# P802.3dj D1.3
# Comment Resolution Agenda

Matt Brown, Alphawave, P802.3dj Editor-in-Chief
Gary Nichol, Cisco, Logic Track Lead Editor
Eugene Opsasnick, Broadcom, Logic Editor
Adee Ran, Cisco, Electrical Track Lead Editor
Tom Issenhuth, Huawei, Optical Track Lead Editor

# Introduction

- This slide package provides the comment agenda for the Draft 1.3 comment resolution.
- Comment resolution order is shown in the following slides.
- The agenda is subject to change as required.
- Comments/topics that appear to be converging but require some offline consensus building might be “parked” and addressed at a later date in this CRG meeting series.
- Parallel meetings may be running for the three tracks.
  - Individuals are encouraged to review the topics in each track to understand if there are any conflicts.

# Comment resolution

## Approach to comment resolution (same as 802.3df)

The following approach will be utilized for resolving comments…

- Review the proposed response
  - Discuss and refine as needed and attempt to close without objection using **direction** straw polls, as necessary.
  - If no more than two objections (including commenter) to proposed response then consider it to be consensus and close comment.
  - If more than two objections then use **decision** straw poll(s) to move forward.
- Use of a **direction** straw poll to determine a direction
  - Use the result of the direction straw poll(s) to determine consensus, refine the proposed response, or to craft a decision straw poll.
- Use of a **decision** straw poll to make a final decision.
  - The decision straw poll winner is the option that has more than 50% support.
  - Close the comment based on the winner of the decision straw poll(s).
- The editorial team may provide presentations as needed to aid in the resolution of comments.
- Individuals are reminded to review "IEEE SA Balloting and Comment Resolution Process Guidelines"
  https://standards.ieee.org/wp-content/uploads/import/governance/revcom/guidelines.pdf



Source: https://www.ieee802.org/3/dj/public/24_05/brown_3dj_01_2405.pdf

# We are here...

560 comments received
24 withdrawn
251 in bucket #1
11 bucket #1 pull requests
0 closed on the floor
24 closed total
296 to resolve on the floor

| Clause | E | G | T | ER | GR | TR | Open | Closed | Total |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| 00 | 1 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 2 | 1 | 3 |
| 1 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 2 |
| 116 | 4 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 4 | 0 | 4 |
| 119 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 1 |
| 120B | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 1 | 0 | 1 |
| 120F | 1 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 1 | 2 |
| 169 | 0 | 0 | 3 | 0 | 0 | 2 | 5 | 0 | 5 |
| 171 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 6 | 6 | 0 | 6 |
| 174 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 2 | 0 | 2 |
| 174A | 2 | 0 | 15 | 2 | 0 | 17 | 35 | 1 | 36 |
| 175 | 2 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 3 | 0 | 3 |
| 176 | 10 | 0 | 16 | 0 | 0 | 6 | 31 | 1 | 32 |
| 176B | 1 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 2 | 3 | 0 | 3 |
| 176C | 2 | 0 | 32 | 0 | 0 | 7 | 41 | 0 | 41 |
| 176D | 0 | 0 | 6 | 0 | 0 | 19 | 25 | 0 | 25 |
| 177 | 10 | 0 | 23 | 14 | 0 | 32 | 78 | 1 | 79 |
| 178 | 1 | 0 | 4 | 0 | 0 | 6 | 11 | 0 | 11 |
| 178A | 1 | 0 | 17 | 0 | 0 | 4 | 11 | 11 | 22 |
| 178B | 3 | 0 | 3 | 0 | 0 | 13 | 19 | 0 | 19 |
| 179 | 3 | 0 | 10 | 1 | 0 | 20 | 34 | 0 | 34 |
| 179A | 0 | 0 | 2 | 0 | 0 | 5 | 6 | 1 | 7 |
| 179B | 2 | 0 | 20 | 2 | 0 | 16 | 38 | 2 | 40 |
| 179C | 1 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 1 |
| 179D | 0 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 1 |
| 180 | 3 | 0 | 4 | 7 | 0 | 21 | 34 | 1 | 35 |
| 180A | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 2 | 2 | 0 | 2 |
| 181 | 1 | 0 | 1 | 4 | 0 | 10 | 16 | 0 | 16 |
| 182 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 2 | 0 | 13 | 14 | 2 | 16 |
| 183 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 9 | 10 | 0 | 10 |
| 184 | 0 | 0 | 5 | 0 | 0 | 8 | 13 | 0 | 13 |
| 185 | 3 | 0 | 12 | 1 | 0 | 4 | 20 | 0 | 20 |
| 185A | 0 | 0 | 2 | 0 | 0 | 5 | 7 | 0 | 7 |
| 186 | 2 | 0 | 9 | 0 | 0 | 3 | 13 | 1 | 14 |
| 187 | 4 | 0 | 12 | 3 | 0 | 15 | 34 | 0 | 34 |
| 45 | 0 | 0 | 2 | 1 | 0 | 1 | 4 | 0 | 4 |
| 73 | 2 | 0 | 1 | 1 | 0 | 4 | 8 | 0 | 8 |
| 73A | 1 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 1 |
| Total | 61 | 0 | 206 | 39 | 0 | 254 | 536 | 24 | 560 |

