

P802.3dj D1.4

Comment Resolution Agenda

Matt Brown, Alphawave, P802.3dj Editor-in-Chief

Gary Nichol, Cisco, Logic Track Lead Editor

Eugene Opsasnick, Broadcom, Logic Editor

Adee Ran, Cisco, Electrical Track Lead Editor

Tom Issenhuth, Huawei, Optical Track Lead Editor

Introduction

- ❖ This slide package provides the comment agenda for the Draft 1.4 comment resolution.
- ❖ Comment resolution order is shown in the following slides.
- ❖ The agenda is subject to change as required.
- ❖ Comments/topics that appear to be converging but require some offline consensus building might be “parked” and addressed at a later date in this CRG meeting series.
- ❖ Parallel meetings may be running for the three tracks.
 - Individuals are encouraged to review the topics in each track to understand if there are any conflicts.

Comment resolution

Approach to comment resolution (same as 802.3df)

The following approach will be utilized for resolving comments...

- ❖ Review the proposed response
 - Discuss and refine as needed and attempt to close without objection using **direction** straw polls, as necessary.
 - If no more than two objections (including commenter) to proposed response then consider it to be consensus and close comment.
 - If more than two objections then use **decision** straw poll(s) to move forward.
- ❖ Use of a **direction** straw poll to determine a direction
 - Use the result of the direction straw poll(s) to determine consensus, refine the proposed response, or to craft a decision straw poll.
- ❖ Use of a **decision** straw poll to make a final decision.
 - The decision straw poll winner is the option that has more than 50% support.
 - Close the comment based on the winner of the decision straw poll(s).
- ❖ The editorial team may provide presentations as needed to aid in the resolution of comments.
- ❖ Individuals are reminded to review “IEEE SA Balloting and Comment Resolution Process Guidelines”
<https://standards.ieee.org/wp-content/uploads/import/governance/revcom/guidelines.pdf>

IEEE P802.3dj Task Force, May 2024

8

Source: https://www.ieee802.org/3/dj/public/24_05/brown_3dj_01_2405.pdf

We are here...

284 comments received

14 withdrawn

184 in bucket #1

0 bucket #1 pull requests

0 closed on the floor

198 (potentially) closed

86 to resolve on the floor (pending bucket pulls)

Clause	E	G	T	ER	GR	TR	Open	Closed	Total
1	1	0	0	0	0	1	1	1	2
116	1	0	3	1	0	0	5	0	5
119	0	0	2	0	0	3	4	1	5
169	3	0	2	1	0	0	6	0	6
170	1	0	0	0	0	0	1	0	1
171	4	0	1	1	0	0	6	0	6
172	0	0	0	0	0	1	1	0	1
173	0	0	1	0	0	0	1	0	1
174	2	0	2	1	0	0	5	0	5
174A	0	0	1	0	0	0	1	0	1
175	1	0	3	0	0	1	3	2	5
176	5	0	11	1	0	4	21	0	21
176B	0	0	0	0	0	1	1	0	1
176C	1	0	0	2	0	5	8	0	8
176D	7	0	5	0	0	3	15	0	15
177	3	0	11	1	0	9	22	2	24
178	3	0	4	6	0	3	16	0	16
178A	0	0	1	0	0	0	1	0	1
178B	1	0	6	2	0	6	14	1	15
179	1	0	3	0	0	6	10	0	10
179A	1	0	1	2	0	0	4	0	4
179B	0	0	3	1	0	2	6	0	6
180	3	0	4	1	0	5	12	1	13
180A	2	0	0	0	0	0	2	0	2
181	3	0	3	1	0	3	9	1	10
182	2	0	0	0	0	3	4	1	5
183	1	0	1	0	0	3	4	1	5
184	1	0	6	0	0	0	7	0	7
185	1	0	8	0	0	0	9	0	9
186	6	0	15	7	0	15	40	3	43
187	2	0	7	0	0	2	11	0	11
45	6	0	2	0	0	5	13	0	13
73	0	0	2	2	0	3	7	0	7
Total	62	0	108	30	0	84	270	14	284

