P802.3dj D1.4
Comment Resolution Agenda

Matt Brown, Alphawave, P802.3dj Editor-in-Chief
Gary Nichol, Cisco, Logic Track Lead Editor
Eugene Opsasnick, Broadcom, Logic Editor
Adee Ran, Cisco, Electrical Track Lead Editor
Tom Issenhuth, Huawei, Optical Track Lead Editor

Introduction

- This slide package provides the comment agenda for the Draft 1.4 comment resolution.
- Comment resolution order is shown in the following slides.
- The agenda is subject to change as required.
- Comments/topics that appear to be converging but require some offline consensus building might be “parked” and addressed at a later date in this CRG meeting series.
- Parallel meetings may be running for the three tracks.
  - Individuals are encouraged to review the topics in each track to understand if there are any conflicts.

Comment resolution

Approach to comment resolution (same as 802.3df)

The following approach will be utilized for resolving comments…

- Review the proposed response
  - Discuss and refine as needed and attempt to close without objection using **direction** straw polls, as necessary.
  - If no more than two objections (including commenter) to proposed response then consider it to be consensus and close comment.
  - If more than two objections then use **decision** straw poll(s) to move forward.
- Use of a **direction** straw poll to determine a direction
  - Use the result of the direction straw poll(s) to determine consensus, refine the proposed response, or to craft a decision straw poll.
- Use of a **decision** straw poll to make a final decision.
  - The decision straw poll winner is the option that has more than 50% support.
  - Close the comment based on the winner of the decision straw poll(s).
- The editorial team may provide presentations as needed to aid in the resolution of comments.
- Individuals are reminded to review "IEEE SA Balloting and Comment Resolution Process Guidelines"
  https://standards.ieee.org/wp-content/uploads/import/governance/revcom/guidelines.pdf

IEEE P802.3dj Task Force, May 2024 8

Source: https://www.ieee802.org/3/dj/public/24_05/brown_3dj_01_2405.pdf

We are here...

284 comments received
213 closed
71 to resolve on the floor

Clause	E	G	T	ER	GR	TR	Open	Closed	Total
1	1	0	0	0	0	1	0	2	2
116	1	0	3	1	0	0	0	5	5
119	0	0	2	0	0	3	0	5	5
169	3	0	2	1	0	0	0	6	6
170	1	0	0	0	0	0	0	1	1
171	4	0	1	1	0	0	0	6	6
172	0	0	0	0	0	1	0	1	1
173	0	0	1	0	0	0	0	1	1
174	2	0	2	1	0	0	0	5	5
174A	0	0	1	0	0	0	0	1	1
175	1	0	3	0	0	1	0	5	5
176	5	0	11	1	0	4	10	11	21
176B	0	0	0	0	0	1	0	1	1
176C	1	0	0	2	0	5	6	2	8
176D	7	0	5	0	0	3	10	5	15
177	3	0	11	1	0	9	0	24	24
178	3	0	4	6	0	3	6	10	16
178A	0	0	1	0	0	0	0	1	1
178B	1	0	6	2	0	6	0	15	15
179	1	0	3	0	0	6	7	3	10
179A	1	0	1	2	0	0	1	3	4
179B	0	0	3	1	0	2	3	3	6
180	3	0	4	1	0	5	0	13	13
180A	2	0	0	0	0	0	1	1	2
181	3	0	3	1	0	3	1	9	10
182	2	0	0	0	0	3	0	5	5
183	1	0	1	0	0	3	0	5	5
184	1	0	6	0	0	0	0	7	7
185	1	0	8	0	0	0	5	4	9
186	6	0	15	7	0	15	11	32	43
187	2	0	7	0	0	2	7	4	11
45	6	0	2	0	0	5	1	12	13
73	0	0	2	2	0	3	2	5	7
Total	62	0	108	30	0	84	71	213	284

Comment resolution sequence

Meeting Date	Topic
~~Monday 10 March~~	~~PM1/PM2: Task Force (Common Track)~~ ~~- opening business~~ ~~- common track comments~~ ~~Note: Bucket pull requests due by 3PM Eastern~~
~~Tuesday 11 March~~	~~AM1/AM2: Task Force (Common Track)~~ ~~- Bucket comment response adoption motion~~ ~~- Common track comments~~ ~~PM1/PM2: Electrical Track, Optical Track, Logic Track~~
Wednesday 12 March	All day: Electrical Track, Optical Track, Logic Track
Thursday 13 March	AM1/AM2: Task Force (Common Track) - liaisons discussion and motion to approve - remaining common track comments - all other remaining comments - closing business

Common #1 (task force)

