

P802.3z Draft 3.0 Comments

Comment ID 119 **Topic**
Name Steve Dreyer
Email sdreyer@seeq.com
Phone
Fax
Co. Seeq Technology

CI 37 **SC** 37.2.1.3 **P** 37.5 **L** 46-47

Comment Type TR **Comment Status** R

The current definition for the PAUSE=3D1, ASM-DIR=3D1 case can cause an erroneous result. For example, a NIC may want to receive Pause frames but not send them. To do this, according to Table 37-5, the NIC would have to set Pause=3D1, ASM_DIR=3D1. This can produce a wrong result if the remote=link partner also sends a 11, because then the NIC would be forced to enable both receive and transmit Pause, something it doesn't want to do for system reasons. The problem is due to defining the PAUSE=3D1, ASM_DIR=3D1= in Table 35-2 to cover both symmetric and receive pause, instead of just receive pause only.

Suggested Remedy

Change capability for PAUSE=3D1, ASM_DIR=3D1 to "Asymmetric PAUSE toward=local device". Change Table 37-5 results to reflect this new definition.

Proposed Response **Response Status** W

Response generated by IEEE P802.3z PCS Sub-Task Force and accepted by motion by P802.3z Task Force on July 9, 1997 in Maui, HI. Rejected. No node is forced to send pause frames. For this application, symmetric pause and asymmetric pause toward local device are equivalent. See table 37-2.

Comment ID 121 **Topic**
Name Steve Dreyer
Email sdreyer@seeq.com
Phone
Fax
Co. Seeq Technology

CI 37 **SC** 37.2.6.1.1 **P** 37.14 **L** 14-17

Comment Type TR **Comment Status** R

This paragraph seems to say that when a device has Autonegotiation disabled, the base page in Register 5 would control the operational modes that the device should be in (Full/Half Duplex, Pause, Offline etc.). However, Clause 22 says on P. 22.4, L18-25 (of D3) that Register 0 controls the operation of full and half duplex when AutoNegotiation is off. = This seems to be a conflict.

It would make sense to follow the old Fast Ethernet way (Register 0 rules when AutNeg=3Ddisabled), but Register 0 doesn't contain all the necessary bits for gigabit, such as PAUSE, ASYM_DIR, RF (Offline), and any new bits that will be defined later.

Suggested Remedy

Open for discussion.

Proposed Response **Response Status** W

Response generated by IEEE P802.3z PCS Sub-Task Force and accepted by motion by P802.3z Task Force on July 9, 1997 in Maui, HI.

No consensus reached on the issue of Manual Configuration. This comment will be re-submitted as a P802.3z Working Group ballot comment by the P802.3z PCS Sub-Task Force editor, Rich Taborek.

P802.3z Draft 3.0 Comments

Comment ID	13	Topic
Name	Devendra Tripathi	
Email	devendra.tripathi@xaqti.com	
Phone	+1 408 487-0806	
Fax	+1 408 487-0801	
Co.	XaQti Corporation	

CI 37 SC P 14,15,25 L

Comment Type T **Comment Status** R

1. The bit 11 (15:0 convention) of 37-6 (advertisement register) is marked as reserved. This bit is the source of the toggle bit of the first next page register. (The subsequent ones are invert of previous ones.)
2. The bit 11 (15:0 convention) of 37-7 (link partner ability register) is marked as reserved. This bit is the source of the toggle bit of the first next page register of the link partner.
3. The time 10 ms for link timer done was defined such that if link partner re-starts the autonegotiation, the base register saved for long enough time that the host may be able to read it via MDC-MDIO interface. Also it was going to provide long time so that both link partners may get in sync before auto-negotiation data transfer starts. During the remaining part of the transaction, this condition does not hold good because of hand shake nature of the protocol. In spite of that we kept the same link_timer_done in the branch from COMPLETE_ACK to NEXT_PAGE_WAIT for the sake of simplicity and to avoid another timer. This proves to be very costly from simulation and debugging point of view. We see a few quick pulses and then long gap. Please note that the use of same timer just simplifies the documentation because in implementation same timer can any way used for smaller duration. Also in clause 28, the corresponding requirement was 6-8 cycles only.
4. The "INVALID" condition in the main branch leading to AN_ENABLE state makes the state machine too delicate. Given that autonegotiation process is lengthy and elaborate one it is not advisable to trigger it based on some single bit errors. Since sync_status variable is already there to take care of invalid codes and since invalid codes will not be used for any any state transitions, it can be easily removed.

