

P802.3z Draft 3.0 Comments

Comment ID	41	Topic	
Name	Scott Mason		
Email	smason@plaintree.com		
Phone	+1 613 831 8300		
Fax	+ 1 613 831 3283		
Co.	Plaintree Systems		
CI	36	SC	Fig. 36-7b
		P	36.30
		L	24
Comment Type	TR	Comment Status	R
The comment also applies to clause 35, page 35.6, subclause 35.2.1.5. Sorry - the web comment form does not have a field for this data.			
The PCS describes valid end delimiters as /T//R//R/ or /T//R//K28.5/. However, in D3.0 figure 36.7b, the receive PCS ends the current frame when it receives /V/. When /V/ is received, the PCS signals carrier-extend error. Although the frame is terminated, the PCS client is required to associate the carrier-extend error with the preceding frame.			
SuggestedRemedy			
The arc from state RECEIVE to state EXTEND_ERR in D3.0 figure 36-7b should instead go to state RX_DATA_ERROR.			
Proposed Response		Response Status	Z
Response generated by IEEE P802.3z PCS Sub-Task Force and accepted by motion by P802.3z Task Force on July 9,1997 in Maui, HI. Duplicate of comment 40.			

Comment ID	40	Topic	
Name	Scott Mason		
Email	smason@plaintree.com		
Phone	+1 613 831 8300		
Fax	+ 1 613 831 3283		
Co.	Plaintree Systems		
CI	36	SC	Fig. 36-7b
		P	36.30
		L	24
Comment Type	TR	Comment Status	A
The comment also applies to clause 35, page 35.6, subclause 35.2.1.5. Sorry - the web comment form does not have a field for this data.			
The PCS describes valid end delimiters as /T//R//R/ or /T//R//K28.5/. However, in D3.0 figure 36.7b, the receive PCS ends the current frame when it receives /V/. When /V/ is received, the PCS signals carrier-extend error. Although the frame is terminated, the PCS client is required to associate the carrier-extend error with the preceding frame.			
SuggestedRemedy			
The arc from state RECEIVE to state EXTEND_ERR in D3.0 figure 36-7b should instead go to state RX_DATA_ERROR.			
Proposed Response		Response Status	C
Response generated by IEEE P802.3z PCS Sub-Task Force and accepted by motion by P802.3z Task Force on July 9,1997 in Maui, HI. Agreed. Resolved per the resolution of comment 39.			

P802.3z Draft 3.0 Comments

Comment ID	39	Topic
Name	Scott Mason	
Email	smason@plaintree.com	
Phone	+1 613 831 8300	
Fax	+ 1 613 831 3283	
Co.	Plaintree Systems	

CI 36 **SC** Fig. 36-7b **P** 36.30 **L** 24

Comment Type TR **Comment Status** A

The comment also applies to clause 35, page 35.6, subclause 35.2.1.5. Sorry - the web comment form does not have a field for this data.

The PCS describes valid end delimiters as /T//R/R/ or /T//R//K28.5/. However, in D3.0 figure 36.7b, the receive PCS ends the current frame when it receives /T/. When the two code-groups following /T/ are not /R//R/ or /R//K28.5/, the PCS signals carrier-extend error. Although the frame is terminated, the PCS client is required to associate the carrier-extend error with the preceding frame.

SuggestedRemedy

The arc from state EPD_CHECK_END to state EXTEND_ERR in D3.0 figure 36-7b should instead go to state RX_DATA_ERROR.

With this change, when a data code-group became corrupted to /T/, the PCS would clearly indicate a data error to its client. Also, when an end delimiter became corrupted, the PCS would clearly indicate a data error to its client. The PCS would continue to recover from a missing or corrupted end delimiter, via the state "EARLY_END".

Proposed Response **Response Status** C

Response generated by IEEE P802.3z PCS Sub-Task Force and accepted by motion by P802.3z Task Force on July 9,1997 in Maui, HI. Agreed. The following changes are made:

Delete state EPD1_CHECK_END.

Add a transition from state RECEIVE to state TRR+EXTEND on the condition that check_end =3D /T/R/R/.

Add a transition from state RECEIVE to state TRI+RRI on the condition that check_end =3D /T/R/K28.5/ * EVEN.

Add a state EARLY_END_EXT.

Add a transition from state RECEIVE to state EARLY_END_EXT on the condition that check_end =3D /R/R/R/.

In state EARLY_END_EXT, set RX_ER <=3D TRUE.

Add a transition from state EARLY_END_EXT to state EPD2_CHECK_END under the condition SYNC_UNITDATA.indicate.

