P802.3dj D2.2
Comment Resolution Agenda

Matt Brown, Alphawave, P802.3dj Editor-in-Chief
Gary Nicholl, Cisco, Logic Track Lead Editor
Eugene Opsasnick, Broadcom, Logic Editor
Adee Ran, Cisco, Electrical Track Lead Editor
Tom Issenhuth, Huawei, Optical Track Lead Editor

Introduction

- This slide package provides the comment agenda for the Draft 2.2 comment resolution.
- Comment resolution order is shown in the following slides.
- The agenda is subject to change as required.
- Comments/topics that appear to be converging but require some offline consensus building might be “parked” and addressed at a later date in this CRG meeting series.
- Parallel meetings may be running for the three tracks (logic, electrical, and optical).
  - Individuals are encouraged to review the topics in each track to understand if there are any conflicts.

Comment resolution procedure

Source: https://www.ieee802.org/3/dj/public/24_05/brown_3dj_01_2405.pdf

Approach to comment resolution (same as 802.3df)

The following approach will be utilized for resolving comments…

- Review the proposed response
  - Discuss and refine as needed and attempt to close without objection using **direction** straw polls, as necessary.
  - If no more than two objections (including commenter) to proposed response then consider it to be consensus and close comment.
  - If more than two objections then use **decision** straw poll(s) to move forward.
- Use of a **direction** straw poll to determine a direction
  - Use the result of the direction straw poll(s) to determine consensus, refine the proposed response, or to craft a decision straw poll.
- Use of a **decision** straw poll to make a final decision.
  - The decision straw poll winner is the option that has more than 50% support.
  - Close the comment based on the winner of the decision straw poll(s).
- The editorial team may provide presentations as needed to aid in the resolution of comments.
- Individuals are reminded to review "IEEE SA Balloting and Comment Resolution Process Guidelines"
  https://standards.ieee.org/wp-content/uploads/import/governance/revcom/guidelines.pdf

IEEE P802.3dj Task Force, May 2024 8

All comment responses closed by the CRG are approved by the task force by a technical motion.

We are here...

Comment summary (so far):
427 received
294 closed
133 total comments to resolve

66 Common track
45 Electrical track
1 Logic track
22 Optical track

Clause	E	G	T	ER	GR	TR	Open	Closed	Total
00	2	0	0	0	0	0	0	2	2
116	0	0	1	0	0	6	5	2	7
119	4	0	5	0	0	4	0	13	13
120	0	0	0	0	0	1	0	1	1
169	1	0	0	0	0	3	1	3	4
172	1	0	2	0	0	1	0	4	4
174	1	0	0	1	0	2	2	2	4
174A	0	0	3	1	0	5	4	5	9
175	2	0	0	0	0	0	0	2	2
175A	1	0	1	0	0	0	0	2	2
176	2	0	4	0	0	0	0	6	6
176B	0	0	0	0	0	1	0	1	1
176C	2	0	2	0	0	9	7	6	13
176D	3	0	3	1	0	10	9	8	17
177	2	0	6	0	0	3	0	11	11
178	3	0	10	0	0	14	18	9	27
178A	0	0	0	0	0	2	2	0	2
178B	14	0	11	5	0	27	21	36	57
179	5	0	9	4	0	19	21	16	37
179A	0	0	0	3	0	1	0	4	4
179B	6	0	3	2	0	5	1	15	16
179C	0	0	0	0	0	1	1	0	1
180	9	0	10	4	0	54	17	60	77
180A	0	0	2	0	0	0	0	2	2
181	1	0	0	1	0	15	5	12	17
182	3	0	0	0	0	19	7	15	22
183	2	0	4	0	0	16	11	11	22
184	6	0	2	0	0	1	2	7	9
185	2	0	1	1	0	2	0	6	6
185A	0	0	3	0	0	0	0	3	3
186	7	0	2	1	0	11	0	21	21
186A	0	0	0	0	0	1	0	1	1
187	4	0	0	0	0	1	0	5	5
73	0	0	0	0	0	1	0	1	1
73A	0	0	1	0	0	1	0	2	2
Total	83	0	85	24	0	236	134	294	428

