P802.3dj D1.3
Comment Resolution Agenda

Matt Brown, Alphawave, P802.3dj Editor-in-Chief
Gary Nichol, Cisco, Logic Track Lead Editor
Eugene Opsasnick, Broadcom, Logic Editor
Adee Ran, Cisco, Electrical Track Lead Editor
Tom Issenhuth, Huawei, Optical Track Lead Editor

Introduction

- This slide package provides the comment agenda for the Draft 1.3 comment resolution.
- Comment resolution order is shown in the following slides.
- The agenda is subject to change as required.
- Comments/topics that appear to be converging but require some offline consensus building might be “parked” and addressed at a later date in this CRG meeting series.
- Parallel meetings may be running for the three tracks.
  - Individuals are encouraged to review the topics in each track to understand if there are any conflicts.

Comment resolution

Approach to comment resolution (same as 802.3df)

The following approach will be utilized for resolving comments…

- Review the proposed response
  - Discuss and refine as needed and attempt to close without objection using **direction** straw polls, as necessary.
  - If no more than two objections (including commenter) to proposed response then consider it to be consensus and close comment.
  - If more than two objections then use **decision** straw poll(s) to move forward.
- Use of a **direction** straw poll to determine a direction
  - Use the result of the direction straw poll(s) to determine consensus, refine the proposed response, or to craft a decision straw poll.
- Use of a **decision** straw poll to make a final decision.
  - The decision straw poll winner is the option that has more than 50% support.
  - Close the comment based on the winner of the decision straw poll(s).
- The editorial team may provide presentations as needed to aid in the resolution of comments.
- Individuals are reminded to review "IEEE SA Balloting and Comment Resolution Process Guidelines"
  https://standards.ieee.org/wp-content/uploads/import/governance/revcom/guidelines.pdf

Source: https://www.ieee802.org/3/dj/public/24_05/brown_3dj_01_2405.pdf

We are here...

560 comments received
25 withdrawn
251 in bucket #1
67 bucket #1 pull requests
0 closed on the floor
233 closed
327 to resolve on the floor

Clause	E	G	T	ER	GR	TR	Open	Closed	Total
00	1	0	1	0	0	1	0	3	3
1	1	0	0	0	0	1	1	1	2
116	4	0	0	0	0	0	0	4	4
119	0	0	1	0	0	0	0	1	1
120B	0	0	0	0	0	1	1	0	1
120F	1	0	0	1	0	0	0	2	2
169	0	0	3	0	0	2	1	4	5
171	0	0	0	0	0	6	4	2	6
174	0	0	1	0	0	1	1	1	2
174A	2	0	15	2	0	17	22	14	36
175	2	0	1	0	0	0	0	3	3
176	10	0	16	0	0	6	10	22	32
176B	1	0	0	0	0	2	1	2	3
176C	2	0	32	0	0	7	39	2	41
176D	0	0	6	0	0	19	25	0	25
177	10	0	23	14	0	32	19	60	79
178	1	0	4	0	0	6	8	3	11
178A	1	0	17	0	0	4	10	12	22
178B	3	0	3	0	0	13	9	10	19
179	3	0	10	1	0	20	32	2	34
179A	0	0	2	0	0	5	3	4	7
179B	2	0	20	2	0	16	36	4	40
179C	1	0	0	0	0	0	0	1	1
179D	0	0	1	0	0	0	0	1	1
180	3	0	4	7	0	21	20	15	35
180A	0	0	0	0	0	2	2	0	2
181	1	0	1	4	0	10	6	10	16
182	0	0	1	2	0	13	7	9	16
183	0	0	1	0	0	9	5	5	10
184	0	0	5	0	0	8	10	3	13
185	3	0	12	1	0	4	13	7	20
185A	0	0	2	0	0	5	6	1	7
186	2	0	9	0	0	3	7	7	14
187	4	0	12	3	0	15	25	9	34
45	0	0	2	1	0	1	0	4	4
73	2	0	1	1	0	4	4	4	8
73A	1	0	0	0	0	0	0	1	1
Total	61	0	206	39	0	254	327	233	560

