Cl **00**　　*SC* **0**　　　*P*　　　*L*　　　# 15

Effenberger, Frank　　　　　Futurewei Technologies

Comment Type **ER**　*Comment Status* **A**

Line numbers should be given for every page. (there are page numbers only for the FM sections)

SuggestedRemedy

Add line numbers throughout.

Response　　　　*Response Status* **C**

ACCEPT.
Also see comment #28.
Implement suggested remedy with editorial license.

Cl **30**　　*SC*　　　　*P*　　　*L*　　　# 24

Effenberger, Frank　　　　　Futurewei Technologies

Comment Type **ER**　*Comment Status* **A**

We will need to add a modification of clause 30 as it typical for new PMDs

SuggestedRemedy

At minimum, add a placeholder for clause 30. Commenter may make a contribution on this topic if time permits.

Response　　　　*Response Status* **C**

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
Resolve using the response to comment #26.

Cl **30**　　*SC* **30.5.1.1.2**　　　*P*　　　*L*　　　# 26

Gui, Tao　　　　　Huawei Technologies

Comment Type **T**　*Comment Status* **A**

All 100GBASE-BRx PMDs are not added to the aMAUType attributes in Clause 30.

SuggestedRemedy

Give editor an editorial license to add Clause 30. It extends the existing aMAUType attribute to include 100GBASE-BRx. This inludes BR10-D/U, BR20-D/U, and BR40-D/U.

Response　　　　*Response Status* **C**

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
A related contribution "3dk_effenberger_2411_1.pdf" has been discussed in the November Plenary meeting.

Implement proposals from the contribution with editorial license and discretion.

Also see comment #24.

Cl **45**　　*SC*　　　　*P*　　　*L*　　　# 25

Effenberger, Frank　　　　　Futurewei Technologies

Comment Type **ER**　*Comment Status* **A**

We will need to add a modification of clause 45 as it typical for new PMDs

SuggestedRemedy

At minimum, add a placeholder for clause 45. Commenter may make a contribution on this topic if time permits.

Response　　　　*Response Status* **C**

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
Resolve using the response to comment #27.

Cl **45**　　*SC* **45.2.1**　　　*P*　　　*L*　　　# 27

Gui, Tao　　　　　Huawei Technologies

Comment Type **T**　*Comment Status* **A**

All 100GBASE-BRx PMA/PMD registers should be added to 45.2.1

SuggestedRemedy

Refere to 802.3cp Clause 45.2.1, give editor an edirotial license to add Clause 45. It add new registers of 100GBASE-BRx

Response　　　　*Response Status* **C**

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.

A related contribution "3dk_effenberger_2411_1.pdf" has been discussed in the November Plenary meeting.

Implement proposals from the contribution with editorial license and discretion.

Also see comment #25.

Cl **157**　　*SC*　　　　*P* **12**　　　*L*　　　# 16

Effenberger, Frank　　　　　Futurewei Technologies

Comment Type **ER**　*Comment Status* **A**

Since this is an existing clause, the draft should show the edits we are proposing to clause 157 with change marks.

SuggestedRemedy

Mark all the new or modified materials as changes.

Response　　　　*Response Status* **C**

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
Implement suggested remedy with editorial license and discretion.

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected　　RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed Z/withdrawn
SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

Cl **157**
SC

Page 1 of 6
2024/11/12 7:35:41

Cl **157**　　　*SC* **1.3**　　　　　　　*P* **14**　　　*L*　　　　# 17

Effenberger, Frank　　　　　　　Futurewei Technologies

Comment Type **E**　　　*Comment Status* **A**

In Fig 157-1a, the legend includes XGMII, 25GMII, and 50GMII, but that are not needed

SuggestedRemedy

Remove the 10, 25, and 50G MII's from the legend.

Response　　　　　　　*Response Status* **C**

ACCEPT.
Also see comment #5.

Cl **157**　　　*SC* **1.4**　　　　　　　*P* **15**　　　*L*　　　　# 18

Effenberger, Frank　　　　　　　Futurewei Technologies

Comment Type **E**　　　*Comment Status* **A**

In Table 157-2, "Clause X" appears.

SuggestedRemedy

Replace X with 168

Response　　　　　　　*Response Status* **C**

ACCEPT.
Also see comment #6 and #30.

Cl **157**　　　*SC* **2.2**　　　　　　　*P* **18**　　　*L*　　　　# 19

Effenberger, Frank　　　　　　　Futurewei Technologies

Comment Type **T**　　　*Comment Status* **A**

Existing text says: "The PMA also may provide an observable electrical interface for the 25GAUI or 50GAUI chip-to-chip (C2C) or chip-to-module (C2M)."