Topic	Clause/Annex	Comments
~~Introduction, FEC sublayers~~	~~169, 186~~	[~~159~~, ~~158~~]
~~Skew value~~	~~174, 177~~	[~~77~~, ~~124~~], ~~173~~
~~xBASE-R Inner FEC: SSPRQ~~	~~177~~	~~253~~
~~800GBASE-LR1 PRBS31, block error count~~	~~184, 185, 174A~~	[~~115~~, ~~117, 118,~~ ~~brown_04~~]
~~Error ratio~~	~~186, 187, 174A~~	[~~16~~, ~~brown_04~~], ~~14~~
~~Error ratio~~	~~178-183,185,176C/D,174A~~	[~~132~~, ~~133~~, ~~155~~, ~~brown_03~~]
~~ILT: variables~~	~~178B~~	~~276~~
~~ILT: default states~~	~~178-183, 178B~~	~~129~~
~~ILT: references~~	~~178B~~	~~128~~
~~ILT~~	~~178B~~	~~127~~, ~~277~~
~~ILT/AN~~	~~178B~~	~~223~~
~~Service interface~~	~~116~~	~~238, 237,~~
~~AN/LT timers~~	~~73, 178B~~	[~~234~~, ~~282~~, ~~222~~, ~~ran_02~~], ~~224~~
xBASE-R PMA: PRBS [Thursday AM1]	176, 174A	[123, 26, 27, ~~dudek_01~~], 116, 170, 171, 169
AN differential swing [Thursday AM1]	73, 178, 170	[261, 219, 254, simms_01, ran_01]
Note that comment resolution order may be readjusted. Cyan highlight: pulled from bucket #1		

Legend: [##,##,##] = related comments, ## = pivot comment, [##,##,author_nn] = related presentation

Electrical Track (30)

Topic	Clause/Annex	Comments
Test fixtures ILdd (5) - TBD	179A 179B	**140** [139 sekel_01], [142 sekel_01], 130
DC common-mode (5)	179 176D 179C	262 271, 272, 273 269
Max swing & initial ILT setting (2)	178, 179	**218, 263**
Functional (2)	176C	**73, 268**
ITOL (3)	176D	[**134**, **153**], 274
Steady-state voltage (5)	178, 176C	[**258, 270**], [**259**, **260**], **126**
Jitter (3)	179 176D	131, 137 138
Editoria (4)	176C 176D 178	85 184, 186 178
ILdd frequency (1)	179	226
Bucket pulls	176D 178	151 152
Note that comment resolution order may be readjusted. Cyan highlight: pulled from bucket #1		

Legend: [##,##,##] = related comments, ## = pivot comment, **##** = editorial slides, [##,##,author_nn] = related presentation

Optical Track

Topic	Clause/Annex	Comments
Optical: Signal detect [Tuesday PM1]	180-183	~~221~~
Optical: TDECQ [Tuesday PM1]	180-183	~~23~~, ~~97~~
DGD	180, 181	[~~86~~, ~~90~~]
Fiber model	181, 183	[~~89~~, ~~95~~]
MPI	180-183	[~~143~~, ~~145~~, ~~147~~, ~~149~~, ~~ghiasi_01~~, ~~johnson_01~~]
Rx average power	185, 187	[109, 113, 11, 12, 13, 20, maniloff_01, stassar_01], 112
Rx sensitivity	185, 187	[108, 111], [110, 114], maniloff_01, stassar_01
RINxx	181	88
Annex title	180A	19
Parameter labels	185, 187	29
Note that comment resolution order may be readjusted. Cyan highlight: pulled from bucket #1		

Legend: [##,##,##] = related comments, ## = pivot comment, [##,##,author_nn] = related presentation

Logic track

Topic	Clause/Annex	Comments
~~PCS decode [Tuesday PM2]~~	~~119 (also affects 172, 175)~~	~~239~~
~~PCS IS_SIGNAL.request [Tuesday PM2]~~	~~175, 116, 176 (also affects: 119, 172, 169, 174, 185)~~	~~[248, 251], 236~~
~~PCS State Diagram references~~	~~175~~	~~250~~
~~Convolutional Interleaver~~	~~177~~	~~47~~
~~Clause structure~~	~~177~~	~~202~~
ER1 AM location function	186	66, 230, 217, 70
ER1 PMA frame alignment	186	69
ER1 Inverse FEC naming	186	160
ER1 MDIO	186	106, 107
Bucket pulls	186 ~~177~~ 176 73	62, 229, 201 ~~191~~ 192, 195, 197 220, 196

Note that comment resolution order may be readjusted.
Cyan highlight: pulled from bucket #1
Legend: [##,##,##] = related comments, ## = pivot comment, [##,##,author_nn] = related presentation

Buckets

Done

Bucket #1 comments are listed in the following comment report:
https://www.ieee802.org/3/dj/comments/D1p4/8023dj_D1p4_comments_proposed_id_bucket1.pdf

The following comments were pulled from bucket #1:
13, 14, 19, 20, 29, 62, 85, 88, 127, 151, 152, 158, 178, 184, 186, 191, 192, 195, 196, 197, 201, 220, 223, 226, 229, 237, 238, 250, 269, 274, 277

Withdrawn

Done

The following comments have been withdrawn:
1, 15, 18, 42, 46, 102, 105, 144, 146, 148, 150, 185, 190, 194, 204, 216