In state PACKET_BURST_RRS, set RX_DV <=3D FALSE and set RXD<7:0> <=3D 0000 1111.

Change the transition from state RECEIVE to state EARLY_END to become the condition that:
EVEN * (check_end =3D /K28.5/D/K28.5/ + check_end =3D /K28.5/D21.5/D0.0/ + check_end =3D /K28.5/D2.2/D0.0/).

Delete the transition from state EARLY_END to state RCV_C_CODE.

Change the transition from state EARLY_END to state IDLE_K to become SYNC_UNITDATA.indicate.

Change the transition from state RECEIVE to state RX_DATA_ERROR to become "ELSE".

P802.3z Draft 3.0 Comments

Comment ID 204 **Topic**
Name Bob Noseworthy
Email ren@iol.unh.edu
Phone 603 862 4342
Fax 603 862 1915
Co. UNH InterOperability Lab

CI 36 **SC** 36.2.4 **P** 36.7 **L** 1
Comment Type T **Comment Status** A

The "shall" is not referenced in the PICS.

"The definition of the 8B/10B transmission code in this standard shall be identical to that specified in ANSI X3.230-1994 (FC-PH) Clause 11."

SuggestedRemedy

Add PICS reference to 36.7.4.1.3 Code group functions
Item - CGx
Feature - 8B/10B transmission code
Subclause - 36.2.4
Status - M
Support - Yes[]
Comment - Identical to ANSI X3.230-1994=09

Proposed Response **Response Status** C

Response generated by IEEE P802.3z PCS Sub-Task Force and accepted by motion by P802.3z Task Force on July 9,1997 in Maui, HI. Agreed. An alterate remedy was selected as follows:

In 36.2.4, replace "shall be" in the first sentence on page 36.7 with "is".

In 36.7.4.1.1, delete item PCS5.

Comment ID 205 **Topic**
Name Bob Noseworthy
Email ren@iol.unh.edu
Phone 603 862 4342
Fax 603 862 1915
Co. UNH InterOperability Lab

CI 36 **SC** 36.2.4.2 **P** 36.8 **L** 5
Comment Type T **Comment Status** A

The "shall" is not referenced in the PICS.

"The contents of a packet shall be transmitted sequentially beginning with the ordered_set used to denote the Start_of_Packet (the SPD delimiter) and proceeding code_group by code_group from left to right within the definition of the packet until the ordered_set used to denote the End_of_Packet (the EPD delimiter) is transmitted."

SuggestedRemedy

Add PICS reference to 36.7.4.1.3 Code group functions
Item - CGx
Feature - Transmission order
Subclause - 36.2.4.2
Status - M
Support - Yes[]
Comment - sequential code_groups from SPD to EPD=09

Proposed Response **Response Status** C

Response generated by IEEE P802.3z PCS Sub-Task Force and accepted by motion by P802.3z Task Force on July 9,1997 in Maui, HI. Agreed. An alterate remedy was selected as follows:

In 36.2.4.2, line 5, replace "shall be" with "is".

P802.3z Draft 3.0 Comments

Comment ID 19 **Topic**
Name Howie Johnson
Email howiej@sigcon.com
Phone 425 556 0800
Fax 425 881 6149
Co. Signal Consulting

CI 36 **SC** 36.2.4.7 **P** 36.10 **L** 6

Comment Type T **Comment Status** R

My reading of 36.2.4.4 indicates that the entry for D0.0 does not normally flip disparity, however, in the event of a preceeding data error it may do so. The rules stipulate that after having received D0.0- disparity is set to (-), and after having received D0.0+ disparity is set to (+), regardless of the previous value of disparity.

Table 36-3 should reflect this interpretation of the disparity rules.

SuggestedRemedy

Insert a column before column 6 in table 36-1(a-e) The new column header is: Set- RD The new value column is: "same" (for those balanced words whose codings are identical in the (-) and (+) columns, "-" for those words which set the disparity to (-). and "+" for those words which set the disparity to (+).

Change the heading of column 9 to read: Set+ RD The new value in that column is: "same" (for those balanced words whose codings are identical in the (-) and (+) columns, "-" for those words which set the disparity to (-). and "+" for those words which set the disparity to (+).

Proposed Response **Response Status** W

Response generated by IEEE P802.3z PCS Sub-Task Force and accepted by motion by P802.3z Task Force on July 9,1997 in Maui, HI.
 For valid code groups, the tables are always accurate. Invalid code-groups are not included in the table. The following changes are intended to clarify the calculation of running disparity by the receiver and transmitter:

Change the heading of 36.2.4.4 to: Running disparity rules.