Suggested Remedy

1. The bit 11 (15:0 convention) of 37-6 table should be named as toggle bit and it should be a read write bit.
2. The bit 11 (15:0 convention) of table 37-7 should be named as toggle bit and it should be a read only bit.
3. I propose to replace, in the branch from COMPLETE_ACK to NEXT_PAGE_WAIT, the term link_timer_done by "ack_finished" (as was in D2.1) and defined ack_finished as a variable which becomes true after remaining 8-16

acknowledge cycles are over. The implementer can easily map this requirement into timer.

4. Remove the "INVALID" condition from the main branch entering the state AN_ENABLE.

Proposed Response **Response Status** W

Response generated by IEEE P802.3z PCS Sub-Task Force and accepted by motion by P802.3z Task Force on July 9,1997 in Maui, HI.

1. Rejected. Operation is identical to clause 28. The toggle bit is derived from a reserved bit. Correct operation is assured for either value of the bit. Operation is adequately described by the text.
2. Rejected. Operation is identical to clause 28. The toggle bit is derived from a reserved bit. Correct operation is assured for either value of the bit. Operation is adequately described by the text.
3. Rejected. Timer issues were resolved and timers accepted by motion at Ft. Lauderdale interim.
4. Rejected. Without the INVALID message, invalid code_groups would not be detected by the auto-negotiation function. The current operation allows auto-negotiation to complete even in the presence of a high bit error rate, relative to required bit error rate.

Type: TR/technical required T/technical E/editorial
 Comment: X/received D/dispatched for consideration A/accepted R/rejected
 Response: O/open W/written S/sent to commentor for review C/closed U/unsatisfied Z/withdrawn

P802.3z Draft 3.0 Comments

Comment ID 1 **Topic**

Name Benjamin Brown

Email bbrown@ctron.com

Phone +1 603 337 5025

Fax +1 603 337 5208

Co. Cabletron Systems

CI 37 **SC** 37 **P** 43D **L** Fig. 37-6

Comment Type T **Comment Status** A

The variable rx_Config_Reg is used in state COMPLETE_ACKNOWLEDGE for several different purposes. All of these purposes, except one, should use the value of rx_Config_Reg which was valid with acknowledge_match. The exception is the transition to state AN_ENABLE. This transition should use the current value of rx_Config_Reg.

SuggestedRemedy

Create a new variable, np_rx, which is assigned a value upon entry to state COMPLETE ACKNOWLEDGE, the same way the variable toggle_rx is assigned, but using bit 15 rather than 11. Then use this new variable in the transitions to states NEXT_PAGE_WAIT and IDLE_DETECT, instead of the variable rx_Config_Reg<NP>. This way, rx_Config_Reg can always contain a current value and the toggle_rx and np_rx variables will hold values associated with the acknowledge_match,

Proposed Response **Response Status** C

Response generated by IEEE P802.3z PCS Sub-Task Force and accepted by motion by P802.3z Task Force on July 9,1997 in Maui, HI. Agreed. The following changes are made:

Add a new variable, np_rx to 37.3.1.