Comment resolution summary

Meeting Date	Business and Tracks
~~Day #1: 2025/11/10 Monday~~	~~Opening business~~ ~~Bucket #1 motion~~ ~~Common track comments PM1/PM2 (likely PM3)~~
~~Day #2: 2025/11/11 Tuesday~~	~~Common track comments AM1/AM2~~ ~~Optical track PM1/PM2 (tentatively PM3)~~ ~~Electrical track PM1/PM2 (tentatively PM3)~~ ~~Logic track PM1/PM2 (tentatively PM3)~~
Day #3: 2025/11/12 Wednesday	Electrical track AM1/AM2/PM1/PM2 Optical track AM1/AM2/PM1/PM2
Day #4: 2025/11/13 Thursday	Liaison motions, etc. Common-track comments Any other remaining comments Closing business

Common-Track General {#}

Day #4

Topic	Clause/Annex	Comments
~~Block error ratio acronym~~	~~174A~~	~~18~~, ~~brown_03~~
~~test methods~~	~~174A, 178+, 180-183~~	~~166~~
block error ratio	174A	307
Rx tests	179+	202, 203
test blocks	174A	312, brown_03
test methods	174A, 178+	188, 189

Note that comment resolution order may be readjusted.
Cyan highlight: pulled from bucket #1

Legend: [##,##,##] = related comments, ## = pivot comment, [##,##,author_nn] = related presentation

Common-Track ILT {#}

Day #4

Topic	Clause/Annex	Comments
~~PSU: Rename PSU~~	~~178B~~	~~412~~
PSU: Polarity correction	178B, 180-183	180, ~~brown_03~~
PSU: LOCAL_PATTERN mode	178B	149
PSU: psu state diagrams	178B	[351, slavick_01], 222, 291, [315, wang_01], 340, 344
PSU: variables	178B	236, 292, 336, 19
PSU: timers	178B	221
PSU: wording	MANY	[150, 27, 28, 29, 30, 31, 33, 34, 35, 36, 37, 38, 39, 40, 42, 43, 44, 45, 46, 47, 49, 50, 51, 53, 56, 61, 62, 63, 64, 66, 67, 68, 69, 71, 153, 240, 242, brown_03]
PSU: Definitions	178B	[414, 11, 318], brown_03 350, 413
PSU: Scope	178B	237
PSU: ILT for coherent PMDs	184	219, ran_03

Note that comment resolution order may be readjusted.
Cyan highlight: pulled from bucket #1

Legend: [##,##,##] = related comments, ## = pivot comment, [##,##,author_nn] = related presentation

Common-Track Optical {#}

Day #4

Topic	Clause/Annex	Comments
Remove TX TQM test		~~nowell_3dj_adhoc_01a_251030~~, ~~ghiasi_02~~, ~~chayeb_02~~, ~~rodes_01~~, ~~cole_01~~, ~~(preview comments 82, 207, 201)~~
TDECQ DFE tap		~~136~~
Jitter		~~139~~, ~~160~~, ~~224~~, ~~256~~, ~~257~~, ~~258~~, ~~259~~ ~~(resolve in optical track)~~
TDECQ_CER		~~137~~, ~~247~~, ~~248~~, ~~249~~, ~~250~~ ~~(resolve in optical track)~~
TFSEM	180-183	~~138~~
TDECQ mission mode	180-183	[~~265~~, ~~275, 267, 269, 270~~] ~~(resolve in optical track)~~
TDECQ, DFE behaviour	180-183	~~227~~
CER TDECQ	180-183	~~117~~, ~~118~~, ~~chayeb_01~~
~~CER TDECQ limit~~	~~180-183~~	[~~261~~, ~~262~~, ~~263~~, ~~264~~, ~~ghiasi_01~~, ~~rodes_01~~]
~~Tx FRx, AUI jitter~~	~~180-183~~	[~~266~~, ~~268~~]
Tx FRx, ILT	180-183	[~~278~~, ~~279, 280, 281~~] ~~(resolve in optical track)~~
Tx FRx, receiver specs	180-183	82, 226
jitter limit	180-183	~~207, calvin_01 (resolve in optical track)~~
jitter test pattern	180-183, 176, 177	~~4, 5 (resolve in optical track)~~
~~Jitter (3)~~	~~176D 179~~	~~[201 ran_02] [358 359], calvin_01 (resolve in electrical track)~~
~~VEC (EECQ) (2)~~	~~176D~~	~~276 277 calvin_01 (resolve in electrical track)~~

Note that comment resolution order may be readjusted.
Cyan highlight: pulled from bucket #1

Legend: [##,##,##] = related comments, ## = pivot comment, [##,##,author_nn] = related presentation