Add to the end of 36.2.4.4: "For valid code groups, the results of the running disparity calculations, relative to the beginning running disparity, are indicated in the Ending RD column of tables 36-1 and 36-2."

Change the first sentence of 36.2.4.6 from "The column ..." to "The column in tables 36-1 and 36-2 ...".

Comment ID 206 **Topic**
Name Bob Noseworthy
Email ren@iol.unh.edu
Phone 603 862 4342
Fax 603 862 1915
Co. UNH InterOperability Lab

CI 36 **SC** 36.2.4.7.1 **P** 36.9 **L** 53

Comment Type T **Comment Status** A

The "shall" is not referenced in the PICS.

"c) The second code_group of all multi-code_group ordered_sets shall be a data code_group."

SuggestedRemedy

Add PICS reference to 36.7.4.1.4 Ordered set functions
 Item - OSx
 Feature - Second code group of a multi-code group ordered set contains a data code_group
 Subclause - 36.2.4.7.1
 Status - M
 Support - Yes[]
 Comment -

Proposed Response **Response Status** C

Response generated by IEEE P802.3z PCS Sub-Task Force and accepted by motion by P802.3z Task Force on July 9,1997 in Maui, HI.
 Agreed. An alterate remedy was selected by straw poll of 10 to 2 as follows:

In 36.2.4.7.1, item a, replace "shall consist" with "consists".

In item b, replace "shall be" with "is always".

In the first sentence of item c, replace "shall be" with "is always".

In the third sentence of item c, replace "shall provide" with "provides".

P802.3z Draft 3.0 Comments

Comment ID 14 **Topic**

Name scott murphy

Email murph@altheon.com

Phone (408) 360-5518

Fax (408) 360-5501

Co. Alteon Networks

CI 36 **SC** 36.2.5.2.2 **P** 36.30 **L**

Comment Type T **Comment Status** A

Figure 36-7b - PCS receive state diagram, part b is inconsistent in its handling of a states transitions back to itself. States False_Carrier and Extend_Err show explicit transitions back to themselves, while states Packet_Burst_RRS and TRI+RRI do not.

SuggestedRemedy

Remove the explicit transistions from FALSE_CARRIER and EXTEND_ERR back to themselves.

Proposed Response **Response Status** W

Response generated by IEEE P802.3z PCS Sub-Task Force and accepted by motion by P802.3z Task Force on July 9,1997 in Maui, HI. Accepted per the suggested remedy.

Comment ID 208 **Topic**

Name Bob Noseworthy

Email ren@iol.unh.edu

Phone 603 862 4342

Fax 603 862 1915

Co. UNH InterOperability Lab

CI 36 **SC** 36.2.5.2.6 **P** 36.32 **L** 11

Comment Type T **Comment Status** A

Clarify meaning of the following shall statement:
 "Acquisition of synchronization shall insure the alignment of multi-code_group ordered_sets to even-numbered code_group boundaries."

Also, is this testable/observable, if so, add to PICS or remove shall.

SuggestedRemedy

Reword in the spirit of the following:
 "Aquisition of synchronization shall insure that the alignment of properly=received multi code_group ordered_sets occur on even-numbered code_group boundaries."

Proposed Response **Response Status** C

Response generated by IEEE P802.3z PCS Sub-Task Force and accepted by motion by P802.3z Task Force on July 9,1997 in Maui, HI. Agreed. An alternate remedy was selected as follows:
 In 36.2.5.2.6, line 11, replace "shall insure" with "insures".

P802.3z Draft 3.0 Comments

Comment ID	210	Topic	
Name	Bob Noseworthy		
Email	ren@iol.unh.edu		
Phone	603 862 4342		
Fax	603 862 1915		
Co.	UNH InterOperability Lab		

CI	36	SC	36.3.7	P	36.43	L	21
-----------	----	-----------	--------	----------	-------	----------	----

Comment Type	T	Comment Status	A
---------------------	---	-----------------------	---

Missing "shall" from PICS
 "A device shall be explicitly placed in Loopback mode (i.e., Loopback mode is not the normal mode of operation of a device)."

SuggestedRemedy

- Add PICS reference to 36.7.4.1.7 PMA functions
- Item - PMAx
- Feature - Loopback mode entry
- Subclause - 36.3.7
- Status - M
- Support - Yes[]
- Comment - must be explicitly set

Proposed Response **Response Status** C

Response generated by IEEE P802.3z PCS Sub-Task Force and accepted by motion by P802.3z Task Force on July 9,1997 in Maui, HI.
 Agreed. An alternate remedy was selected as follows:

In 36.3.7, page 36.42, line 53, change "Loopback mode shall be provided" to "Loopback mode shall be provided as specified in this subclause"

In line 54, change "shall be" to "are".