Comment resolution sequence

Meeting Date	Topic
~~Monday 20 Jan~~	~~Task Force all day~~ ~~opening business, common track comments~~ ~~bucket pulls due by noon; motion after PM break (start of PM2)~~ ~~electrical track comments (time permitting)~~
~~Tuesday 21 Jan~~	~~Electrical Track, Optical Track, Logic Track~~ ~~If necessary (at chair's discretion), tracks may run until 8PM~~
Wednesday 22 Jan	Electrical Track, Optical Track, Logic Track AM2: joint optical/logic track
Thursday 23 Jan	Task Force all day liaisons discussion and motion to approve ~~possibly a 2nd bucket motion (decided no 2nd bucket)~~ common track comments remaining comments (time permitting) closing business

Common #1 (task force, Monday)

DONE

Topic	Clause/Annex	Comments
Management interface	Many	~~273~~
Reset variables	45, 177, 184, 178, 179	[~~2~~, ~~88~~, ~~89~~, ~~90~~, ~~brown_03~~]
PMA (other other sublayers) delay	176	[~~451~~, ~~22~~, ~~222~~, ~~223~~, ~~224~~, ~~225~~, ~~226~~, ~~shrikhande_01~~]
Optical: Signal ok	180, 181, 182, 183	[~~227~~, ~~228~~, ~~229~~, ~~230~~], ~~318~~
Optical: RR FFE taps	180, 181, 182, 183	[~~186~~, ~~422~~, ~~187~~, ~~188~~, ~~189~~, ~~172~~, ~~174~~, ~~175~~, ~~176~~, ~~248~~, ~~249~~, ~~250~~, ~~251~~]
Optical: TDECQ general, AUI stress	180, 181, 182, 183	[~~240~~, ~~241~~, ~~242~~, ~~243~~], ~~ghiasi_01~~
Optical: SER and Q_t	180, 181, 182	[~~171~~, ~~173~~], ~~346~~
ILT: clock switch	178B	~~124~~, ~~brown_03~~
ILT: introduction	178B	~~542~~
Note that comment resolution order will likely be readjusted. Cyan highlight: pulled from bucket #1		

Legend: [##,##,##] = related comments, ## = pivot comment, [##,##,author_nn] = related presentation

Common #2 (task force, Thursday)

Topic	Clause/Annex	Comments
Error ratio budget	174A	151, 435
KER	174A	150, he_3dj_01
KER for PHY	174A	376
KER for xMII Extender	174A	130
KER stress	174A	167, brown_03
KER, all-lanes	174A	166, 384
KER, per-lane	174A	[180, 107, mi_01], 183
PHY TX KER	174A, 178-183	8, brown_04
Bucket pulls	174	431, 164, 377, 430, 434, 467,
ILT: State diagram	178B	[~~144~~, ~~brown_03~~], 356
ILT: Management variables	178B	170
Introduction	174	155,
Defintions, etc.	1	270
Annex 176B	176B	424
AN/ILT: time-out	73, 178B	131, 184, 543, 545, ~~slavick_01~~, 544
Electrical/Logic: AN DME swing	73	547, ~~simms_3dj_optx_02_250109~~
Note that comment resolution order will likely be readjusted. Cyan highlight: pulled from bucket #1		

Legend: [##,##,##] = related comments, ## = pivot comment, [##,##,author_nn] = related presentation

Electrical #1 (55)

