P802.3dj D1.3
Comment Resolution Agenda

Matt Brown, Alphawave, P802.3dj Editor-in-Chief
Gary Nichol, Cisco, Logic Track Lead Editor
Eugene Opsasnick, Broadcom, Logic Editor
Adee Ran, Cisco, Electrical Track Lead Editor
Tom Issenhuth, Huawei, Optical Track Lead Editor

Introduction

❖ This slide package provides the comment agenda for the Draft 1.3 comment resolution.

❖ Comment resolution order is shown in the following slides.

❖ The agenda is subject to change as required.

❖ Comments/topics that appear to be converging but require some offline consensus building might be "parked" and addressed at a later date in this CRG meeting series.

❖ Parallel meetings may be running for the three tracks.

➢ Individuals are encouraged to review the topics in each track to understand if there are any conflicts.

Comment resolution

Approach to comment resolution (same as 802.3df)

The following approach will be utilized for resolving comments…

- ❖ Review the proposed response
  - ➢ Discuss and refine as needed and attempt to close without objection using **direction** straw polls, as necessary.
  - ➢ If no more than two objections (including commenter) to proposed response then consider it to be consensus and close comment.
  - ➢ If more than two objections then use **decision** straw poll(s) to move forward.
- ❖ Use of a **direction** straw poll to determine a direction
  - ➢ Use the result of the direction straw poll(s) to determine consensus, refine the proposed response, or to craft a decision straw poll.
- ❖ Use of a **decision** straw poll to make a final decision.
  - ➢ The decision straw poll winner is the option that has more than 50% support.
  - ➢ Close the comment based on the winner of the decision straw poll(s).
- ❖ The editorial team may provide presentations as needed to aid in the resolution of comments.
- ❖ Individuals are reminded to review "IEEE SA Balloting and Comment Resolution Process Guidelines"
  https://standards.ieee.org/wp-content/uploads/import/governance/revcom/guidelines.pdf

Source: https://www.ieee802.org/3/dj/public/24_05/brown_3dj_01_2405.pdf

We are here...

560 comments received
24 withdrawn
251 in bucket #1
11 bucket #1 pull requests
0 closed on the floor
24 closed total
296 to resolve on the floor

Clause	E	G	T	ER	GR	TR	Open	Closed	Total
00	1	0	1	0	0	1	2	1	3
1	1	0	0	0	0	1	1	1	2
116	4	0	0	0	0	0	4	0	4
119	0	0	1	0	0	0	1	0	1
120B	0	0	0	0	0	1	1	0	1
120F	1	0	0	1	0	0	1	1	2
169	0	0	3	0	0	2	5	0	5
171	0	0	0	0	0	6	6	0	6
174	0	0	1	0	0	1	2	0	2
174A	2	0	15	2	0	17	35	1	36
175	2	0	1	0	0	0	3	0	3
176	10	0	16	0	0	6	31	1	32
176B	1	0	0	0	0	2	3	0	3
176C	2	0	32	0	0	7	41	0	41
176D	0	0	6	0	0	19	25	0	25
177	10	0	23	14	0	32	78	1	79
178	1	0	4	0	0	6	11	0	11
178A	1	0	17	0	0	4	11	11	22
178B	3	0	3	0	0	13	19	0	19
179	3	0	10	1	0	20	34	0	34
179A	0	0	2	0	0	5	6	1	7
179B	2	0	20	2	0	16	38	2	40
179C	1	0	0	0	0	0	1	0	1
179D	0	0	1	0	0	0	1	0	1
180	3	0	4	7	0	21	34	1	35
180A	0	0	0	0	0	2	2	0	2
181	1	0	1	4	0	10	16	0	16
182	0	0	1	2	0	13	14	2	16
183	0	0	1	0	0	9	10	0	10
184	0	0	5	0	0	8	13	0	13
185	3	0	12	1	0	4	20	0	20
185A	0	0	2	0	0	5	7	0	7
186	2	0	9	0	0	3	13	1	14
187	4	0	12	3	0	15	34	0	34
45	0	0	2	1	0	1	4	0	4
73	2	0	1	1	0	4	8	0	8
73A	1	0	0	0	0	0	1	0	1
Total	61	0	206	39	0	254	536	24	560