On page 36.43, line 21, change "shall be" to "is".

Comment ID	209	Topic	
Name	Bob Noseworthy		
Email	ren@iol.unh.edu		
Phone	603 862 4342		
Fax	603 862 1915		
Co.	UNH InterOperability Lab		

CI	36	SC	36.3.7	P	36.42	L	53
-----------	----	-----------	--------	----------	-------	----------	----

Comment Type	T	Comment Status	A
---------------------	---	-----------------------	---

Missing "shall" from PICS
 "Loopback mode shall be provided by the transmitter and receiver of a device= as a diagnostic test function to the device."

SuggestedRemedy

- Add PICS reference to 36.7.4.1.7 PMA functions
- Item - PMA6
- Feature - Loopback mode
- Subclause - 36.3.7
- Status - M
- Support - Yes[]
- Comment -

Proposed Response **Response Status** C

Response generated by IEEE P802.3z PCS Sub-Task Force and accepted by motion by P802.3z Task Force on July 9,1997 in Maui, HI.
 Accepted per suggested remedy.

P802.3z Draft 3.0 Comments

Comment ID 211 **Topic**
Name Bob Noseworthy
Email ren@iol.unh.edu
Phone 603 862 4342
Fax 603 862 1915
Co. UNH InterOperability Lab

CI 36 **SC** 36.3.7.1 **P** 36.43 **L** 30

Comment Type T **Comment Status** A

Missing "shall" in PICS
 "Under such conditions, decoded information shall not be presented by the receiver to the GMII until synchronization has been reestablished."

Also, why does this only apply to loopback mode? It seems this type of statement is necessary any time sync_status=3DFAIL.

SuggestedRemedy

Add PICS reference to 36.7.4.1.9 PMA receive functions
 Item - PRAX
 Feature - Loss of synchronization
 Subclause - 36.3.7.1
 Status - M
 Support - Yes[]
 Comment - data not presented to GMII in loopback mode

Proposed Response **Response Status** C

Response generated by IEEE P802.3z PCS Sub-Task Force and accepted by motion by P802.3z Task Force on July 9,1997 in Maui, HI.
 Agreed. An alternate remedy was selected as follows:
 In 36.3.7.1, delete the last sentence.

Comment ID 12 **Topic**
Name Bob Grow
Email bob@xlnt.com
Phone 619-487-9320
Fax 619-487-9768
Co. XLNT

CI 36 **SC** 36.5.1 **P** 36.44 **L**

Comment Type T **Comment Status** R

36.5.1 Should not be normative. The GMII is not an external interface, and therefore cannot be conformance tested. These delay numbers are for the clause 42 delay budget. Replace the paragraph with suggestion below.

SuggestedRemedy

The delay assumptions for 1000BASE-X PHYs are specified in table 36-9. This table applies for all 1000BASE-X PMDs.

Proposed Response **Response Status** W

Response generated by IEEE P802.3z PCS Sub-Task Force and accepted by motion by P802.3z Task Force on July 9,1997 in Maui, HI.
 In clause 35, the electrical characteristics are mandatory when the GMII is used. We agree with this. We do not see a difference between the delay constraints and the electrical characteristics and believe that both should be mandatory when the GMII is used. Rather than make 36.5.1 informative, we believe that 35.2.4 should be mandatory.

P802.3z Draft 3.0 Comments

Comment ID 21 **Topic**

Name Howie Johnson

Email howiej@sigcon.com

Phone 425 556 0800

Fax 425 881 6149

Co. Signal Consulting

CI 36 **SC** 36A.4 **P** 36A.2 **L** 51

Comment Type T **Comment Status** A

On P36A.3/L1 what is supposed to be the second data octet is erroneously labelled the "last byte of the modified RPAT".

SuggestedRemedy

Change line 51 to read:

DISPARITY FLIP: The first two octets of data in the continuous random test pattern packet

BE 5

Proposed Response **Response Status** W

Response generated by IEEE P802.3z PCS Sub-Task Force and accepted by motion by P802.3z Task Force on July 9,1997 in Maui, HI. Agreed. Replace text on page 36A.2, lines 51 through 55, and page 36.A3, lines 1 through 3, with the provided text.