In 37.3.1.5, figure 37-6, state COMPLETE_ACKNOWLEDGE, add an assignment=
 np_rx <=3D
 rx_Config_Reg<NP> Change the transition from state COMPLETE_ACKNOWLEDGE to state IDLE_DETECT to become the condition:
 link_timer_done * tx_Config_Reg<NP> =3D 0 * np_rx =3D 0

Change the transition from state COMPLETE_ACKNOWLEDGE to state NEXT_PAGE_WAIT to become the condition:
 link_timer_done * mr_np_loaded=3DTRUE * (tx_Config_Reg<NP>=3D1 + np_rx=3D1=
)

Comment ID 53 **Topic**

Name Bob Noseworthy=09

Email ren@iol.unh.edu

Phone 1 603 862 4342

Fax 1 603 862 1915

Co. UNH InterOperability Lab

CI 37 **SC** 37.1.4.2.2, **P** 37.4, 37. **L**

Comment Type T **Comment Status** R

Table 37-9 on page 37.17 defines Clause 37 - Manual Configuration as bits 0.12 and 0.5 both being set to 0.

37.1.4.2.2 states that Manual Configuration is "recommended" if GMII Management is not present.

But, the PICS in 37.5.3.1 list Manual Configuration as Optional. It would appear to be mandatory, at least if GMII Management is in use.

SuggestedRemedy

Make support for Manual Configuration Mandatory, or at least, Mandatory if GMII Management is present.

Proposed Response **Response Status** C

Response generated by IEEE P802.3z PCS Sub-Task Force and accepted by motion by P802.3z Task Force on July 9,1997 in Maui, HI.

No consensus reached on the issue of Manual Configuration. This comment will be re-submitted as a P802.3z Working Group ballot comment by the P802.3z PCS Sub-Task Force editor, Rich Taborek.

P802.3z Draft 3.0 Comments

Comment ID 49 **Topic**
Name Bob Noseworthy=09
Email ren@iol.unh.edu
Phone 1 603 862 4342
Fax 1 603 862 1915
Co. UNH InterOperability Lab

CI 37 **SC** 37.2.1.4.3 **P** 37.7 **L** 3,4

Comment Type T **Comment Status** R
 How can a remote fault indication of Link_Failure ever be transmitted?
 Upon detection of sync_status=3DFAIL, AN will reset and send
 tx_Config_Reg<D15:D0>=3D0. Thus, a non-zero Config Reg can only be sent=
 once
 sync_status=3DOK and link_timer has expired.

SuggestedRemedy
 Allow a remote fault indication to be sent during the AN_ENABLE and
 AN_RESTART states. ie: change the Config Reg setting to
 tx_Config_Reg<D15:D14>=3D0 and tx_Config_Reg<D11:D0>=3D0
 This may also require all ability_match=3DTRUE*rx_Config_Reg<D15:D0>=3D0 to=
 be
 changed as well.

Proposed Response **Response Status** C
 Response generated by IEEE P802.3z PCS Sub-Task Force and accepted by
 motion by P802.3z Task Force on July 9,1997 in Maui, HI.
 Rejected. Replace the text of 37.2.1.4.3 with:

 "A Remote Fault encoding of 0b10 indicates that the local device has=
 detected
 a Link_Failure condition indicated by loss of synchronizaton. While
 sync_status =3D FAIL, remote fault information is not signalled. When
 sync_state becomes TRUE, stored remote fault information is signalled."

Comment ID 4 **Topic**
Name Bob Noseworthy
Email ren@iol.unh.edu
Phone 603-862-4342
Fax 603-862-1915
Co. UNH InterOperability Lab

CI 37 **SC** 37.2.3.3 **P** 37.10 **L** 40-44

Comment Type T **Comment Status** R
 The Selector Field is referenced but never defined.

SuggestedRemedy
 strike all references to Selector Field and reference annex 28C for
 definition of Message Codes

Proposed Response **Response Status** Z
 Withdrawn.