Topic	178	179	176C	176D	178B
Steady-state voltage in ILT (5)	~~137~~	~~138~~	~~139~~	~~140~~	~~136~~
ILT presets and initialization (8)		~~457~~, ~~513~~, ~~514~~, ~~515~~, ~~516~~ ~~simms_01~~		~~425~~	~~125~~,
Interference tolerance (13)	[~~557~~ ~~dudek_01~~]	~~308~~, ~~386~~	~~445~~, [~~446~~ ~~200~~ ~~552~~ ~~dudek_01~~] ~~447~~	[~~353~~ ~~259~~ ~~208~~], [~~354~~ ~~209~~]	
R_peak (6)		[303 185 ~~ran_02~~]		[350 351 ~~ran_02~~], 206, 207	
AC coupling (4)	~~255~~, ~~256~~, ~~257~~	~~258~~			
Jitter (6)		[211] [306 calvin_01] 541		[219 220] 540	
Amplitude tolerance (4)	~~426~~	~~307~~		~~352~~, ~~396~~	
Jitter tolerance (4)			253	260, [261 262]	
SNDR (2)		~~538~~		~~423~~	
AC common-mode (1)			~~440~~		
Cable assembly reach (1)		~~310~~			
Differential pk-pk (1)				~~539~~	
Note that comment resolution order may be readjusted. *Cyan highlight: pulled from bucket #1*					

Legend: [##,##,##] or same color = related comments, ## = pivot comment, [##,##,author_nn] = related presentation, **Bold** = editorial slides, *italic* = technically complete area

Electrical #2 (48)

Topic	179	176C	176D	178A	179B
C2C TBDs (12)		[~~548~~, ~~195~~, ~~438~~], [~~550~~ ~~197~~], [~~554~~, ~~202~~], ~~203~~, ~~559~~, ~~254~~, [~~555~~, ~~204~~] ~~heck_01~~			
C2C RL masks (5)		[439 196 549], [443 199] ~~heck_01~~			
C2C ERL (7)		[205, 450, 556], 442, [198, 441, 551] ~~heck_01~~			
C2C ITOL (4)		252, [553 201 448 heck_01]			
C2C ILdd mask (1)		449			
COM general (7)	~~533~~			[~~**371**~~, ~~372~~], 383, **536**, **537**, 511	
Partial channel model (8)	[393 466 kocsis_01], [391 392]		389, 390	[387 388]	
Frequency range (4)				[47 mellitz_02], 535	529 526
bucket pulls	~~304~~, ~~309~~,	~~169~~, ~~436~~	~~265~~		
Note that comment resolution order may be readjusted. *Cyan highlight: pulled from bucket #1*					

Legend: [##,##,##] or same color = related comments, ## = pivot comment, [##,##,author_nn] = related presentation, **Bold** = editorial slides, *italic* = technically complete area

Electrical #3 (30)

Topic	Clause	Comments
Test fixtures reference ILdd (5)	179B	[~~357~~ ~~358 379 211 ran_04~~], ~~528~~
Test fixtures TBDs (5)	179B	210 [214 460 463 49 kocsis_02]
Test fixtures FOM_ILD (4)	179B	[459 50 51 212 kocsis_02 mellitz_01]
Test fixtures RLdc (1)	179B	[464 kocsis_02]
Test fixtures ICN (14)	179B	[217 52 53 54 55 56 215 454 461 462 465 522 kocsis_02 mellitz_01 mammenga_01], 523, 524
Test fixtures COM (1)	179B	[48 mellitz_01]
Bucket pulls	179B	525, 526, 527, 530
Bucket pulls	179A	266, 267
Note that comment resolution order may be readjusted. *Cyan highlight: pulled from bucket #1*		

Legend: [##,##,##] or same color = related comments, ## = pivot comment, [##,##,author_nn] = related presentation, **Bold** = editorial slides, *italic* = technically complete area