Comment ID 20 **Topic**

Name Howie Johnson

Email howiej@sigcon.com

Phone 425 556 0800

Fax 425 881 6149

Co. Signal Consulting

CI 36 **SC** 36A.4 **P** 36A.2 **L** 44

Comment Type T **Comment Status** A

The math is wrong. Looks like a typo. 774 does not equal $2 + 12*64$, however, 774 does equal $2 + 12*64 + 4$

SuggestedRemedy

Delete closing parenthesis after the word sequence.
Add closing parenthesis at the end of the sentence (line 45).

Proposed Response **Response Status** W

Response generated by IEEE P802.3z PCS Sub-Task Force and accepted by motion by P802.3z Task Force on July 9,1997 in Maui, HI. Accepted in principle. The quantity 774 actually includes the FCS. The accepted change is to correct the quantity of data octets to 770.

Comment ID 200 **Topic**

Name Kevin Daines

Email kdaines@packetengines.com

Phone 509-922-9190

Fax 509-922-9185

Co. Packet Engines

CI 36 **SC** 36A.4 **P** 36A.2 **L** 49

Comment Type T **Comment Status** A

The start delimiter should be D5 and not 5D.

SuggestedRemedy

Change PREAMBLE/SFD of "5D" to "D5" in lines 32 and 49.

Proposed Response **Response Status** C

Response generated by IEEE P802.3z PCS Sub-Task Force and accepted by motion by P802.3z Task Force on July 9,1997 in Maui, HI. Accepted per suggested remedy.

P802.3z Draft 3.0 Comments

Comment ID 43 **Topic**
Name Arthur Low
Email alow@plaintree.com
Phone +1 613 831 8300
Fax +1 613 831 3283
Co. Plaintree Systems

CI 36 **SC** Fig 36-7b **P** 36.30 **L** 44

Comment Type T **Comment Status** R

For each error in the data stream, the receive PCS branches to state RX_DATA_ERROR where it sends a single data error to the PCS client, then returns to monitoring the receive stream. However, when an error occurs during extension, the receive PCS latches-up in state EXTEND_ERR. I believe that RX_DATA_ERROR represents the most appropriate model and that the operation of EXTEND_ERR would be improved if it was consistent with that model.

SuggestedRemedy

Remove the current exit conditions from state EXTEND_ERR. Add an arc from state EXTEND_ERR to state EPD2_CHECK_END on the condition SYNC_UNITDATA.indicate.

Proposed Response **Response Status** W

Response generated by IEEE P802.3z PCS Sub-Task Force and accepted by motion by P802.3z Task Force on July 9,1997 in Maui, HI. If it ain't broke, don't fix it.

Comment ID 8 **Topic**
Name Dalit Sagi
Email dalit.sagi@gpsemi.com
Phone 408-461-6243
Fax 408-4385576
Co. GEC Plessey semi

CI 36 **SC** fig 36-7b **P** 36.30 **L** 34

Comment Type T **Comment Status** A

if AN is disabled and the partner starts to send C codes the RCV state machine will be locked in C codes forever.

SuggestedRemedy

Add an arc from RCV_C_CODE state back to IDLE_K when an_enable =3D FALSE * SYNC_UNITDATA.indicate (/K28.5/*EVEN) so if AN disabled and the ANEG SM will stay inactive - the RCV will not stay in the C code state.

Proposed Response **Response Status** C

Response generated by IEEE P802.3z PCS Sub-Task Force and accepted by motion by P802.3z Task Force on July 9,1997 in Maui, HI. Agreed. Add a transition from state RCV_C_CODE to state IDLE_K on the condition that:

mr_an_enable =3D FALSE * SYNC_UNITDATA.indicate(/K28.5] * EVEN)

Comment ID 42 **Topic**
Name Scott Mason
Email smason@plaintree.com
Phone +1 613 831 8300
Fax +1 613 831 3283
Co. Plaintree Systems

CI 36 **SC** Fig 36-7b **P** 36.30 **L** 24

Comment Type T **Comment Status** A

Optimization.

The end delimiter can become corrupted. Also, the transmit PCS does not send an end delimiter when its client sends data immediately followed by carrier-extend error propagation.

When not bursting, the receive PCS recovers context following a missing or corrupted end delimiter by detecting the IDLE stream in the inter-frame gap. A similar capability can be provided during bursts by recognizing /R//R//R/ as the burst inter-frame gap fill. At all times, receiving /R//R//R/ without a preceding end delimiter is a clear indication that the end delimiter was missing or corrupted. Recovery on detection of /R//R//R/ would prevent single errors from affecting two frames of a burst.