# Comment resolution sequence

| Meeting Date | Topic |
|---|---|
| Monday 20 Jan | Task Force all day<br>opening business, common track comments<br>bucket pulls due by noon; motion after PM break (start of PM2)<br>electrical track comments (time permitting) |
| Tuesday 21 Jan | Electrical Track, Optical Track, Logic Track<br>If necessary (at chair's discretion), tracks may run until 8PM |
| Wednesday 22 Jan | Electrical Track, Optical Track, Logic Track<br>AM2: joint optical/logic track |
| Thursday 23 Jan | Task Force all day<br>liaisons discussion and motion to approve<br>possibly a 2nd bucket motion<br>common track comments<br>remaining comments (time permitting)<br>closing business |

# Common #1 (task force, Monday)

| Topic | Clause/Annex | Comments |
|---|---|---|
| Management interface | Many | 273 |
| Reset variables | 45, 177, 184, 178, 179 | [2, 88, 89, 90, brown_03] |
| PMA delay | 176 | [451, 22, 222, 223, 224, 225, 226, shrikhande_01] |
| Optical: Signal ok | 180, 181, 182, 183 | [227, 228, 229, 230] |
| Optical: RR FFE taps | 180, 181, 182, 183 | [186, 422, 187, 188, 189, 172, 174, 175, 176, 248, 249, 250, 251] |
| Optical: TDECQ general, AUI stress | 180, 181, 182, 183 | [240, 241, 242, 243], ghiasi_01 |
| Optical: TDECQ general, block method | 180, 181, 182, 183 | [244, 245, 246, 247], ghiasi_03 |
| Optical: SER and Q_t | 180, 181, 182 | [171, 173], 346 |
| ILT: clock switch | 178B | 124, brown_03 |
| ILT: introduction | 178B | 542, 544 |
| ILT: State diagram | 178B | [144, brown_03], 356 |
| AN/ILT: time-out | 73, 178B | 131, 184, 543, 545, slavick_01 |
| Electrical/Logic: AN DME swing | 73 | 547, simms_02 |
| Note that comment resolution order will likely be readjusted.<br>Cyan highlight: pulled from bucket #1 | | |

Legend: [##,##,##] = related comments, ## = pivot comment, [##,##,author_nn] = related presentation

# Common #2 (task force, Thursday)

| Topic | Clause/Annex | Comments |
|---|---|---|
| ER1 error ratio | 174A | 77, 78, 194 |
| Error ratio budget | 174A | 151, 435 |
| KER | 174A | 150,  he_3dj_01 |
| KER for PHY | 174A | 376, 377 |
| KER for xMII Extender | 174A | 130 |
| KER stress | 174A | 167, brown_03 |
| KER, all-lanes | 174A | 166, 384 |
| KER, per-lane | 174A | 180, 183 |
| PHY TX KER | 174A, 178-183 | 8, brown_04 |
| Note that comment resolution order will likely be readjusted.<br>Cyan highlight: pulled from bucket #1 | | |

Legend: [##,##,##] = related comments, ## = pivot comment, [##,##,author_nn] = related presentation

