

P802.3dj D2.1

Comment Resolution Agenda

Matt Brown, Alphawave, P802.3dj Editor-in-Chief

Gary Nicholl, Cisco, Logic Track Lead Editor

Eugene Opsasnick, Broadcom, Logic Editor

Adee Ran, Cisco, Electrical Track Lead Editor

Tom Issenhuth, Huawei, Optical Track Lead Editor

Introduction

- ❖ This slide package provides the comment agenda for the Draft 2.1 comment resolution.
- ❖ Comment resolution order is shown in the following slides.
- ❖ The agenda is subject to change as required.
- ❖ Comments/topics that appear to be converging but require some offline consensus building might be “parked” and addressed at a later date in this CRG meeting series.
- ❖ Parallel meetings may be running for the three tracks (logic, electrical, and optical).
 - Individuals are encouraged to review the topics in each track to understand if there are any conflicts.

Comment resolution

Approach to comment resolution (same as 802.3df)

The following approach will be utilized for resolving comments...

- ❖ Review the proposed response
 - Discuss and refine as needed and attempt to close without objection using **direction** straw polls, as necessary.
 - If no more than two objections (including commenter) to proposed response then consider it to be consensus and close comment.
 - If more than two objections then use **decision** straw poll(s) to move forward.
- ❖ Use of a **direction** straw poll to determine a direction
 - Use the result of the direction straw poll(s) to determine consensus, refine the proposed response, or to craft a decision straw poll.
- ❖ Use of a **decision** straw poll to make a final decision.
 - The decision straw poll winner is the option that has more than 50% support.
 - Close the comment based on the winner of the decision straw poll(s).
- ❖ The editorial team may provide presentations as needed to aid in the resolution of comments.
- ❖ Individuals are reminded to review “IEEE SA Balloting and Comment Resolution Process Guidelines”
<https://standards.ieee.org/wp-content/uploads/import/governance/revcom/guidelines.pdf>

IEEE P802.3dj Task Force, May 2024

8

Source: https://www.ieee802.org/3/dj/public/24_05/brown_3dj_01_2405.pdf

We are here...

Comment summary:

517 received

479 closed

14 in bucket #2

24 total comments to resolve

Comment resolution summary

Meeting Date	Business and Tracks
Day #1: 2025/9/15 Monday	Opening business Bucket #1 motion; announce tentative bucket #2 Common track comments AM1/AM2/PM1/PM2 (tentatively PM3)
Day #2: 2025/9/16 Tuesday	Optical track AM1/AM2/PM1/PM2 (tentatively PM3) Electrical track AM1/AM2/PM1/PM2 (tentatively PM3)
Day #3: 2025/9/17 Wednesday	Logic track AM1/AM2 Electrical track AM1/AM2/PM1/PM2 Optical track PM1/PM2 (immediately after Logic track complete)
Day #4: 2025/9/18 Thursday	Liaison motions Tentative bucket #2 motion Common-track comments Any other remaining on-time comments Closing business

Common Track – ILT/General {25}

Day #4

Topic	Clause/Annex	Comments
Receiver sensitivity error ratio	178-183, 185, 187, 176C/D 180-183	[62, brown_04] 61
Error ratio tests	174A	453, brown_03
Terminology	178B	11W
PMD control function	179, 180+, 178B	435, 452
Timer	178B	[66, 418, lusted_02]
ILT general		<u>brown_05</u>
ILT state diagram	178B	[463, slavick_01, slavick_02]
Scope	178B	<u>301</u> , 416, 219, 41, 202, dambrosia_04_late
Naming	178B	224
Structure	178B	<u>225</u> , 9, 478, 322
End to end path, RTS @ PCS SI	178B, 175+	[417 , 471 , 329, 323, 324 , ran_03]
ILT: training_status and local_rts	178B	[45 , 481 , 230]
Training disable	178B	[<u>480</u> , 43]
Retimers	178B	[<u>15</u> , 232]
Introduction clause	169	375
PICS	174	376

Note that comment resolution order may be readjusted.

Cyan highlight: pulled from bucket #1

Legend: [##,##,##] = related comments, ## = pivot comment, [##,##,author_nn] = related presentation

Common Track – Optical {30}

Done

Topic	Clause/Annex	Comments
jitter for optical interface	180 to 183	[399 , ran_04]
TDECQ CER	180 to 183	[179 , 180, 181, 182 , chayeb_01 , rodes_02_late]
TDECQ method	180 to 183	[144 , 146, 147, 148, 149] [187, 226 , 171, 172, 173 , 352 chayeb_02 , mi_02_late], [351 , swenson_01_late]
TDECQ reference EQ	180 181 182 183	[313 , 314, 174, 183, 445, 400 175, 184 176, 185 177, 186, rodes_01] 446
Note that comment resolution order may be readjusted. Cyan highlight: pulled from bucket #1; Magenta highlight: placed in bucket #2; Orange highlight: pulled from bucket #2		

Legend: [##,##,##] = related comments, ## = pivot comment, [##,##,author_nn] = related presentation