SuggestedRemedy

In figure 36-7b, add a state EARLY_END_EXT. Add an arc from state RECEIVE to state EARLY_END_EXT under the condition check_end=3D/R//R//R/. In state EARLY_END_EXT, set RX_ER <=3D TRUE in order to signal a data error to the PCS client. Add an arc from state EARLY_END_EXT to state EPD2_CHECK_END under the condition SYNC_UNITDATA.indicate.

Proposed Response **Response Status** C

Response generated by IEEE P802.3z PCS Sub-Task Force and accepted by motion by P802.3z Task Force on July 9,1997 in Maui, HI. Agreed. Resolved per the resolution of comment 39.

Comment ID 203 **Topic**
Name Stephen Haddock
Email shaddock@extremenetworks.com
Phone 408 683 2812
Fax 408 342 0990
Co. Extreme Networks

CI 36 **SC** Tables 36-9 and **P** 36.44 **L** 35

Comment Type T **Comment Status** A

Contents of the tables do not reflect the full bit budget allocated to the PHY, and are inconsistent with the values used to calculate the maximum topologies in clause 41.

SuggestedRemedy

Contents of Table 36-9 "Max" column should be:
TX_EN sampled to MDI Output 128
MDI input to CRS assert 144
MDI input to CRS deassert 144
MDI input to COL assert 144
MDI input to COL deassert 144
TX_EN sampled to CRS assert 16
TX_EN sampled to CRS deassert 16

Table 36-9 "Min" column should be blank (remove question marks).

Contents of Table 36-10 "Max" column should be:
MAC transmit start to MDI output 184
MDI input to MDI output 440
(worst case nondeferred transmit)
MDI input to collision detect 240
MDI input to MDI output Jam 440
(worst case collision response)

Proposed Response **Response Status** C

Response generated by IEEE P802.3z PCS Sub-Task Force and accepted by motion by P802.3z Task Force on July 9,1997 in Maui, HI. Accepted per suggested remedy.

P802.3z Draft 3.0 Comments

Comment ID 114 **Topic**
Name Steve Dreyer
Email sdreyer@seeq.com
Phone
Fax
Co. Seeq Technology

CI 36 **SC** 36.1.7 **P** 36.4 **L** 45

Comment Type E **Comment Status** A

Reference Clause 14.2.3.2 is not in 802.3u.

SuggestedRemedy

Replace "802.3u" with "802.3"

Proposed Response

Response Status W

Response generated by IEEE P802.3z PCS Sub-Task Force and accepted by motion by P802.3z Task Force on July 9,1997 in Maui, HI. Accepted per suggested remedy.

Comment ID 116 **Topic**
Name Steve Dreyer
Email sdreyer@seeq.com
Phone
Fax
Co. Seeq Technology

CI 36 **SC** 36.2.4.7 **P** 36.9 **L** 42-45

Comment Type E **Comment Status** A

Statement that "all other undefined ordered_sets may result in a false carrier..." is misleading. False carrier is a specific case where a device is in idle and gets a non-idle codeword that is not an /S/. This paragraph is talking about what happens when a k28.5 is followed by an invalid codeword, which is really nothing or little to do with false carrier.

SuggestedRemedy

Delete sentence starting with "All other undefined ordered set may result in false carrier...." or reword.

Proposed Response

Response Status W

Response generated by IEEE P802.3z PCS Sub-Task Force and accepted by motion by P802.3z Task Force on July 9,1997 in Maui, HI. Agreed. The following changes are made:

Delete the second paragraph of 36.2.4.7.

Add to the end of 36.2.4.12 the following sentence:

"An ordered set which consists of two code_groups, the first of which is /K28.5/ and the second of which is a data code_group other than /D21.5/ or /D2.2/, shall be treated as an /I/ ordered_set."

Changed 36.7.4.1.4 PICS entry OS1 to reference 36.2.4.12 instead of 36.2.4.7.

P802.3z Draft 3.0 Comments

Comment ID 117 **Topic**
Name Steve Dreyer
Email sdreyer@seeq.com
Phone
Fax
Co. Seeq Technology

CI 36 **SC** 36.2.4.9 **P** 36.15 **L** 47-55

Comment Type E **Comment Status** A

Second paragraph points out that a comma code can be generated across word boundaries with a /K28.7/ + /other specific codes/. While this statement is true, it is misleading/confusing because the Clause 36 protocol wants to avoid such a situation for synchronization reasons.

SuggestedRemedy

Either delete paragraph in Lines 52-55 or add a sentence to the end stating that "A comma across the boundaries of any two adjacent code_groups will cause loss of synchronizaition, so ordered_sets which produce this result are not allowed."

