240] , 243, [427, 244] , [428, 244, 245] , kota_02, maniloff_02
Optical channel	Coherent	23, 215, [216, 218] , 217
Test pattern	Coherent	200, 181
ADC signal labeling	Coherent	[176, 21, 178, 180, 22, 421]
<p><i>Note that comment resolution order may be readjusted.</i></p> <p>Cyan highlight: pulled from bucket #1</p> <p>Orange highlight: reclassified as technical and removed from bucket #2</p>		

Legend: [##,##,##] = related comments, ## = pivot comment, [##,##,author_nn] = related presentation

Logic track #1

Done

Topic	Clause/Annex	Comments
MDIO	45	42
Time syne	171, 175, 176, 177, 184, 186	[364, 365, 366, 367, 368, 369, 370]
PTP accuracy	171, 186	12, 167, 382
PMA variables	176	[57, 247], 375
Delay constraints	177	165
Inner FEC deskew	177	[54, 371, he_01], 2
Inner FEC syne	177	363, 389
State machine description	177	388
Datapath details	184	[422, 423, 424, 425, 426, kota_01]
AM acronym	186	10
Error marking	186	17
General	186	20, 168, 417, 419
ADC Signal Naming	184, 186	[19, 201, 202]
PMA counters	176	135 (discussion only, preview for common track)
<i>Note that comment resolution order may be readjusted.</i>		
Cyan highlight: pulled from bucket #1		

Legend: [##,##,##] = related comments, ## = pivot comment, [##,##,author_nn] = related presentation

Buckets

Done

Bucket #1 (low-controversy T/TR) comments are listed in the following comment report:

https://www.ieee802.org/3/dj/comments/D1p2/8023dj_D1p2_comments_proposed_bucket1.pdf

The following comments were pulled from bucket #1:

2, 20, 21, 22, 42, 62, 95, 124, 139, 157, 158, 159, 168, 176, 178, 180, 232, 237, 388, 412, 417, 419

Bucket #2 (E/ER) comments are listed in the following comment report:

https://www.ieee802.org/3/dj/comments/D1p2/8023dj_D1p2_comments_proposed_bucket2.pdf

No pulls from Bucket #2 will be possible.

However, #421 was redesignated as T rather than E and will be addressed on the floor.

Bucket comment proposed responses adopted by motion on Monday.

Withdrawn

Done

The following comments were withdrawn (so far):
58, 91, 90, 96, 138