Electrical Remaining Combined

Topic	Clause	Comments
Test fixtures TBDs (5)	179B	210 [214 460 463 49 kocsis_02]
Test fixtures FOM_ILD (4)	179B	[459 50 51 212 kocsis_02 mellitz_01]
Test fixtures RLdc (1)	179B	[464 kocsis_02]
Test fixtures ICN (14)	179B	[217 52 53 54 55 56 215 454 461 462 465 522 kocsis_02 mellitz_01 mammenga_01], 523, 524
Test fixtures COM (1)	179B	[48 mellitz_01]
Jitter	179, 176D	[211] [306 calvin_01] 541, [219 220] 540
Jitter tolerance	176C, 176D	253, 260, [261 262]
Partial channel model	179, 176D, 178A	[393 466 kocsis_01], [391 392] 389, 390 [387 388]
frequency range	178A, 179B	[47 mellitz_02], 535 529 526
Bucket pulls	179B	525, 526, 527, 530
Bucket pulls	179A	266, 267

Note that comment resolution order may be readjusted.
Cyan highlight: pulled from bucket #1
Legend: [###,##,##] or same color = related comments, ## = pivot comment, [###,###,author_HR] = related presentation, **Bold** = editorial slides, *italic* = technically complete area

Work in Progress (ignore for now)

Optical track #1

DONE

Topic	Clause/Annex	Comments
IMDD Tx optical parameter	181	~~342~~
PMD block diagram	180	~~316~~, ~~317~~
~~Test pattern (moved to optical/logic track)~~	~~182~~	~~345 (joint logic/optical)~~
MDI	180, 180A	[~~57~~, ~~326~~, ~~517~~, 8023dj_D1p3_comment_57_attachment]
Measurement method	180, 181, 182, 183	[~~236~~, ~~237~~, ~~238~~, ~~239~~, ~~ghiasi_01~~]
Power budget	180 181 183	[~~231~~, ~~233~~], ~~320~~ ~~232~~ [~~234~~, ~~235~~, ~~ghiasi_02~~]
Fiber characteristics	180 187	~~324~~ ~~61~~
Channel requirements	180 187	[~~323~~, ~~332~~], ~~334~~, ~~333~~ [~~62~~, ~~80~~]
Note that comment resolution order may be readjusted. *Cyan highlight: pulled from bucket #1*		

Legend: [##,##,##] = related comments, ## = pivot comment, [##,##,author_nn] = related presentation

Optical track #2

DONE

Topic	Clause/Annex	Comments
Coherent Tx optical parameter	185 187	[~~397~~, ~~398~~, ~~190~~, maniloff_02], [474, kota_02] [~~58~~, ~~59~~], ~~64~~, ~~65~~, ~~66~~, ~~67~~, ~~68~~, ~~69~~
Coherent Rx optical parameter	185 187	[~~399~~, maniloff_02], ~~400~~ ~~60~~, ~~70~~, ~~79~~, ~~104~~
Coherent Tx/Rx optical parameter	187	~~179~~
Link budget	185	~~178~~
ETCC	185 187 185A	~~102~~ ~~63~~, ~~193~~ ~~177~~, ~~359~~, [~~408~~, ~~82~~, maniloff_01], [~~475~~, kota_02], ~~521~~
Note that comment resolution order may be readjusted. *Cyan highlight: pulled from bucket #1*		

Legend: [##,##,##] = related comments, ## = pivot comment, [##,##,author_nn] = related presentation

Optical track #3

Topic	Clause/Annex	Comments
Signal detect	187	~~103~~
Primitive	185, 187	[~~99~~, 100]
Editorial	180, 181, 182, 183	~~344~~, ~~325~~, 327, 329, 330, 335, 15, 343
Optical channel	185	101
Parameter name	185, 187	[157, 159]
PICS	185, 187	404, 407, 415, 416
TDECQ general, block method - Deferred from common session	180, 181, 182, 183	[244, 245, 246, 247, ghiasi_03]
Note that comment resolution order may be readjusted. *Cyan highlight: pulled from bucket #1*		

Legend: [##,##,##] = related comments, ## = pivot comment, [##,##,author_nn] = related presentation