Proposed Response **Response Status** W

Response generated by IEEE P802.3z PCS Sub-Task Force and accepted by motion by P802.3z Task Force on July 9,1997 in Maui, HI. Agreed. Add the following sentence to the end of the last paragraph of 36.2.4.9:

"A comma across the boundaries of any two adjacent code_groups may cause code_group realignment (see 36.3.2.4)."

Comment ID 118 **Topic**
Name Steve Dreyer
Email sdreyer@seeq.com
Phone
Fax
Co. Seeq Technology

CI 36 **SC** 36.2.5.1.3 **P** 36.22 **L** 30

Comment Type E **Comment Status** A

Replace "rx_Config_Reg" with "rx_Config_Reg<D15:D0>".

SuggestedRemedy

Proposed Response **Response Status** W

Response generated by IEEE P802.3z PCS Sub-Task Force and accepted by motion by P802.3z Task Force on July 9,1997 in Maui, HI. Agreed. Corrected per comment text.

Comment ID 212 **Topic**
Name Rich Taborek
Email rich_taborek@amdahl.com
Phone 408-746-6533
Fax 408-746-7000
Co. Amdahl Corporation

CI 36 **SC** 36.2.5.2.2, figure **P** 36.30 **L**

Comment Type E **Comment Status** A

Simplify the transition condition from state EPD_CHECK_END to EXTEND_ERR to="ELSE"

SuggestedRemedy

Simplify the transition condition from state EPD_CHECK_END to EXTEND_ERR to="ELSE"

Proposed Response **Response Status** C

Response generated by IEEE P802.3z PCS Sub-Task Force and accepted by motion by P802.3z Task Force on July 9,1997 in Maui, HI. Accepted per the suggested remedy.

P802.3z Draft 3.0 Comments

Comment ID	202	Topic
Name	Ben Brown=09	
Email	bbrown@ctron.com	
Phone	1 603 337 5025	
Fax	1 603 337 5207	
Co.	Cabletron Systems	

CI 36 SC 36.2.5.2.6 P 33 L 31

Comment Type E **Comment Status** A

The 2_good_cgs is not well specified. Also, the 2_good_cgs needs to be 4_good_cgs to detect misaligned /C/.

SuggestedRemedy

Delete the function 2_good_cgs from figure 36-9 and 36.2.5.1.4.
 In 36.2.5.2.6, lines 14 and 15, replace "two using the 2_good_cgs function" with "four code_groups".
 Delete all transitions on 2_good_cgs.
 Add new counter subclause and to it, new counter good_cgs.
 To figure 36.9 add the states: SYNC_ACQUIRED_2A, SYNC_ACQUIRED_3A, and SYNC_ACQUIRED_4A.
 Add a transition from state SYNC_ACQUIRED_2A to state SYNC_ACQUIRED_3 on the condition:

```
PMA_UNITDATA.indicate *
(
  rx_code_group =3D /COMMA/ * rx_even =3D TRUE +
  rx_code_group =3D /INVALID/
)
```

 Add a transition from state SYNC_ACQUIRED_2A to state SYNC_ACQUIRED_1 on the condition:

```
PMA_UNITDATA.indicate * good_cgs =3D 3 *
not (
  rx_code_group =3D /COMMA/ * rx_even =3D TRUE +
  rx_code_group =3D /INVALID/
)
```

 Add a transition from state SYNC_ACQUIRED_2A to state SYNC_ACQUIRED_2A on the condition ELSE.
 Add a transition from state SYNC_ACQUIRED2 to state SYNC_ACQUIRED_2A on the condition ELSE.
 In state SYNC_ACQUIRED_2, add an assignment good_cgs <=3D 0.
 In state SYNC_ACQUIRED_2A, add the assignments good_cgs <=3D good_cgs + 1=
 and
 rx_even <=3D !rx_even.
 In state SYNC_ACQUIRED_2A, add the message SYNC_UNITDATA.indicate.
 Add a transition from state SYNC_ACQUIRED_3A to state SYNC_ACQUIRED_4 on the condition:

```
PMA_UNITDATA.indicate *
(
  rx_code_group =3D /COMMA/ * rx_even =3D TRUE +
```

```
rx_code_group =3D /INVALID/
)
```

Add a transition from state SYNC_ACQUIRED_3A to state SYNC_ACQUIRED_2 on the condition:

```
PMA_UNITDATA.indicate * good_cgs =3D 3 *
not (
  rx_code_group =3D /COMMA/ * rx_even =3D TRUE +
  rx_code_group =3D /INVALID/
)
```