This is missing the mention of CGAUI, which is now part of the clause

SuggestedRemedy

Add the mention of 100G AUI into the C2C and C2M discussion

Response　　　　　　　*Response Status* **C**

ACCEPT.
Also see comment #3.

Cl **157**　　　*SC* **157.1.2**　　　　　*P* **14**　　　*L*　　　　# 5

Luo, Yuanqiu　　　　　　　Futurewei

Comment Type **E**　　　*Comment Status* **A**

Figure 157–1a doesn't have XGMII, 25GMII, 50GMII, and Note 1 in the drawing

SuggestedRemedy

Remove XGMII, 25GMII, 50GMII, MII, Note 1, and their full names/content from Figure 157-1a.

Response　　　　　　　*Response Status* **C**

ACCEPT.
Also see comment #17.

Cl **157**　　　*SC* **157.1.3**　　　　　*P* **15**　　　*L*　　　　# 30

Gui, Tao　　　　　　　Huawei Technologies

Comment Type **E**　　　*Comment Status* **A**

Several places in Table 157-2 show "Clause X". This should be Clause 168.

SuggestedRemedy

Change "Clause X" to "Clause 168"

Response　　　　　　　*Response Status* **C**

ACCEPT.
Also see comment #6 and #18.

Cl **157**　　　*SC* **157.1.3**　　　　　*P* **15**　　　*L*　　　　# 6

Luo, Yuanqiu　　　　　　　Futurewei

Comment Type **E**　　　*Comment Status* **A**

Clause 168 has been assigned to P802.3dk, but in Table 157-2, it still shows "Clause X" in 6 entries. This should be fixed.

SuggestedRemedy

Change "Clause X" in Table 157-2 to "Clause 168". There are 6 places to be changed

Response　　　　　　　*Response Status* **C**

ACCEPT.
Also see comment #18 and #30.

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected　　RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed Z/withdrawn
SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

Cl **157**
SC **157.1.3**

Page 2 of 6
2024/11/12 7:35:42

Cl **157**　　*SC* **157.2.1**　　　　　*P* **17**　　　*L*　　　　# 7

Luo, Yuanqiu　　　　　　　　　　Futurewei

Comment Type **E**　　*Comment Status* **A**

A small part of this paragraph (i.e., "each Multi-Gigabit Ethernet BiDi PHY are given in Table 157–3, Table 157–4, Table 157–5, and
Table 157–6.") is seperated from the main text after 4 tables. This is not reader-friendly.

SuggestedRemedy

Move text "each Multi-Gigabit Ethernet BiDi PHY are given in Table 157–3, Table 157–4, Table 157–5, and Table 157–6." to be located before the 4 tables.

Response　　　　　　　*Response Status* **C**

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
Implement with editorial license and discretion.

Cl **157**　　*SC* **157.2.1**　　　　　*P* **17**　　　*L*　　　　# 1

Luo, Yuanqiu　　　　　　　　　　Futurewei

Comment Type **E**　　*Comment Status* **A**

Table 157-6, in column head, "X" should be "168", "100GBASE-BR20-OMD" should be "100GBASE-BR20-PMD", "100GBASE-BR40-OMD" should be "100GBASE-BR40-PMD".

SuggestedRemedy

Change "X" to "168"
Change "100GBASE-BR20-OMD" to "100GBASE-BR20-PMD"
Change "100GBASE-BR40-OMD" to "100GBASE-BR40-PMD"

Response　　　　　　　*Response Status* **C**

ACCEPT.

Cl **157**　　*SC* **157.2.1**　　　　　*P* **17**　　　*L*　　　　# 2

Luo, Yuanqiu　　　　　　　　　　Futurewei

Comment Type **T**　　*Comment Status* **A**

A note about O and M is missing under Table 157-6

SuggestedRemedy

Add a superscript "a "to the first "O" or "M" in the table entry, add Note "aM = Mandatory, O = Optional" under table

Response　　　　　　　*Response Status* **C**

ACCEPT.

Cl **157**　　*SC* **157.2.4**　　　　　*P* **18**　　　*L*　　　　# 3

Luo, Yuanqiu　　　　　　　　　　Futurewei

Comment Type **T**　　*Comment Status* **A**

It says "The PMA also may provide an observable electrical interface for the 25GAUI or 50GAUI
chip-to-chip (C2C) or chip-to-module (C2M)". The 100GAUI C2C and C2M should also be mentioned.