Electrical Track #1 {49}

Done

Topic	Clause/Annex	Comments
AUI Functional specifications (2)	176C, 176D	214 195
COM P_QC (1)	178, 179, 17C, 176D	392
ITOL (3)	178, 176C	270 280 384
ITOL/JTOL (5)	179, 176D	269 [271 kutsche_01] [152 153] 210
JTOL (10)	178, 179, 176C, 176D	303 [302 385 386] 304 305 [154 155 156 168]
Host output SNDR (1)	176D	276
Jitter (2)	179, 176D	[297 298]
Mode conversion (23)	178, 179, 176C, 176D, 179B	[253 254 256 257 258 259 261 262 264 265 266 267 268] [255 260 263 411] [317 ellison_01] 397 [368W 369W koesis_01] [169 170 ghiasi_03]
GM reference impedance (1)	178, 179, 17C, 176D	380
Test equipment impedance (1)	178	381
Note that comment resolution order may be readjusted. Cyan highlight: pulled from bucket #1		

Legend: [##,##,##] = related comments, ## = pivot comment, ## = editorial slides, [##,##,author_nn] = related presentation

Electrical Track #2 {40}

Done

Topic	Clause/Annex	Comments
RX test channel IL (3)	178 176C	272 273 440 274
GR host output specs (2)	179	[299 300 rysin_01]
Host classes (2)	179A	[198 70]
Test fixture reference IL (14)	179A, 179B	[357 heck_01 425 424 426 427 428 429 430] [363W 364W] [365 koesis_01] 444 356 359
GR IL budget (2)	179, 179B	[358 heck_02] 360
G2M IL budget (1)	176D	353
KR test fixture IL (1)	178	272
Test points (4)	179, 176D, 179A	348 349 441 216
Test fixture ERL (1)	179B	[367W koesis_01]
Tx specifications (2)	179, 176D	277 151
Clause title (2)	178, 179	[330 331]
AUI service interface (1)	176C	355
PIGS (2)	179, 176D	2 65
Bucket pull (3)	179	350
extra		215 203 393
Note that comment resolution order may be readjusted. Cyan highlight : pulled from bucket #1		

Legend: [##,##,##] = related comments, ## = pivot comment, ## = editorial slides, [##,##,author_nn] = related presentation

Optical Track {52+8}

Done

Topic	Clause/Annex	Comments
Test pattern	187	56 , 294
Tx parameter	185	229
Reference equalizer	185, 187, 185A	[438, 437, 439, 337, 338, 178, kota_01_late, temprana_01_late]
Shall statements	185A	126, 127, 128
Editorial	180, 181	[57, 131] , 234 , 318 (318 withdrawn by John Johnson)
RINxxOMA	180+	401, 402,
TDECQ limits	180 181 182 183	[157, 133, 136, 166 137, 158, 167 132, 138, 159 134, 135, 139, 140, 141, 160, 161] ghiasi_01, ghiasi_02, allein_01_late
TX overshoot	180 to 183	[162, 163, 164, 165, ghiasi_01]
MDI breakout	180A	[220, 221, 222, 223, 422, 431, dambrosia_02], 419, 420, 142, 143, 421
TX FRX	180 to 183	[510, 511, 512, 513, 514, 515, 516, 517, 315, 448, 450, 145, 227, 228], eole_01, dudek_01
Note that comment resolution order may be readjusted. Cyan highlight: pulled from bucket #1		

Legend: [##,##,##] = related comments, ## = pivot comment, [##,##,author_nn] = related presentation

Logic track {20}

Done

Topic	Clause/Annex	Comments
PHY delay	31B	250, nicholl_01
Clock ppm tolerance	120	[188, 432, nicholl_02]
AM PRBS9 padding	175	237
AM figures	175	238
Pseudocode variable names	184	407
PRBS31Q generator/checker	177	454
RS FEC error marking	172	459
State diagram variable definitions	178B	119, 122, 118, 120, 121, 123, nicholl_01
Skew	176	284
ILT: Control precoding	178B	485, 486

Note that comment resolution order may be readjusted.

Cyan highlight: pulled from bucket #1

Legend: [##,##,##] = related comments, ## = pivot comment, [##,##,author_nn] = related presentation

Bucket #1

Done

Bucket #1 comments are listed in the following comment report:

https://www.ieee802.org/3/dj/comments/D2p1/8023dj_D2p1_comments_proposed_id_bucket1.pdf

The following comments were pulled from bucket #1 (so far):

19, 118, 120, 121, 123, 142, 143, 150, 208, 235, 284, 318, 322, 326, 345, 350, 398, 421, 467, 468, 499, 507, 509 (23 total)

Note that comment #208 was withdrawn by the commenter.

Bucket #2

Day #4

Bucket #2 comments are listed in the following comment report:

https://www.ieee802.org/3/dj/comments/D2p1/8023dj_D2p1_comments_proposed_id_bucket2.pdf

Note that comments closed on Day #1 (Monday) are in the following comment report:

https://www.ieee802.org/3/dj/comments/D2p1/8023dj_D2p1_closedcomments_id_250915.pdf

The following comments were pulled from bucket #1 (so far):

180, 181, 182 (0 total)

Withdrawn

The following comments have been withdrawn (so far):

59, 133, 136, 137, 157, 158, 166, 167, 204, 205, 208, 209, 372, 404, 405, 406, 409,
363, 364, 367, 368, 369, 318, 61