 Add a transition from state SYNC_ACQUIRED_3A to state SYNC_ACQUIRED_3A on the condition ELSE.
 Add a transition from state SYNC_ACQUIRED3 to state SYNC_ACQUIRED_3A on the condition ELSE.
 In state SYNC_ACQUIRED_3, add an assignment good_cgs <=3D 0.
 In state SYNC_ACQUIRED_3A, add the assignments good_cgs <=3D good_cgs + 1=
 and
 rx_even <=3D !rx_even.
 In state SYNC_ACQUIRED_3A, add the message SYNC_UNITDATA.indicate.
 Add a transition from state SYNC_ACQUIRED_4A to state LOSS_OF_SYNC on the condition:

```
PMA_UNITDATA.indicate *
(
  rx_code_group =3D /COMMA/ * rx_even =3D TRUE +
  rx_code_group =3D /INVALID/
)
```

 Add a transition from state SYNC_ACQUIRED_4A to state SYNC_ACQUIRED_3 on the condition:

```
PMA_UNITDATA.indicate * good_cgs =3D 3 *
not (
  rx_code_group =3D /COMMA/ * rx_even =3D TRUE +
  rx_code_group =3D /INVALID/
)
```

 Add a transition from state SYNC_ACQUIRED_4A to state SYNC_ACQUIRED_4A on the condition ELSE.
 Add a transition from state SYNC_ACQUIRED4 to state SYNC_ACQUIRED_4A on the condition ELSE.
 In state SYNC_ACQUIRED_4, add an assignment good_cgs <=3D 0.
 In state SYNC_ACQUIRED_4A, add the assignments good_cgs <=3D good_cgs + 1=
 and
 rx_even <=3D !rx_even.
 In state SYNC_ACQUIRED_4A, add the message SYNC_UNITDATA.indicate.

Proposed Response **Response Status** C

Response generated by IEEE P802.3z PCS Sub-Task Force and accepted by motion by P802.3z Task Force on July 9,1997 in Maui, HI.
 Accepted per suggested remedy.

P802.3z Draft 3.0 Comments

Comment ID 207 **Topic**
Name Bob Noseworthy
Email ren@iol.unh.edu
Phone 603 862 4342
Fax 603 862 1915
Co. UNH InterOperability Lab

CI 36 **SC** 36.2.5.2.6 **P** 36.32 **L** 16

Comment Type E **Comment Status** A

Redundant "shall": identical to statement on line 3

"The PCS shall implement the Synchronization process as depicted in figure 36-9 including compliance with the associated state variables as specified in 36.2.5.1."

SuggestedRemedy

strike sentence on line 16 quoted above.

modify line 3 to read:

"The PCS shall implement the Synchronization process as depicted in figure=

36-9 including compliance with the associated state variables as specified in 36.2.5.1."

Proposed Response **Response Status** C

Response generated by IEEE P802.3z PCS Sub-Task Force and accepted by motion by P802.3z Task Force on July 9,1997 in Maui, HI. Agreed. An alternate remedy was selected as follows:

In 36.2.5.2.6, delete the first sentence in the first paragraph and move the last sentence to become the first sentence.

In line 11, replace "shall enter" with "enters".

Comment ID 214 **Topic**
Name Rich Taborek
Email rich_taborek@amdahl.com
Phone 408-746-6533
Fax 408-746-7000
Co. Amdahl Corporation

CI 36 **SC** 36.3.1.5, figure 3 **P** 36.30 **L**

Comment Type E **Comment Status** A

Remove extraneous term "mr_page_rx <=3D FALSE" from states AN_RESTART and ABILITY_DETECT.

SuggestedRemedy

Remove extraneous term "mr_page_rx <=3D FALSE" from states AN_RESTART and ABILITY_DETECT.

Proposed Response **Response Status** C

Response generated by IEEE P802.3z PCS Sub-Task Force and accepted by motion by P802.3z Task Force on July 9,1997 in Maui, HI. Accepted per the suggested remedy.

Comment ID 201 **Topic**
Name John Wolcott=09
Email john_wolcott@ccm.jf.intel.com
Phone 1 503 264 9167
Fax 1 503 264 9903
Co. Intel

CI 36 **SC** 36A.1 **P** 36A.1 **L** 31

Comment Type E **Comment Status** A

There are two periods at the end of the line.

SuggestedRemedy

Strike the redundant period.

Proposed Response **Response Status** C

Response generated by IEEE P802.3z PCS Sub-Task Force and accepted by motion by P802.3z Task Force on July 9,1997 in Maui, HI. Accepted per suggested remedy.