SuggestedRemedy

Change this sentence to "The PMA also may provide an observable electrical interface for the 25GAUI, 50GAUI, or 100GAUI chip-to-chip (C2C) or chip-to-module (C2M)"."

Response　　　　　　　*Response Status* **C**

ACCEPT.
Also see comment #19.

Cl **168**　　*SC*　　　　　　　　*P* **20**　　　*L*　　　　# 22

Effenberger, Frank　　　　　　　Futurewei Technologies

Comment Type **E**　　*Comment Status* **A**

On all the subclauses of 168, there is an editor's note explaining the origin of the subclause. This should be rephrased into a note that will remain in the draft, because this origin information is useful for the reader.

SuggestedRemedy

In each case, make the editor's note into a footnote, referenced by the first sentence.

Response　　　　　　　*Response Status* **C**

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
After discussion in the November Plenary meeting, it is suggested to keep them as editor's notes and remove the text in parentheses.

Cl **168**　　*SC* **1**　　　　　　　*P* **20**　　　*L*　　　　# 20

Effenberger, Frank　　　　　　　Futurewei Technologies

Comment Type **E**　　*Comment Status* **R**

In table 168-1, the clauses are not listed in numeric order

SuggestedRemedy

Move the last line to be the first line.

Response　　　　　　　*Response Status* **C**

REJECT.
Table 168-1 is an exact copy of Table 140-1, the clause order is thus expected to be kept the same with Table 140-1.

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected　　RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed Z/withdrawn
SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

Cl **168**
SC **1**

Page 3 of 6
2024/11/12 7:35:42

Cl **168**   *SC* **5.4**   *P* **25**   *L*   # 21

Effenberger, Frank   Futurewei Technologies

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **A**

Last line: "modulated ptical signal" is missing an o

SuggestedRemedy

Fix typo

Response   *Response Status* **C**

ACCEPT.

Cl **168**   *SC* **6.1**   *P* **27**   *L*   # 23

Effenberger, Frank   Futurewei Technologies

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **A**

In Table 168-6, for the row on OMA(MIN), there is no need to have four lines.

SuggestedRemedy

Recast the first cell in the row of the table to read:
Outer Optical Modulation Amplitude (OMAouter) each lane (min)b:
for max(TECQ, TDECQ) < 1.4 dB
for 1.4 dB <= max(TECQ, TDECQ) < TDECQ(MAX)

That way, the four rows of values can be merged into just two rows.

Response   *Response Status* **C**

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
Table 168-6 was adopted in July meeting, the related presentations are:
3dk_jackson_2407_1b and 3dk_jackson_2407_2b.
The suggested remedy is correct except that the expression "for 1.4 dB <= max(TECQ, TDECQ) < TDECQ(MAX)" may be separated into two rows since it's too long.

Cl **168**   *SC* **168.6.1**   *P* **27**   *L*   # 14

Luo, Yuanqiu   Futurewei

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **A**

Table 168-6, row "RINxOMA (max)", its unit "dB/Hz" is seperated in two lines.

SuggestedRemedy

Adjust the width of the unit cell to show "dB/Hz" in a single line

Response   *Response Status* **C**

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
Implement with editorial license and discretion.

Cl **168**   *SC* **168.6.1**   *P* **27**   *L*   # 10

Luo, Yuanqiu   Futurewei

Comment Type **T**   *Comment Status* **A**

Table 168-6, there is an item "Outer Optical Modulation Amplitude (OMAouter) each lane (min)". As 100GBiDi desgin is based upon a single lane model, "each lane" should be removed.

SuggestedRemedy

Delete "each lane" from this item name

Response   *Response Status* **C**

ACCEPT.

Cl **168**   *SC* **168.6.1**   *P* **27**   *L*   # 9

Luo, Yuanqiu   Futurewei

Comment Type **E**   *Comment Status* **A**

Table 168-6, item "Outer Optical Modulation Amplitude (OMAouter) each lane (min)", unit of the last two lines is missing

SuggestedRemedy

In Table 168-6, item "Outer Optical Modulation Amplitude (OMAouter) each lane (min)", add "dBm" as unit of the last two lines

Response   *Response Status* **C**

ACCEPT.

Cl **168**   *SC* **168.6.2**   *P* **28**   *L*   # 4

Luo, Yuanqiu   Futurewei

Comment Type **T**   *Comment Status* **A**

SECQ values in Note C of Table 168-7 are different from the SECQ values specified in Clause 168.7.12

SuggestedRemedy

In Note C, change SECQ values of BR10 and BR20 to 3.4 dB, change SECQ value of BR40 to 3.9 dB.

Response   *Response Status* **C**

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
Resolve using the response to comment #29.