Comment resolution sequence

Meeting Date	Topic
Monday 10 March	PM1/PM2: Task Force (Common Track) <ul style="list-style-type: none">- opening business- common track comments Note: Bucket pull requests due by 3PM Eastern
Tuesday 11 March	AM1/AM2: Task Force (Common Track) <ul style="list-style-type: none">- Bucket comment response adoption motion- Common track comments PM1/PM2: Electrical Track, Optical Track, Logic Track
Wednesday 12 March	All day: Electrical Track, Optical Track, Logic Track
Thursday 13 March	AM1/AM2: Task Force (Common Track) <ul style="list-style-type: none">- liaisons discussion and motion to approve- remaining common track comments- all other remaining comments- closing business

Common #1 (task force)

Topic	Clause/Annex	Comments
Segmented FEC type	169, 186	159, brown_03
Skew value	174, 177	[77, 124] 173
xBASE-R PMA: PRBS	176, 174A	[123, 26, 27, dudek_01], 116, 170, 171, 169
xBASE-R Inner FEC: SSPRQ	177	253
800GBASE-LR1 PRBS31 and block error ratio	184, 185, 174A	[115, 117, 118, brown_04]
Error ratio	186, 187, 174A	[16, brown_04]
Error ratio	178, 174A	132, 133, ran_01?
Error ratio	180?	155
ILT: variables	178B	276
ILT: default states	178-183, 178B	129
ILT: references	178B	128
AN differential swing	73, 178, 170	219, 254, 261
AN/LT timers	73, 178B	[234, 282, 222, ran_02], 224
Note that comment resolution order may be readjusted.		
Cyan highlight: pulled from bucket #1		

Legend: [##,##,##] = related comments, ## = pivot comment, [##,##,author_nn] = related presentation

Electrical Track

Topic	Clause/Annex	Comments
Test fixtures ILdd (5)	179A 179B	140 [139, 1 sekel_01], [142 sekel_01], 130
DC common-mode (4)	179 176D	262 271, 272, 273
Functional (2)	176C	73, 268
ITOL (2)	176D	[134, 153]
Jitter (3)	179 176D	131, 137 138
Steady-state voltage (5)	178, 176C	[258, 270], 259, 260, 126
Max swing & initial ILT setting (2)	178, 179	218, 263
Note that comment resolution order may be readjusted. Cyan highlight: pulled from bucket #1		

Legend: [##,##,##] = related comments, ## = pivot comment, ## = editorial slides, [##,##,author_nn] = related presentation

Optical Track

Topic	Clause/Annex	Comments
Optical: Signal detect [Tuesday PM1]	180-183	221
Optical: TDECQ [Tuesday PM1]	180-183	23, 97
DGD	180, 181	[86, 90]
Fiber model	181, 183	[89, 95]
MPI	180-183	[143, 145, 147, 149, ghiasi_01, johnson_01]
Rx average power	185, 187 187	[109, 113, maniloff_01], 11 12, 112
Rx sensitivity	185, 187	[108, 111], [110, 114], maniloff_01
Note that comment resolution order may be readjusted. Cyan highlight: pulled from bucket #1		

Legend: [##,##,##] = related comments, ## = pivot comment, [##,##,author_nn] = related presentation

Logic track

Topic	Clause/Annex	Comments
PCS encode/decode [Tuesday PM2]	119 (also affects 172, 175)	239
PCS IS_SIGNAL.request [Tuesday PM2]	175, 116, 176 (also affects: 119, 172, 169, 174, 185)	[<u>248</u> , 251], 236
Convolutional Interleaver	177	47
Clause structure	177	202
ER1 AM location function	186	66, 230, 217, 70
ER1 PMA frame alignment	186	69
ER1 MDIO	186	106, 107
ER1 Inverse FEC naming	186	160

Note that comment resolution order may be readjusted.

Cyan highlight: pulled from bucket #1

Legend: [##,##,##] = related comments, ## = pivot comment, [##,##,author_nn] = related presentation

Buckets

Bucket #1 comments are listed in the following comment report:
<URL>

The following comments were pulled (so far) from bucket #1:
xx, yy, zz

Withdrawn

The following comments have been withdrawn:

15, 18, 42, 46, 102, 105, 144, 146, 148, 150, 190, 194, 204, 216