Comment resolution sequence

Meeting Date	Topic
Monday 20 Jan	Task Force all day opening business, common track comments bucket pulls due by noon; motion after PM break (start of PM2) electrical track comments (time permitting)
Tuesday 21 Jan	Electrical Track, Optical Track, Logic Track If necessary (at chair's discretion), tracks may run until 8PM
Wednesday 22 Jan	Electrical Track, Optical Track, Logic Track
Thursday 23 Jan	Task Force all day liaisons discussion and motion to approve possibly a 2nd bucket motion common track comments remaining comments (time permitting) closing business

Common #1 (task force)

Topic	Clause/Annex	Comments
Management interface	Many	273
Reset variables	45, 177, 184, 178, 179	[2, 88, 89, 90, brown_04]
PMA delay	176 ++	[451, 22, 222, 223, 224, 225, 226, shrikhande_3dj_01_2501]
Optical: Signal ok	180, 181, 182, 183	[227, 228, 229, 230]
Optical: RR FFE taps	180 181 182 183	172, 186, 251, 422 174, 187, 250 175, 189, 249 176, 188, 248
Optical: TDECQ general	180 181 182 183	240, 244 241, 245 242, 246 243, 247
Optical: SER	180, 181, 182	171, 173, 346x
PMD service interface and PAM4 decoding	177, 184 (182, 183, 185)	275, 347
Optical/Logic: xBASE-R Inner FEC test patterns	177 (maybe 176, 182, 183) 174A	9, 10, 148 128, 150
Optical/Logic: 800GBASE-LR1 test patterns	184	149
Electrical/Logic: AN DME swing	73	547, simms_02
Electrical/Logic: AN/ILT time-out	73, 178B	131, 184, 543, 545, slavick_xx
Note that comment resolution order will likely be readjusted. Cyan highlight: pulled from bucket #1		

Legend: [##,##,##] = related comments, ## = pivot comment, [##,##,author_nn] = related presentation

Common #1 (task force)

Topic	Clause/Annex	Comments
ILT: interfaces	178B	124
ILT: introduction	178B	542, 544
ILT: State diagram	178B	144, 356
ER1 error ratio	174A	77, 78, 194
Error ratio budget	174A	151, 435
KER for PHY	174A	[376, 377, brown_03]
KER for xMII Extender	174A	130
KER stress	174A	167
KER, all-lanes	174A	166, 384
KER, per-lane	174A	180, 183
PHY TX KER	174A, 178-183	8, brown_04
Note that comment resolution order will likely be readjusted. Cyan highlight: pulled from bucket #1		

Legend: [##,##,##] = related comments, ## = pivot comment, [##,##,author_nn] = related presentation

Electrical #1 (55)

Topic	178	179	176C	176D	178B
Steady-state voltage in ILT (5)	**137**	<u>138</u>	**139**	**140**	**136**
ILT presets and initialization (8)		**457, 513, 514, 515, 516**		**425**	**125, 515**
AC coupling (4)	255, 256, 257	258			
Jitter (6)		[211 rysin_01] [306 calvin_01] 541		[219 220 rysin_01] 540	
Amplitude tolerance (4)	**426**	307		352, 396	
Jitter tolerance (4)			253	260, [261 262]	
Interference tolerance (13)	[557 dudek_01]	308, 386	445, [<u>446</u> 200 552 dudek_01] 447	[<u>353</u> 259 208], [<u>354 209</u>]	
SNDR (2)		538		**423**	
R_peak (6)		[<u>303</u> 185 ran_02]		[350 351 ran_02], 206, 207	
AC common-mode (1)			**440**		
Cable assembly reach (1)		310			
Differential pk-pk (1)				539	
Note that comment resolution order may be readjusted. <mark>*Cyan highlight*</mark>*: pulled from bucket #1*					

Legend: [##,##,##] or same color = related comments, <u>##</u> = pivot comment, [##,##,author_nn] = related presentation, **Bold** = editorial slides, *italic* = technically complete area

Electrical #2 (48)

Topic	179	176C	176D	178A	179B
COM general (7)	533			371, 372, 383, 536, 537, 511	
Partial channel model (8)	[393 466 kocsis_01], [391 392]		389, 390	[387 388]	
Frequency range (4)				[47 mellitz_02], 535	529 526
C2C ERL (7)		[205, 450, 556], 442, [198, 441, 551] heck_01			
C2C RL masks (5)		[439 196 549], [443 199] heck_01			
C2C TBDs (12)		[548, 195, 438], [550 197], [554, 202], 203, 559, 254, [555, 204] heck_01			
C2C ILdd (1)		449			
C2C ITOL (4)		252, [553 201 448 heck_01]			
Note that comment resolution order may be readjusted. *Cyan highlight: pulled from bucket #1*					