P802.3z Draft 3.0 Comments

Comment ID 48 **Topic**
Name Bob Noseworthy=09
Email ren@iol.unh.edu
Phone 1 603 862 4342
Fax 1 603 862 1915
Co. UNH InterOperability Lab

CI 37 **SC** 37.2.6 **P** 37.13 **L** 43, 44

Comment Type T **Comment Status** R

"Where no physical embodiment of the GMII exists, an equivalent to management registers 0,1,4,5,6,7,8 and 15 are recommended to be provided." The problem, as I see it, is that there are several cases where specific management registers are referenced for mandatory behavior (Aneg complete bit 1.5 // AN Next Page // etc)

SuggestedRemedy

replace "are recommended to be provided." to "shall be provided", I see this as a necessity for testing purposes as the meaning of, and access to, "bit 1.5", and any other management register, would then be consistent across any implementation

alternative remedy - convert all references to management functionality to an appropriate Optional reference

Proposed Response **Response Status** C

Response generated by IEEE P802.3z PCS Sub-Task Force and accepted by motion by P802.3z Task Force on July 9,1997 in Maui, HI.

No consensus reached on the issue of Manual Configuration. This comment will be re-submitted as a P802.3z Working Group ballot comment by the P802.3z PCS Sub-Task Force editor, Rich Taborek.

Comment ID 9 **Topic**
Name Howard Frazier
Email hfrazier@cisco.com
Phone +1 408 527 7607
Fax +1 408 527 8254
Co. Cisco Systems

CI 37 **SC** 37.3.1.5 **P** 37.25 **L** 8

Comment Type T **Comment Status** A

I believe that a single bit error can cause a loss of synchronization, which will cause the Auto-Negotiation state machine to transition to AN_ENABLE, which will restart Auto-Negotiation. This will have the effect of destroying additional packets beyond the packet which encountered the single bit error.

The problem arises because a single bit error can result in an arbitrarily long sequence of disparity errors, and such a sequence will result in a transition to the LOSS_OF_SYNC state in the synchronization state diagram. Synchronization may not be re-acquired until the next inter-packet gap interval. This behavior is expected, and it is known that this sequence of events can occur. I have identified several patterns which can cause this when a single bit error is introduced.

The delimiters, IDLE sequences, and coding rules for Fibre Channel and Gigabit Ethernet have been chosen such that a single bit error should not corrupt more than one packet. Unfortunately, the behavior of the Auto-Negotiation state machine makes it a near certainty that a loss of synchronization will cause the loss of multiple packets.

SuggestedRemedy

I suggest the addition of a timer to the transition conditions which restart Auto-Negotiation. Note that such a timer was actually employed in D1, but was deleted as a result of Motion #6 during the closing session at the San Diego meeting. The use of a timer will eliminate the "hair trigger" response of Auto-Negotiation to a single bit error.

Specifically, I suggest that sync_status=3DFail be qualified by a timer or counter which will ensure that the condition sync_status=3DFail persists for at least the maximum duration of a burst of packets before this condition is used to restart Auto-Negotiation. The minimum duration would be 78 microseconds. For the sake of implementation convenience, the link_timer, which has a duration of 10 (+10/-0) milliseconds could be used. This would ensure that the link was truly broken before Auto-Negotiation was restarted.

One way to accomplish this in the standard is to create a new variable, called an_sync_status, which could have the following

P802.3z Draft 3.0 Comments

definition:

an_sync_status

Qualified version of sync_status for use by Auto-Negotiation

Values: TRUE when the variable sync_status defined in 36.2.5.1.3 is TRUE.
FALSE when the variable sync_status defined in 36.2.5.1.3 is FALSE for a duration of greater than or equal to link_timer.

My observation is that this essentially represents a re-triggerable watch-dog timer which will re-start Auto-Negotiation whenever the link dies.

Proposed Response **Response Status** C

Response generated by IEEE P802.3z PCS Sub-Task Force and accepted by motion by P802.3z Task Force on July 9,1997 in Maui, HI. Agreed. The following changes are made:

Add the specified variable an_sync_status to 37.3.1 defined as follows:

an_sync_status

Qualified version of sync_status for use by Auto-Negotiation to detect a sync_status timeout condition.