# Electrical #1 (55)

| Topic | 178 | 179 | 176C | 176D | 178B |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| Steady-state voltage in ILT (5) | **137** | **138** | **139** | **140** | **136** |
| ILT presets and initialization (8) | | **457, 513, 514, 515, 516 simms_01** | | **425** | **125, 515** |
| Interference tolerance (13) | [557 dudek_01] | 308, 386 | 445, [446 200 552 dudek_01] 447 | [353 259 208], [354 209] | |
| R_peak (6) | | [303 185 ran_02] | | [350 351 ran_02], 206, 207 | |
| AC coupling (4) | 255, 256, 257 | 258 | | | |
| Jitter (6) | | [211 rysin_01] [306 calvin_01] 541 | | [219 220 rysin_01] 540 | |
| Amplitude tolerance (4) | **426** | 307 | | 352, 396 | |
| Jitter tolerance (4) | | | 253 | 260, [261 262] | |
| SNDR (2) | | 538 | | **423** | |
| AC common-mode (1) | | | **440** | | |
| Cable assembly reach (1) | | 310 | | | |
| Differential pk-pk (1) | | | | 539 | |
| *Note that comment resolution order may be readjusted.*<br>*Cyan highlight: pulled from bucket #1* | | | | | |

Legend: [##,##,##] or same color = related comments, ## = pivot comment, [##,##,author_nn] = related presentation, **Bold** = editorial slides, *italic* = technically complete area

# Electrical #2 (48)

| Topic | 179 | 176C | 176D | 178A | 179B |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| C2C TBDs (12) | | [548, 195, 438], [550 197], [554, 202], 203, 559, 254, [555, 204] heck_01 | | | |
| C2C RL masks (5) | | [439 196 549], [443 199] heck_01 | | | |
| C2C ERL (7) | | [205, 450, 556], 442, [198, 441, 551] heck_01 | | | |
| C2C ITOL (4) | | 252, [553 201 448 heck_01] | | | |
| C2C ILdd mask (1) | | 449 | | | |
| COM general (7) | 533 | | | 371, 372, 383, 536, 537, 511 | |
| Partial channel model (8) | [393 466 kocsis_01], [391 392] | | 389, 390 | [387 388] | |
| Frequency range (4) | | | | [47 mellitz_02], 535 | 529 526 |
| *Note that comment resolution order may be readjusted.*<br>*Cyan highlight: pulled from bucket #1* | | | | | |

Legend: [##,##,##] or same color = related comments, ## = pivot comment, [##,##,author_nn] = related presentation, **Bold** = editorial slides, *italic* = technically complete area

# Electrical #3 (30)

| Topic | 179B |
|---|---|
| Test fixtures reference ILdd (5) | [357 358 379 211 ran_04], 528 |
| Test fixtures TBDs (5) | 210 [214 460 463 49 kocsis_02] |
| Test fixtures FOM_ILD (4) | [459 50 51 212 kocsis_02 mellitz_01] |
| Test fixtures RLdc (1) | [464 kocsis_02] |
| Test fixtures ICN (14) | [217 52 53 54 55 56 215 454 461 462 465 522 kocsis_02 mellitz_01 mammenga_01], 523, 524 |
| Test fixtures COM (1) | [48 mellitz_01] |
| Bucket pulls | 525, 526 |
| | |
| | |
| | |
| | |
| | |
| | |
| | |
| *Note that comment resolution order may be readjusted.*<br>*Cyan highlight: pulled from bucket #1* | |

Legend: [##,##,##] or same color = related comments, ## = pivot comment, [##,##,author_nn] = related presentation, **Bold** = editorial slides, *italic* = technically complete area

# Optical/Logic track #1

| Topic | Clause/Annex | Comments |
|---|---|---|
| 800GBASE-LR1 decoding | 184 | 347 |
| PMD service interface and PAM4 decoding | 177, 184 (182, 183, 185) | 275, brown_03 |
| Alignment for interleaving | 184 | [472, 409, kota_3dj_01_2501] |
| Optical/Logic: xBASE-R Inner FEC test patterns | 177 (maybe 176, 182, 183)<br>174A | [148, 9], [10, 128] he_3dj_01 |
| Optical/Logic: 800GBASE-LR1 test patterns | 184 | 149, he_3dj_01 |
| | | |
| | | |
| | | |
| *Note that comment resolution order may be readjusted.*<br>*Cyan highlight: pulled from bucket #1* | | |