Legend: [##,##,##] or same color = related comments, ## = pivot comment, [##,##,author_nn] = related presentation, **Bold** = editorial slides, *italic* = technically complete area

Electrical #3 (30)

Topic	179B
Test fixtures reference ILdd (5)	[357 358 379 211 ran_04], 528
Test fixtures TBDs (5)	210 [214 460 463 49 kocsis_02]
Test fixtures FOM_ILD (4)	[459 50 51 212 kocsis_02 mellitz_01]
Test fixtures RLdc (1)	[464 kocsis_02]
Test fixtures ICN (14)	[217 52 53 54 55 56 215 454 461 462 465 522 kocsis_02 mellitz_01 mammenga_01], 523, 524
Test fixtures COM (1)	[48 mellitz_01]
Bucket pulls	525, 526
Note that comment resolution order may be readjusted.	
Cyan highlight: pulled from bucket #1	

Legend: [##,##,##] or same color = related comments, ## = pivot comment, [##,##,author_nn] = related presentation, **Bold** = editorial slides, *italic* = technically complete area

Optical track #1

<div style="background: green; border: 2px solid red;">Not started</div>

Topic	Clause/Annex	Comments
IMDD Tx optical parameter	181	342
PMD block diagram	180	316, 317
Test pattern	182	345
MDI	180,180A	[57, 326, 517], 8023dj_D1p3_comment_57_attachment
Measurement method	180, 181, 182, 183	[236, 237, 238, 239], ghiasi_01
Power budget	180 181 183	[231, 233], 320 232 [234, 235], ghiasi_02
Fiber characteristics	180 187	324 61
Channel requirements	180 187	[323, 332], 334, 333 [62, 80]
Note that comment resolution order may be readjusted. *Cyan highlight: pulled from bucket #1*		

Legend: [##,##,##] = related comments, ## = pivot comment, [##,##,author_nn] = related presentation

Optical track #2

Not started

Topic	Clause/Annex	Comments
Coherent Tx optical parameter	185 187	397, [398, 190], 474, maniloff_02, kota_02 [58, 59], 64, 65, 66, 67, 68, 69
Coherent Rx optical parameter	185 187	399, 400, maniloff_02 60, 70, 79, 104
Coherent Tx/Rx optical parameter	187	179
Link budget	185	178
Signal detect	187	103
Primitive	185, 187	[99, 100]
Test pattern	187	81, 105
ETCC	185 187 185A	102 63, 193 177, 359, [408, 82], 475, 521, maniloff_01, kota_02
Note that comment resolution order may be readjusted. *Cyan highlight: pulled from bucket #1*		

Legend: [##,##,##] = related comments, ## = pivot comment, [##,##,author_nn] = related presentation

Logic track #1

Topic	Clause/Annex	Comments
ER1 architecture	186	[36, 3], 39, 218, huber_3dj_01_2501
ER1 delay	186	[73, 23]
ER1 errors	186	191
ER1 frame alignment	186	158
Alignment for interleaving	184	[472, 409, kota_3dj_01_2501]
Lane grouping	184	[156, bruckman_3dj_01_2501]
BCH CW bin counters	184	[32, 348]
PMA / InnerFEC skew	176, 177	[452, 26, 27]
Counter description format	176	[11, 394] (note: *11 is in the bucket*)
Symbol demux	176 *(may also apply to 177)*	[420, nicholl_3dj_02_2501]
Management variables	177	300
PMD service interface and PAM4 decoding	177, 184 (182, 183, 185)	274, 295, 347 (Adee)
Bucket pulls	297, 508, 349, 473, 487, 494, 503	

Note that comment resolution order may be readjusted.
Cyan highlight: pulled from bucket #1
Legend: [##,##,##] = related comments, ## = pivot comment, [##,##,author_nn] = related presentation

Buckets

Bucket #1 comments are listed in the following comment report:
https://www.ieee802.org/3/dj/comments/D1p3/8023dj_D1p3_comments_proposed_clause_bucket1.pdf

The following comments were pulled (so far) from bucket #1:
297, 317, 349, 377, 473, 487, 494, 503, 508, 525, 526

Withdrawn

The following comments were withdrawn (so far):
20, 109, 110, 192, 269, 278, 302, 319, 360, 361, 362, 363, 364, 365, 366, 367, 368,369, 370, 385, 429, 453, 455, 458