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed Z/withdrawn
SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

Cl **168**
SC **168.6.2**

Page 4 of 6
2024/11/12 7:35:42

Cl **168**　　*SC* **168.6.2**　　　　*P* **28**　　*L*　　　# 11

Luo, Yuanqiu　　　　　　　Futurewei

Comment Type **T**　　*Comment Status* **A**

Table 168-7, there is an item "Receiver sensitivity (OMAouter)c, each lane(max)". As 100GBiDi desgin is based upon a single lane model, "each lane" should be removed.

SuggestedRemedy

Delete "each lane" from this item name

Response　　　　　　*Response Status* **C**

ACCEPT.

Cl **168**　　*SC* **168.6.2**　　　　*P* **28**　　*L*　　　# 12

Luo, Yuanqiu　　　　　　　Futurewei

Comment Type **E**　　*Comment Status* **A**

Table 168-7, row "Receiver sensitivity (OMAouter)", unit of this row should be aligned to the values

SuggestedRemedy

Align "dBm" to their respective OMAouter values, 2 places

Response　　　　　　*Response Status* **C**

ACCEPT.

Cl **168**　　*SC* **168.6.2**　　　　*P* **28**　　*L*　　　# 29

Gui, Tao　　　　　　　Huawei Technologies

Comment Type **E**　　*Comment Status* **A**

In Note C of Table 168-7, my understadnin is SECQ is up to 3 dB for 100GBASE-BR10. SECQ is up to 3.2 dB for both 100GBASE-BR20 and 100GBASE-BR40. The comma sign position should be corrected to show this meaning.

SuggestedRemedy

Change Note C to "Receiver sensitivity (OMAouter) (max) is optional and is defined for a transmitter with a value of SECQ up to 3 dB
for 100GBASE-BR10, and 3.2 dB for 100GBASE-BR20 and 100GBASE-BR40."

Response　　　　　　*Response Status* **C**

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
Also see comment #4.
Note C is copied from Clause 160, but the exact SECQ values should be updated based on those of 100GBASE-BRx.
Implement the following with editorial license:
Change Note C to "Receiver sensitivity (OMAouter) (max) is optional and is defined for a transmitter with a value of SECQ up to 3.4 dB for 100GBASE-BR10 and 100GBASE-BR20, and 3.9 dB for 100GBASE-BR40."

Cl **168**　　*SC* **168.6.3**　　　　*P* **29**　　*L*　　　# 31

Gui, Tao　　　　　　　Huawei Technologies

Comment Type **E**　　*Comment Status* **A**

A comma sign is missing after text "100GBASE-BR20" in Table 168-8 note a.

SuggestedRemedy

Add "," after "100GBASE-BR20"

Response　　　　　　*Response Status* **C**

ACCEPT.

Cl **168**　　*SC* **168.7.5.2**　　　*P* **32**　　*L*　　　# 13

Luo, Yuanqiu　　　　　　　Futurewei

Comment Type **T**　　*Comment Status* **A**

In Table 168-11, units of the last two columns are missing

SuggestedRemedy

In Table 168-11, add "dB" after all optical reutrn loss values, add "ps" after all DGD values

Response　　　　　　*Response Status* **C**

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
Put the units in the column header.

Cl **168**　　*SC* **168.10.2.1**　　*P* **40**　　*L*　　　# 8

Luo, Yuanqiu　　　　　　　Futurewei

Comment Type **E**　　*Comment Status* **A**

Two commas are missing in the last sentence of 168.10.2.1

SuggestedRemedy

Add a comma after "100GBASE-BR10", add another comma after "100GBASE-BR20"

Response　　　　　　*Response Status* **C**

ACCEPT.

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected　　RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed Z/withdrawn
SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

Cl **168**
SC **168.10.2.1**

Page 5 of 6
2024/11/12 7:35:42

Cl **All**   *SC* **All**   *P*   *L*   # 28

Gui, Tao   Huawei Technologies

Comment Type   **E**   *Comment Status*   **A**

Line numbers are missing in the document

SuggestedRemedy

Update the template to include line numbers

Response   *Response Status*   **C**

ACCEPT.
Also see comment #15.
Implement suggested remedy with editorial license.

TYPE: TR/technical required ER/editorial required GR/general required T/technical E/editorial G/general
COMMENT STATUS: D/dispatched A/accepted R/rejected   RESPONSE STATUS: O/open W/written C/closed Z/withdrawn
SORT ORDER: Clause, Subclause, page, line

Cl **All**
SC **All**

Page 6 of 6
2024/11/12 7:35:42