Values: TRUE; The variable sync_status defined in 36.2.5.1.3 is TRUE.
FALSE; The variable sync_status defined in 36.2.5.1.3 is FALSE for a duration of greater than or equal to link_timer.

In 37.3.1.5, figure 37-6, replace the condition sync_status =3D FAIL with= the condition
an_sync_status =3D FALSE in the global entry to state AN_ENABLE.

	Comment ID	50	Topic	
	Name	Bob Noseworthy=09		
	Email	ren@iol.unh.edu		
	Phone	1 603 862 4342		
	Fax	1 603 862 1915		
	Co.	UNH InterOperability Lab		
CI	37	SC 37.5.3.1, 37	P 37.27, 37	L
	Comment Type	T	Comment Status	R
	Remote fault functionality is not included in PICS			
	SuggestedRemedy			
	Editors Note: Please add a suggested remedy.			
	Proposed Response		Response Status	C
	Response generated by IEEE P802.3z PCS Sub-Task Force and accepted by motion by P802.3z Task Force on July 9,1997 in Maui, HI. IEEE P802.3z PCS Sub-Task Force allotted comment resolution time expired prior to the resolution of this comment. This comment will be re-submitted as a P802.3z Working Group ballot comment by the P802.3z PCS Sub-Task Force editor, Rich Taborek.			

	Comment ID	58	Topic	
	Name	Bob Noseworthy=09		
	Email	ren@iol.unh.edu		
	Phone	1 603 862 4342		
	Fax	1 603 862 1915		
	Co.	UNH InterOperability Lab		
CI	37	SC 37.5.3.2.1,	P 37.28	L 17, 32
	Comment Type	T	Comment Status	R
	CR4 and TX3 appear to reference the same functionality, which is covered in AN8, the Auto-Negotiation state diagram.			
	SuggestedRemedy			
	strike CR4 or TX3, or both.			
	Proposed Response		Response Status	C
	Response generated by IEEE P802.3z PCS Sub-Task Force and accepted by motion by P802.3z Task Force on July 9,1997 in Maui, HI. IEEE P802.3z PCS Sub-Task Force allotted comment resolution time expired prior to the resolution of this comment. This comment will be re-submitted as a P802.3z Working Group ballot comment by the P802.3z PCS Sub-Task Force editor, Rich Taborek.			

P802.3z Draft 3.0 Comments

Comment ID 55 **Topic**

Name Bob Noseworthy=09

Email ren@iol.unh.edu

Phone 1 603 862 4342

Fax 1 603 862 1915

Co. UNH InterOperability Lab

CI 37 **SC** 37.5.3.2.6, **P** 37.29, 37 **L**

Comment Type T **Comment Status** R

In CR6 - The Next Page bit will be set for as long as the station has next pages to transmit, not just for a duration of link_timer.

The functionality referenced in CR6 is covered in AN8 - Auto-Negotiation state diagram

Similarly for CR5, the functionality referenced is covered in AN8

SuggestedRemedy
strike Item CR5 and CR6

Proposed Response **Response Status** C

Response generated by IEEE P802.3z PCS Sub-Task Force and accepted by motion by P802.3z Task Force on July 9,1997 in Maui, HI. IEEE P802.3z PCS Sub-Task Force allotted comment resolution time expired prior to the resolution of this comment. This comment will be re-submitted as a P802.3z Working Group ballot comment by the P802.3z PCS Sub-Task Force editor, Rich Taborek.

Comment ID 56 **Topic**

Name Bob Noseworthy=09

Email ren@iol.unh.edu

Phone 1 603 862 4342

Fax 1 603 862 1915

Co. UNH InterOperability Lab

CI 37 **SC** 37.5.3.2.7 **P** 37.30 **L** 6

Comment Type T **Comment Status** R

MR1 "Register Usage", the comment specifies that "Eight dedicated registers" must be used. I do not see how the presence of 8 distinct registers can be externally verified.