Optical Track {#}

Day #3

Topic	Clause/Annex	Comments
ETCC	185A	~~120~~, ~~251~~, ~~temprana_01a~~
OMA outer	180	~~211~~
overshoot	180, 181, 182, 183	~~223~~, [~~252~~, ~~253~~, ~~254~~, ~~255~~, ~~ghiasi_03~~]
RINxxOMA	180	~~214~~
Rx Sensitivity	180, 181, 182, 183	[~~98~~, 99, ~~100~~, ~~101~~, 102]
signaling rate	180	10
TX FRx test pattern	181, 182, 183	[103, 104, 105]
Tx FRx	180-183	[194, ~~192~~, ~~193~~, ~~191~~, ~~228~~, ~~229~~, ~~230~~, ~~317~~], [~~271~~, ~~272~~, ~~273~~, ~~274~~], [~~72~~, ~~225~~, ~~155~~] ~~issenhuth_01~~
CD penalty LR4, Tx FRx	180, 181, 182, 183	[432, 433, 434, 435, he_01]
TDECQ	180	8, ~~316~~, 116, 231
CER TDECQ	180-183	[114, 6, 115], [7, 260, 112, 113], chayeb_01
Note that comment resolution order may be readjusted. Cyan highlight: pulled from bucket #1		

Legend: [##,##,##] = related comments, ## = pivot comment, [##,##,author_nn] = related presentation

Electrical Track {57}

Day #3

Topic	Clause/Annex	Comments
~~Loss budget {4}~~	~~179 176D 179A~~	[~~232~~ ~~heck_01~~] ~~204~~ [~~233W~~ ~~heck_02~~]
MTF requirements {2}	179B	[~~301~~ 302 ~~kocsis_01~~]
~~CA minimum loss {1}~~	~~179~~	~~303~~
~~Test fixtures {5}~~	~~179 179B~~	~~299~~ **~~141~~** ~~167 306~~ ~~407 408~~
Jitter {3}	176D 179	[201 ran_02] [358 359], calvin_01
VEC (EECQ) {2}	176D	276 277 calvin_01
Test points {2}	179	397 [~~396~~ ~~406 swenson_01~~]
SCMR_CH {2}	179	[111 304 ellison_01]
Rx tests {11}	178 179 176C 176D	[355 174] [179 176] [79 80] 110 173 175 178 108
RLdc {2}	179	142 177
Single-ended input tolerance {1}	176D	81
Tx signaling rate {1}	178	9
SNDR {1}	179	361
~~R_peak {3}~~	~~179 176D [178 176C?]~~	~~[200 143 healey_01] 360~~
MDI lane mapping {1}	179C	**183**
Modal ERL {15}	178 179 176C 176D 178A	126 123 124 125 127 128 129 130 131 132 133 134 135 121 122 {mellitz_3dj_adhoc_01a_251030}

Note that comment resolution order may be readjusted.
Cyan highlight: pulled from bucket #1

Legend: [##,##,##] = related comments, ## = pivot comment, [##,##,author_nn] = related presentation

Logic Track {20}

Done

Topic	Clause/Annex	Comments
~~50 ppm vs. 100 ppm requirements~~	~~120~~	~~[165, 327, 170, 347, ofelt_01]~~
~~Stateless decoder~~	~~119~~	~~[32, 392, 93]~~
~~PMA block error counters~~	~~176~~	~~428~~
~~ER1 test vectors~~	~~186A~~	~~152~~
~~Deskew state diagrams~~	~~184, 186~~	~~[366, 365], 374~~
~~ER1 state diagrams~~	~~186~~	~~379, 386, 390~~
~~Inner FEC MDIO registers~~	~~177~~	~~[419, 171, 198, 172]~~
~~Inner FEC Pad Scrambler~~	~~177~~	~~197~~
~~PCS state variables~~	~~175~~	~~362~~
~~Constant usage and pilot symbol~~	~~184~~	~~354~~
Note that comment resolution order may be readjusted. Cyan highlight: pulled from bucket #1		

Legend: [##,##,##] = related comments, ## = pivot comment, [##,##,author_nn] = related presentation

Bucket #1

Done

Bucket #1 comments are listed in the following comment report:
https://www.ieee802.org/3/dj/comments/D2p2/8023dj_D2p2_comments_proposed_id_bucket1.pdf

The following comments were pulled from bucket #1 (so far):
~~407, 408, 354~~
(count #)

Withdrawn

The following comments have been withdrawn (so far):
1, 2, 41, 48, 52, 55, 58, 65, 70, 213, 356, 300, 233
(count 13)