Logic track #1

DONE

Topic	Clause/Annex	Comments
~~ER1 architecture~~	~~186~~	[~~36~~, ~~3~~], ~~39~~, ~~218~~, ~~huber_3dj_01_2501~~
~~ER1 delay~~	~~186~~	[~~73~~, ~~23~~]
~~ER1 errors~~	~~186~~	~~191~~
~~ER1 frame alignment~~	~~186~~	~~158~~
~~LR1 Lane grouping~~	~~184~~	~~[156, bruckman_3dj_01_2501]~~
~~SM-PMA / InnerFEC skew~~	~~176, 177~~	[~~452~~, ~~26~~, ~~27~~]
~~Counter description format~~	~~176~~	~~[*11*, 394] (note: *11 is in the bucket)*~~
~~Symbol demux block diagram~~	~~176 *(may also apply to 177)*~~	~~[420, nicholl_3dj_02_2501]~~
~~Management variables~~	~~177~~	~~300~~
Bucket pulls	171 176 177 184	~~153~~, [~~**373, 374**~~], ~~4~~ ~~480~~, ~~86~~, ~~83~~, ~~18~~, ~~19~~, ~~12~~ ~~486~~, ~~121~~, ~~495~~, ~~496~~, ~~301~~ ~~375~~

Note that comment resolution order may be readjusted.
Cyan highlight: pulled from bucket #1
Legend: [##,##,##] = related comments, ## = pivot comment, [##,##,author_nn] = related presentation

Logic track #2 (Wed. AM1)

Topic	Clause/Annex	Comments
PMD service interface and PAM4 decoding	177, 184 (182, 183, 185)	~~274~~, ~~295~~, 347, 487 *(Adee)*
State Diagrams	177	[297, 508], 494, 503 *(Adee)*
BCH counters	184	[32, 348], 349, 473 (*Adee*)

Note that comment resolution order may be readjusted.
Cyan highlight: pulled from bucket #1
Legend: [##,##,##] = related comments, ## = pivot comment, [##,##,author_nn] = related presentation

Optical/Logic track #1 (Target for Wed, AM2)

Topic	Clause/Annex	Comments
800GBASE-LR1 decoding	184	347
PMD service interface and PAM4 decoding	177, 184 (182, 183, 185)	275, brown_03
Alignment for interleaving	184	[472, 409, kota_3dj_01_2501]
Optical/Logic: xBASE-R Inner FEC and LR1 test patterns	177, 184 (176, 182, 183) 174A 182	[148, 9], [10, 128], 149 he_3dj_01 345
Test pattern	180, 181, 182, 183	[111, 112, 113, 98], 81, 105
ER1 error ratio	174A	[77, 194], 78
Note that comment resolution order may be readjusted. *Cyan highlight: pulled from bucket #1*		

Legend: [##,##,##] = related comments, ## = pivot comment, [##,##,author_nn] = related presentation

Buckets

DONE

Bucket #1 comments are listed in the following comment report:
https://www.ieee802.org/3/dj/comments/D1p3/8023dj_D1p3_comments_proposed_clause_bucket1.pdf

The following comments were pulled (so far) from bucket #1:
4, 12, 15, 18, 19, 83, 86, 98, 101, 107, 111, 112, 113, 121, 153, 155, 157, 159, 164, 169, 170, 265, 266, 267, 270, 297, 301, 304, 309, 317, 318, 325, 327, 329, 330, 335, 343, 344, 349, 373, 374, 375, 377, 404, 407, 415, 416, 424, 430, 431, 434, 436, 467, 473, 477, 480, 486, 487, 494, 495, 496, 503, 508, 525, 526, 527, 530

Withdrawn

DONE

The following comments were withdrawn (so far):
20, 109, 110, 192, 269, 278, 302, 319, 360, 361, 362, 363, 364, 365, 366, 367, 368, 369, 370, 385, 429, 453, 455, 458, 477