SuggestedRemedy
Strike, or restate the comment as "Management Registers 0,1,4,5,6,7,8 and=15 are accessible"

Proposed Response **Response Status** C

Response generated by IEEE P802.3z PCS Sub-Task Force and accepted by motion by P802.3z Task Force on July 9,1997 in Maui, HI. IEEE P802.3z PCS Sub-Task Force allotted comment resolution time expired prior to the resolution of this comment. This comment will be re-submitted as a P802.3z Working Group ballot comment by the P802.3z PCS Sub-Task Force editor, Rich Taborek.

Comment ID 51 **Topic**

Name Bob Noseworthy=09

Email ren@iol.unh.edu

Phone 1 603 862 1915

Fax 1 603 862 1915

Co. UNH InterOperability Lab

CI 37 **SC** 37.2.1.4.3 **P** 37.7 **L** 4

Comment Type E **Comment Status** A

Incorrect reference to 36.2.6.2.2

SuggestedRemedy
Change reference to 36.2.5.2.6 "Synchronization" or 36.2.5.1.3 "Variables"

Proposed Response **Response Status** C

Response generated by IEEE P802.3z PCS Sub-Task Force and accepted by motion by P802.3z Task Force on July 9,1997 in Maui, HI. Agreed. Change to refer to both see 36.2.5.1.3 and 36.2.5.2.6.

P802.3z Draft 3.0 Comments

Comment ID 3 **Topic**

Name Bob Noseworthy

Email ren@iol.unh.edu

Phone 603-862-4342

Fax 603-862-1915

Co. UNH InterOperability Lab

CI 37 **SC** 37.2.3.3.6 **P** 37.12 **L** 9,10

Comment Type E **Comment Status** R

clarify definition by adding reference to bit D11

SuggestedRemedy

logic zero =3D previous value of bit D11 of transmitted Config_Reg value equalled logic one.

logic one =3D previous value of bit D11 of the transmitted Config_Reg value equalled logic zero.

Proposed Response **Response Status** Z

Withdrawn.

Comment ID 215 **Topic**

Name Rich Taborek

Email rich_taborek@amdahl.com

Phone 408-746-6533

Fax 408-746-7000

Co. Amdahl Corporation

CI 37 **SC** 37.2.4.1 **P** 37.9 **L** 11

Comment Type E **Comment Status** A

Extraneous =D2and the=D3 in the first sentence

SuggestedRemedy

Remove extraneous =D2and the=D3 from the first sentence

Proposed Response **Response Status** C

Response generated by IEEE P802.3z PCS Sub-Task Force and accepted by motion by P802.3z Task Force on July 9,1997 in Maui, HI.

Accepted per the suggested remedy.

Comment ID 120 **Topic**

Name Steve Dreyer

Email sdreyer@seeq.com

Phone

Fax

Co. Seeq Technology

CI 37 **SC** 37.2.5.3.1 **P** 37.11 **L** 39-51

Comment Type E **Comment Status** A

Figures 37-3 and 37-4 have extra vertical lines in the wrong places.

SuggestedRemedy

Proposed Response **Response Status** W

Response generated by IEEE P802.3z PCS Sub-Task Force and accepted by motion by P802.3z Task Force on July 9,1997 in Maui, HI.

Only the mailed copies exhibit this error. Figure 37-2 is also affected.

This problem has been verified to not exist in the source files and online PDF files.

Comment ID 213 **Topic**

Name Rich Taborek

Email rich_taborek@amdahl.com

Phone 408-746-6533

Fax 408-746-7000

Co. Amdahl Corporation

CI 37 **SC** 37.2.6.1.1, 37.2.6 **P** 37.14, 37 **L**

Comment Type E **Comment Status** A

Incorrect cross references to Clause 35 management registers.

SuggestedRemedy

Corrected cross references to Clause 22 management registers which= previously referenced Clause 35.

Proposed Response **Response Status** C

Response generated by IEEE P802.3z PCS Sub-Task Force and accepted by motion by P802.3z Task Force on July 9,1997 in Maui, HI.

