

802.3dk D2.3 Bidirectional 100Gb/s Optical Access PHYs 3rd Working Group recirculation ballot comment

CI 30 SC 30..5.1.1.2 P18 L10 # 15
 Simms, William NVIDIA
 Comment Type E Comment Status R editorial
 aMAUType
 SuggestedRemedy
 Change from aMAUType to: MAU Type
 Response Response Status C
 REJECT.
 See comment #14.

CI 45 SC 45.2.1.145a P24 L7 # 2
 Dawe, Piers Nvidia
 Comment Type E Comment Status A editorial (Late)
 Some interfaces have mandatory precoding ability without this bit. This is likely to cause confusion unless explained.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Similarly to 45.2.1.117.7a, insert: This register applies to 100GBASE-BRx.
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 Add "PMA Tx precoding ability bit applies to 100GBASE-BRx" in 45.2.1.145a.1.
 Add "PMA Rx precoding ability bit applies to 100GBASE-BRx" in 45.2.1.145a.2.
 Implement with editorial license.

CI 45 SC 45.2.1.145a P24 L23 # 16
 Simms, William NVIDIA
 Comment Type E Comment Status A editorial
 order of the bits should be 1.607.1 and then 1.607.0.
 SuggestedRemedy
 Suggest to flip 45.2.1.145a.1 and 45.2.1.145a.2 to make the order 1.607.1 followed by 1.607.0 to be consistent with other parts of the spec
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 Implement suggested remedy with editorial license.

CI 56 SC 56.1.3 P26 L1 # 3
 Dawe, Piers Nvidia
 Comment Type E Comment Status A editorial (Late)
 802.3cp has been absorbed into 802.3-2022
 SuggestedRemedy
 Delete "(as modified by IEEE Std 802.3cp-2022)" in 3 places
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT.
 Implement suggested remedy with editorial license.

CI 56 SC 56.1.3 P26 L11 # 4
 Dawe, Piers Nvidia
 Comment Type E Comment Status A editorial (Late)
 Two ... fiber
 SuggestedRemedy
 Two ... fibers (3 times) as in the base standard
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT.
 Implement suggested remedy with editorial license.

CI 56 SC 56.1.3 P30 L29 # 5
 Dawe, Piers Nvidia
 Comment Type E Comment Status A quick review (Late)
 If this table includes 161 RS-FEC-Int
 SuggestedRemedy
 Perhaps it should include 152 Inverse RS-FEC also
 Response Response Status C
 ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
 Add CL152 in Table 56-2 with editorial license.

802.3dk D2.3 Bidirectional 100Gb/s Optical Access PHYs 3rd Working Group recirculation ballot comment

CI 80 SC 80.1.5 P34 L20 # 6

Dawe, Piers

Nvidia

Comment Type E Comment Status A editorial (Late)

Some of what is shown in blue in the diff version seems to be the same as in D2.2.

SuggestedRemedy

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT.
Implement with editorial license.
(D2.1 Comment #113.)

CI 91 SC 91.7.4.1 P42 L10 # 7

Dawe, Piers

Nvidia

Comment Type E Comment Status A editorial (Late)

TF10 has KR4 not KP4

SuggestedRemedy

Change KP4 back to KR4, once

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT.

CI 135 SC 135.5.7.2 P44 L24 # 17

Simms, William

NVIDIA

Comment Type ER Comment Status A editorial

typo: 1/(1+D) mode 4

SuggestedRemedy

substitute 1/(1+D) mod 4

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT.

CI 135 SC 135.6 P5287 L # 8

Dawe, Piers

Nvidia

Comment Type E Comment Status A quick review (Late)

In Table 135-3, MDIO/PMA status variable mapping

SuggestedRemedy

Insert new rows:

MDIO status variable	PMA/PMD register name	Register/bit number	PMA status variable
PMA Rx precoding ability	PMA precoding ability	1.607.1	Rx_precoding_ability
PMA Tx precoding ability	PMA precoding ability	1.607.0	Tx_precoding_ability

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT.
Implement suggested remedy with editorial license.

CI 161 SC 161 P52 L1 # 9

Dawe, Piers

Nvidia

Comment Type E Comment Status A editorial (Late)

Should say that Clause 161 was added by 802.3ck

SuggestedRemedy

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
Change two editing instruction to:
Change Table 161–2 (as added by IEEE Std 802.3ck-2022) as follows (additional unchanged rows not shown):
Insert new subclauses 161.6.10a after 161.6.10 (as added by IEEE Std 802.3ck-2022) as follows:

CI 161 SC 161 P52 L10 # 10

Dawe, Piers

Nvidia

Comment Type E Comment Status A editorial (Late)

stauts

SuggestedRemedy

status

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT.

802.3dk D2.3 Bidirectional 100Gb/s Optical Access PHYs 3rd Working Group recirculation ballot comment

Cl 168 SC 168.7.5 P65 L8 # 11

Dawe, Piers

Nvidia

Comment Type T Comment Status R technical (Late)

This says "there's a proposal to add the maximum tap weight for the tap immediately after the largest tap: max 0.07 in CL 168.7.5". chayeb_3dj_01_2505 slide 8 shows that a very asymmetric signal can pass all the specs and still be troublesome to receive. P802.3dj D2.0 comment 392 proposes "The absolute difference between c(-1) and c(1) shall be less than 0.3". However, ordinary filtering effects (pulses decay slower than they build up) can cause the optimum setting for the tap immediately after the largest tap to be more negative than the one immediately before; this is expected. Having the tap before at -0.2 and the tap after at +0.1 would be more undesirable than the reverse.

SuggestedRemedy

Add two specs:
Tap weight for the tap immediately after the largest tap: max 0.08. (Typically this tap would be -ve)
-0.3 <= (tap after - tap before) <= 0.15

Response Response Status C

REJECT.
No consensus was reached to make a change, commentor is invited to submit a comment during the SA ballot.

Cl 168 SC 168.10.1 P72 L7 # 12

Dawe, Piers

Nvidia

Comment Type E Comment Status A quick review (Late)

Note b about dispersion doesn't relate to the insertion loss row.

SuggestedRemedy

Remove the b after Channel insertion loss a,

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
Remove note b from channel insertion loss row, and add note b to all dispersion rows.

Cl Content SC Contents P13 L3 # 1

Dawe, Piers

Nvidia

Comment Type E Comment Status A editorial (Late)

Layout

SuggestedRemedy

Missing white space after each clause number

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT.

Cl Introdu SC Introduction P12 L3 # 18

Lewis, Jon

Dell Technologies

Comment Type ER Comment Status A editorial

The first line states that Amendment 11 "adds Clause ." but doesn't include the clause

SuggestedRemedy

Change the end of the first sentence to "adds Clause 168."

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT.

Cl TOC SC TOC P13 L12 # 14

Simms, William

NVIDIA

Comment Type E Comment Status R quick review

Possible Typo aMAUType

SuggestedRemedy

Change from aMAUType to: MAU Type

Response Response Status C

REJECT.
Subclause title of 30.5.1.1.2 in the IEEE 802.3 base standard is: aMAUType.

Cl TOC SC TOC P14 L24 # 13

Simms, William

NVIDIA

Comment Type ER Comment Status A editorial

Typo, no space between "networksPhysical"

SuggestedRemedy

Change to "networks Physical" Medium Attachment...

Response Response Status C

ACCEPT IN PRINCIPLE.
Delete "Introduction to 50 Gb/s networks" in the CL135 title in the content.