Legend: [##,##,##] = related comments, ## = pivot comment, [##,##,author_nn] = related presentation

# Optical track #1

| Topic | Clause/Annex | Comments |
|---|---|---|
| IMDD Tx optical parameter | 181 | 342 |
| PMD block diagram | 180 | 316, 317 |
| Test pattern | 182 | 345 |
| MDI | 180,180A | [57, 326, 517],<br>8023dj_D1p3_comment_57_attachment |
| Measurement method | 180, 181, 182, 183 | [236, 237, 238, 239], ghiasi_01 |
| Power budget | 180<br>181<br>183 | [231, 233], 320<br>232<br>[234, 235], ghiasi_02 |
| Fiber characteristics | 180<br>187 | 324<br>61 |
| Channel requirements | 180<br>187 | [323, 332], 334, 333<br>[62, 80] |
| *Note that comment resolution order may be readjusted.*<br>*Cyan highlight: pulled from bucket #1* | | |

Legend: [##,##,##] = related comments, ## = pivot comment, [##,##,author_nn] = related presentation

# Optical track #2

| Topic | Clause/Annex | Comments |
|---|---|---|
| Coherent Tx optical parameter | 185<br>187 | 397, [398, 190], 474, maniloff_02, kota_02<br>[58, 59], 64, 65, 66, 67, 68, 69 |
| Coherent Rx optical parameter | 185<br>187 | 399, 400, maniloff_02<br>60, 70, 79, 104 |
| Coherent Tx/Rx optical parameter | 187 | 179 |
| Link budget | 185 | 178 |
| Signal detect | 187 | 103 |
| Primitive | 185, 187 | [99, 100] |
| Test pattern | 187 | 81, 105 |
| ETCC | 185<br>187<br>185A | 102<br>63, 193<br>177, 359, [408, 82], 475, 521, maniloff_01, kota_02 |
| *Note that comment resolution order may be readjusted.*<br>*Cyan highlight: pulled from bucket #1* | | |

Legend: [##,##,##] = related comments, ## = pivot comment, [##,##,author_nn] = related presentation

# Logic track #1

| Topic | Clause/Annex | Comments |
|---|---|---|
| ER1 architecture | 186 | [36, 3], 39, 218, huber_3dj_01_2501 |
| ER1 delay | 186 | [73, 23] |
| ER1 errors | 186 | 191 |
| ER1 frame alignment | 186 | 158 |
| Lane grouping | 184 | [156, bruckman_3dj_01_2501] |
| PMA / InnerFEC  skew | 176, 177 | [452, 26, 27] |
| Counter description format | 176 | [*11*, 394] (note: *11 is in the bucket)* |
| Symbol demux | 176 *(may also apply to 177)* | [420, nicholl_3dj_02_2501] |
| Management variables | 177 | 300 |

*Note that comment resolution order may be readjusted.*
*Cyan highlight: pulled from bucket #1*
Legend: [##,##,##] = related comments, ## = pivot comment, [##,##,author_nn] = related presentation

# Logic track #2 (Wed. AM1)

| Topic | Clause/Annex | Comments |
|---|---|---|
| PMD service interface and PAM4 decoding | 177, 184 (182, 183, 185) | 274, 295, 347, 487 *(Adee)* |
| State Diagrams | 177 | [297, 508], 494, 503 *(Adee)* |
| BCH counters | 184 | [32, 348], 349, 473 (*Adee*) |

*Note that comment resolution order may be readjusted.*
*Cyan highlight: pulled from bucket #1*
Legend: [##,##,##] = related comments, ## = pivot comment, [##,##,author_nn] = related presentation

# Buckets

Bucket #1 comments are listed in the following comment report:
https://www.ieee802.org/3/dj/comments/D1p3/8023dj_D1p3_comments_proposed_clause_bucket1.pdf

The following comments were pulled (so far) from bucket #1:
297, 317, 349, 377, 431, 473, 487, 494, 503, 508, 525, 526

# Withdrawn

The following comments were withdrawn (so far):
20, 109, 110, 192, 269, 278, 302, 319, 360, 361, 362, 363, 364, 365, 366, 367, 368, 369, 370, 385, 429, 453, 455, 458