Accepted per the suggested remedy.

P802.3z Draft 3.0 Comments

Comment ID 54 **Topic**
Name Bob Noseworthy=09
Email ren@iol.unh.edu
Phone 1 603 862 4342
Fax 1 603 862 1915
Co. UNH InterOperability Lab

CI 37 **SC** 37.5.3.1, 37 **P** 37.27, 37 **L**
Comment Type E **Comment Status** A
 In the PICS, Items CC4 and MR5 are duplicates

SuggestedRemedy
 strike one.

Proposed Response **Response Status** C
 Response generated by IEEE P802.3z PCS Sub-Task Force and accepted by motion by P802.3z Task Force on July 9,1997 in Maui, HI. Agreed. The following changes are made:

 In 37.5.3.1, change item CC4 to become mandatory.

 In 37.3.5.2.7, delete item MR5.

Comment ID 52 **Topic**
Name Bob Noseworthy=09
Email ren@iol.unh.edu
Phone 1 603 862 4342
Fax 1 603 862 1915
Co. UNH InterOperability Lab

CI 37 **SC** 37.5.3.2 **P** 37.27 **L** 37,38
Comment Type E **Comment Status** A
 AN6 - Management Registers requirements is a duplicate of Item MR2
 AN7 should be listed under 37.5.3.2.7 Management Registers

SuggestedRemedy
 Change Item to "Management Register Support", Mandatory (??), and correct item numbering error. This may be a duplicate of CC2 however, in which case, strike AN6.

 Move current Item AN7 to Management Registers, and correct subclause reference (should be 37.2.6.1.4)

Proposed Response **Response Status** C
 Response generated by IEEE P802.3z PCS Sub-Task Force and accepted by motion by P802.3z Task Force on July 9,1997 in Maui, HI. Agreed. The following changes are made:

 In 37.2.5.3.12, line 35, change "shall hold" to "holds".

 In 37.5.3.2.7, delete item MR2.

Comment ID 59 **Topic**
Name Bob Noseworthy=09
Email ren@iol.unh.edu
Phone 1 603 862 4342
Fax 1 603 862 1915
Co. UNH InterOperability Lab

CI 37 **SC** 37.5.3.2.2, **P** 37.28 **L** 30, 41

Comment Type E **Comment Status** R
 TX2 and RX1 Subclause references are incorrect

SuggestedRemedy

change TX2 reference from 37.2.3.1 to 37.2.3
 change RX1 reference from 36.2.5.2.1 to 36.2.5.2.2

Proposed Response **Response Status** C

Response generated by IEEE P802.3z PCS Sub-Task Force and accepted by motion by P802.3z Task Force on July 9,1997 in Maui, HI. IEEE P802.3z PCS Sub-Task Force allotted comment resolution time expired prior to the resolution of this comment. This comment will be re-submitted as a P802.3z Working Group ballot comment by the P802.3z PCS Sub-Task Force editor, Rich Taborek.

Comment ID 57 **Topic**
Name Bob Noseworthy=09
Email ren@iol.unh.edu
Phone 1 603 862 4342
Fax 1 603 862 1915
Co. UNH InterOperability Lab

CI 37 **SC** 37.5.3.2.5 **P** 37.29 **L** 32, 33

Comment Type E **Comment Status** R
 Clarify Feature name for NP6 "Unformatted Page Ordering"

SuggestedRemedy

Rename NP6 "Message Code Referencing Unformatted pages"

Proposed Response **Response Status** C

Response generated by IEEE P802.3z PCS Sub-Task Force and accepted by motion by P802.3z Task Force on July 9,1997 in Maui, HI. IEEE P802.3z PCS Sub-Task Force allotted comment resolution time expired prior to the resolution of this comment. This comment will be re-submitted as a P802.3z Working Group ballot comment by the P802.3z PCS Sub-Task Force editor, Rich Taborek.